



## Comparative Analysis of 7th Grade Afghanistan History Book with 8th Grade Turkish Revolution History and Kemalism Textbook

7. Sınıf Afganistan Tarih Kitabı ile 8. Sınıf Türkiye Cumhuriyeti İnkılap Tarihi ve Atatürkçülük Ders Kitabının Karşılaştırmalı Analizi

Büşra ELÇİÇEĞİ\*

### Özet

*Bir devletin geleceğine yön veren ve mensup olduğu milletin varlık bilincini güçlendiren en temel yapı eğitimidir. Bunun uygulama alanı okullarda okutulan ders kitaplarının içerikleri, program yapısı, benimsenen eğitim felsefeleri devletlerin politikasına göre şekillenmektedir. Bu nedenle ders kitapları devletlerin tutumları hakkında bilgi veren önemli kaynaklardır. Bu çalışmada Afganistan'da 7. Sınıf; Türkiye'de 8. Sınıf düzeyinde öğretimi gerçekleştirilen ders kitapları incelenmiştir. Bu amaçla 7. Sınıf Afganistan tarih kitabı ile ve 8. Sınıf Türkiye Cumhuriyeti İnkılap tarihi ve Atatürkçülük ders kitapları içerikleri, ünite yapısı, eğitim durumları açısından karşılaştırılmıştır. Araştırma nitel araştırma deseninde tasarlanmış olup doküman analizi tekniği kullanılarak içerik analizi ve betimsel analiz yapılmıştır. Her iki ülkede de 2018 yılından itibaren geçerli olan ders kitapları incelenmiştir. Bu kapsamda ders kitaplarında Türkiye'de 7; Afganistan'da 4 ünite bulunmakta olup içerikleri genişleyen çevre yaklaşımı doğrultusunda hazırlanmıştır. Ders kitapları ulusal marşla başlamaktadır. Öğretim yöntemlerinde çoğunlukla dinleme becerisine hitap eden tanımlama, açıklama yöntemi ile birlikte soru-cevap, grup tartışması teknikleri de kullanılmaktadır.*

**Anahtar kelimeler:** Tarih, tarih eğitimi, tarih ders kitapları, Türkiye, Afganistan, karşılaştırmalı eğitim.

### Abstract

*Education is the most basic structure that shapes the future of a state and strengthens the existence awareness of the nation to which it belongs. The application area of this is shaped according to the content of the textbooks, the structure of the program the philosophies of education adopted and the policy of the states. For this reason, textbooks are important sources that provide information about the attitudes of states. In this study, the textbooks taught at*

\* Arş. Gör. Marmara University, busra.elcicegi@marmara.edu.tr, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-1346-8185.

*the 7th Grade in Afghanistan and the 8th grade level in Turkey were examined. For this purpose, the 7th grade Afghanistan history book and the 8th grade Turkish Republic Revolution history and Kemalism textbooks were compared in terms of their contents, unit structure and educational status. The research was designed in qualitative research design and content analysis and descriptive analysis was done by using document analysis technique. Textbooks that have been in effect since 2018 in both countries have been examined. In the textbooks, there are 4 units in Afghanistan and 7 units in Turkey and the contents are prepared in accordance with the expanding environmental approach. Teaching methods are mostly used in the definition, explanation method, question-answer and group discussion techniques that address listening skills.*

**Keywords:** History, history education, history textbooks, Turkey, Afghanistan, comparative education.

Relations between Turkey and Afghanistan, which have geostrategic and geopolitical importance, are based on very old times. Afghanistan is the second country to recognize that Turkey is a national and independent country with giving importance of national unity. One of the first decisions made by Grand National Assembly of Turkey was to open a representative office in Kabul because of friendly relations, and Afghan descent Abdurrahman Samedan was selected as representative. Diplomatic relations between two countries began with Turkey-Afghanistan alliance agreement in 1921 (Republic of Turkey Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2016).

Turkey's Westernization movement greatly affected Afghanistan that lags in education from us despite Afghanistan gained independence before Turkey among Islamic countries. It underwent revision in every area especially in education, military, health sector by entering into effort modernization of institutions via aids continued by Republic of Turkey during the 1938-1945, especially between 1926-1929 and 1932-1938 (Akbaba, 2015, pp.5, 56, 65,114). Modernization work of education system by establishing close relations with Turkey especially during Amanullah Khan period started under the leadership of Mustafa Kemal (Rahimi, 2015, pp.75-76).

During the period between 1920-1960 years, Turkey was effective in modernization processes of Afghanistan. It has been influential in the country by supporting modernization of Afghanistan. In this period, Turkey sent teachers, doctors, specialists, and staff trained in various areas to Afghanistan. The relationship based on friendship and cooperation lasted until Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (USSR) took Afghanistan under its influence (Pohanyar, 2001, pp.49). Our relations have increasingly continued after Soviet occupation

ended in 1989, and Strategic Partnership and Friendship Agreement was signed in 2014 via the official visit of President Recep Tayyip Erdogan after 46 years. Afghan president Ashraf Ghani came to Turkey in 2015, and partnership agreements were made in various fields (TCDB, 2016).

Geographical, political, social and economic structure of a country directly or indirectly affects education system of that country. When both countries take this perspective; Turkey is a democratic, secular, social state of law. It is governed by presidential system and majority of people are Muslim. Official language is Turkish, and education is in Turkish (Güleçen, 2008, pp. 7-20). Afghanistan is an Islamic republic (Andishmand, 2010; Yezdani, 1994). Although it consists of different ethnic elements, most of its people are Muslim and governed by parliamentary system (Gubar, 1967, s. 11-14; Rasuly-Paleczek, 2010, s. 1-4). Although its official language is Pashtou and Darice, Uzbek-Turkmen is also spoken (The Constitution of Afghanistan, 2003, pp. 5; Ataie, 2015, pp.16; Bekmuradi, 2014, pp.14; Hayat, 2016, pp. 1, 17; Hajiyarali, 2011, pp. 2, 28, 42; Hasani, 2014, pp. 10). At the same time, especially in madrasas, education based on teaching Arabic, Persian, Ottoman and Turkish is provided (Robson, 2002, pp. 25-47). Even if political, social and economic conditions of the countries are different, each state aims to create a sense of belonging and maintain its existence by transferring its cultural, social and political values to new generations. Countries also shape their education and training programs for this purpose (Özyurt, 2014, pp. 31).

Social sciences play an active role in transferring political ideologies of countries to individuals through education, gaining awareness of citizenship and raising acceptable citizens. History, social studies, and history of revolution, which fall within the scope of social sciences, serve this purpose (Yılmaz, 2006, pp.23-26). One of the most important goals of history is the effort to build a national identity (Şivgin, 2009, pp. 35-38).

The purpose of Revolution History and Kemalism lesson trained in 8th grades is to tell establishment fight of Republic of Turkey and to gain a national consciousness by transferring philosophy underlying Atatürk's reforms and national-spiritual and universal values. During beginning pre-school education, students in Turkey start to learn subjects related to history of revolutions via certain days and weeks, national / religious holidays and via from other courses especially life science courses (MEB, 2018).

The main purpose that Islamic Republic of Afghanistan expects from education is to raise young people as a real person, a real Muslim and a real Afghan when they take the first step to life after graduation. Inevitability of

creating a national consciousness lies behind the idea of raising citizens as a real Afghan, which is expressed as the main aim of education (Wazarati Maarif, 2003, pp. 3).

In order to protect its assets, to ensure peace and security in its geography and to analyze dynamics of development well in Asia, Republic of Turkey should get reliable data and develop policy in this direction by being informed what has happened in the region. Conducting comparative education analyzes between countries is important for ensuring international tolerance and cooperation. At the same time, comparative research will meet the need for large-scale documents by providing resources for continuous program development research (Demirel, 2006, pp. 6-11) caused by rapid developments in science, technology and communication in the globalizing world.

The purpose of this study to compare Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism textbook with Afghanistan History textbook, which were taught in second grade of primary education in 2017-2018 academic year. For this purpose, answers to following questions were sought:

1. What are units and topics located in content of Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism textbooks and Afghanistan History textbooks?
2. What are similarities or differences between the order of the content of Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism textbooks and Afghanistan History textbooks?
3. Which outstanding skills and values took place in Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism textbooks and Afghanistan History textbooks?
4. What are the similarities and differences between methods used in the presentation of Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism textbooks and Afghanistan History textbooks?

#### **Restrictions**

This study is limited with Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism textbook that is taught in 8<sup>th</sup> grade in Turkey and History textbooks that are taught 8<sup>th</sup> grade in Afghanistan, which were carried education out in second grade in both countries in 2018 academic year, and books, theses, and articles specified in their references.

### **Literature Review**

There are a limited number of research for comparative analysis ON Afghanistan education system and textbooks of different countries in Turkey. As examples of research efforts in Turkey to Afghanistan; Güleçen's (2008), "A comparative study of Turkey's and Afghanistan's educational systems"; Hajiyarali's (2011), "Ethnic structure of Afghanistan and the problem of identity"; Bekmuradi's (2014), "Contributions of political parties to democratic system in Afghanistan after 2001"; Hasani's (2014), "A contrast between global human rights and the basic rights of the Afghan Constitution"; Ataie's (2015), "Intervention in Afghanistan and new state order"; Akbaba's (2015), "Contributions of Republic of Turkey to Afghanistan in the field of education (1932-1938)"; Rahimi's (2015), "Experience of modernization for Turkey and Afghanistan a comparative analysis of turnover Mustafa Kemal Atatürk and Amanullah Khan"; Hayat (2016), "Management and Democracy in Afghanistan"; Yahya (2016), "Historical, Political, Economic and Social Foundations of Quality Program in Afghanistan Education System"; Rauf's (2016), "The Effects of the USA on Social and Political Life in Afghanistan After 2001"; The works of Rahimi (2017), "Arbitration in Afghanistan and Turkish Law" and Sakhizada's (2017) "Federal System in Afghanistan" can be given. Studies are mainly master thesis. These conducted studies were generally carried out in the Department of History in Gazi University. Most of the work done is on ethnic structure, the adventure of democracy, human rights, political, economic, social structure and legal systems. Educational studies, especially comparative education research, are very limited. In the selection of the research topic, the studies on the education systems and textbooks of different countries were not at a sufficient level and there was no special study for the comparative analysis of history books. Therefore, the subject of the Republic of Turkey and Afghanistan in the history books of history textbooks research Revolution has been identified as a comparative analysis. In this study; Afghanistan, a Central Asian country that has witnessed and continues to be the scene of the power show of great civilizations such as Mongolian, Turkish, Scythian, Hun, Iran, China, India and the USA, and has an important geo-strategic and geopolitical position in Central Asia, the Middle East and its geography. Textbooks of the Republic of Turkey were comparatively investigated.

### **Method**

In this study, Turkey and Afghanistan textbooks were analyzed in terms of content, unit structure and education status as comparative. Document review technique was used in the study designed in a qualitative research design. This technique includes analysis of written materials that contain information about

phenomenon or facts intended to be studied (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2016, pp.189-194). It was effective to provide richness in data collection in order to reach official or private data, and to be preferred for systematic examination and evaluation of the data, use of document review technique (Ekiz, 2013).

Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism textbook from documents relating to research was accessed from Ministry of Education website, and Afghanistan history textbooks were accessed through an Uzbek originated Afghan citizen. Following determination of originality of documents, Afghanistan textbook was translated from Persian into Turkish. Unit structure was evaluated comparatively with content analysis and descriptive analysis method in terms of the order of contents and educational status in accordance with determined categories (Büyüköztürk, 2012). Descriptive analysis method was preferred since it allows obtained data to be summarized and evaluated in line with previously determined themes (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2016, pp.239-241). 8th grade textbooks in Turkey and 7th grade textbooks in Afghanistan, which are carried education out in second grade in both countries, were discussed to be made a comparison. Findings, results and suggestions were written based on the data analyzed at the last stage.

### **Findings**

Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism textbook and Afghanistan history textbook, which are carried education out in second grade of primary education in both countries, was prepared and published by Ministry of Education. Both books consist of one volume. Contents in Turkey, and index section in Afghanistan are located. Revolution history textbook consists of 212 pages in Turkey, while Afghanistan history textbook consists of 88 pages. Turkey textbook is about two and a half times bigger in size than Afghanistan history textbook in terms of physical aspects. While Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism 8th textbook starts with National Anthem and Atatürk's Address to the Turkish Youth, Afghanistan history 7th textbook starts with Afghan National Anthem and message of minister of education to young people, teachers and families. In the content of this message, it is emphasized protection of Islamic education and national identity, compliance with modern scientific principles and educational methods, developing students' abilities in ethics and science, gaining power of thinking and initiative, strengthening students' sense of research, developing a culture of dialogue and tolerance, patriotism, courtesy, forgiveness and equipping with solidarity values. Cooperation with families is given importance for doing these and it is stated that textbooks without a good teacher cannot reach the desired goals.

### Findings Related to First Research Question

Units and topics located in Turkey and Afghanistan textbook are as shown in Table 1.

**Table 1.** Unit and Subjects Field Place in Turkey and Afghanistan Textbooks.

Turkey	Afghanistan
Unit 1. A hero is being born	Chapter 1. The Origins of History
1.1. Awakened Europe and the Shaking Ottoman	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What Do You Know About History Science?</li> </ul>
1.1.1. Europe Awakening	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What are the Benefits of History?</li> </ul>
1.1.2. Shaking Ottoman	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What are the Sources of Historians?</li> </ul>
1.2. Blue Eyed Child: Mustafa	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Do You Know About Time Transformation in History?</li> </ul>
1.3. Depressions Give Great Heroes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What do you know about the years and its transformation?</li> </ul>
1.4. Step by Step to Leadership	
1.4.1. Mustafa Kemal On The Job	
1.4.2. The War of Tripoli: The Garp Quarries are Extinguished	
1.4.3. Balkan Wars: The Story of a Disaster Quantification and consideration	
Unit 2. National Awakening: Steps on the Way to Independence	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Chapter 2. Early Civilizations of Afghanistan</li> </ul>
2.1. Developments leading to the First World War	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Do You Know the Five Thousand Years of Afghanistan's Origin?</li> </ul>
2.2. The Last War of the Ottoman State: World War I	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Do You Know Arya Civilization?</li> </ul>
2.2.1. Reasons of the Ottoman Empire to entry to War	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What Do You Know About Vidi Civilization? -What do you know about the Ustayi civilization?</li> </ul>
2.2.2. Fronts where the Ottoman Empire fought	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What do you know about the ancient civilizations of Afghanistan (Pisdodian, Keyian)?</li> </ul>
2.2.2.1. Caucasian Front	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Afghanistan and Foreigners.</li> </ul>
2.2.2.2. Canal Front	
2.2.2.3. Çanakkale Front	
2.2.2.4. Hijaz-Yemen Front	
2.2.2.5. Iraqi Front	

- 2.2.2.6. Syrian Front
  - 2.2.3. The Armenian Question
  - 2.2.4. The End of World War I
  - 2.3. Anatolia during the Occupation Years
  - 2.4. Communities and Kuvây-ı Millîye
    - 2.4.1. National Societies
    - 2.4.2. Communities Established by Minorities
    - 2.4.3. National Entities Enemies
    - 2.4.4. Army of the Nation: Kuvây-ı Millîye
    - 2.5. Journey of independence
      - 2.5.1. Mustafa Kemal in Samsun
      - 2.5.2. National Awareness Awakening: Basin/Havza Circular
      - 2.5.3. A Revolution Statement: Amasya Circular
      - 2.5.4. Independence Torch: Erzurum Congress
      - 2.5.5. Voice of National Will: Sivas Congress
      - 2.5.6. Victory of the Representative Committee: Amasya Meetings
      - 2.5.7. Voice of the National Struggle: İrade-i Milliye Newspaper
    - 2.6. Oath of a Nation: National Pact (Misak-ı Milli)
      - 2.6.1. The Heart Of The National Struggle Ankara
      - 2.6.2. National Pact (Misak-ı Milli) Decisions
- Establishment of Independent Greek and Bahcerian Governments.
  - Artistic-Cultural Remains of the Greek and Bahter Period.
  - Do you know anything about the lineage of Kushaniyan?
  - What Do You Know About the Important Centers of the Kushaniyan Empire? (Badran, Hede, Bamyān)
  - What do you know about the people of Yeftel?
-



2.6.3. Occupation of Istanbul and Distribution of the Mebusan Assembly

2.6.4. Opening of the Grand National Assembly 2.7. Riots Against the Grand National Assembly

2.8. An Invalid Treaty: Treaty of Sèvres

Quantification and consideration

Unit 3. A National Epic Or Independence Or Death

3.1. East and South Fronts

3.1.1. The First Victory Annunciation: The Eastern Front

3.1.2. National Resistance in the South of Anatolia

3.1.2.1. Heroes of Maras

3.1.2.2. Glorious Valens of Urfa

3.1.2.3. Veterans of Antep

3.2. Western Front

3.2.1. From Kuvây-ı Millîye to Regular Army 3.2.2. I. İnönü War

3.2.3. Developments After the War of I.İNÖNÜ

3.2.3.1. Teşkilat-ı Esasiye law

3.2.3.2. Independence and the anthem of the future: National Anthem

3.2.3.3. London Conference

3.2.3.4. Turkey-Afghan Friendship and Cooperation Treaty

3.2.3.5. Treaty of Moscow

3.2.4. Bad fate is changing: II.İNÖNÜ War

Chapter 3. Civilizations of the Old World

- Let's learn something about Egyptian Civilization.
- Let's meet the oldest Beynun's (Beynun'nehreyn) civilization.
- What do you know about the ancient Persian civilization?
- Let's Meet Old Indian Civilization.
- Do you know anything about ancient Chinese civilization?
- Let's get to know the ancient Greek civilization.
- Have you ever heard that the Roman Empire is the oldest civilization in Europe?

3.2.5. War of Kütahya- Eskişehir

3.3. Education Congress

3.4. National Struggle, National Mobilization: Tekâlif-i Millîye (National)

3.5. From Resistance to Resurrection: From Sakarya to the Great Offensive

3.5.1. Sakarya Square War

3.5.2. Developments After the War of Sakarya Square

3.5.3. War of the Great Attack and the Commander-in-Chief Square

3.5.4. Mudanya Armistice Treaty

3.6. Turkey's Land Registry Act: The Treaty of Lausanne

3.7. National Struggle in Art and Literary Works

Quantification and consideration

Unit 4. Kemalism and modernization of Turkey

4.1. Ataturk's Principles.

4.1.1. Republicanism

4.1.2. Nationalism

4.1.3. Populism

4.1.4. Statism

4.1.5. Secularism

4.1.6. Revolution

4.2. Political Developments

4.2.1. Abolition of the Sultanate

4.2.2. Announcement of Ankara as Capital

Chapter 4. Islamic History

- Did you know? How was Pre-Islamic status of Saudi Arabia?
- Let's learn about the experience of our Prophet Muhammed Mustafa (S.A.V).
- Do You Know About the Beginning and Conquests of Islam?
- What Do You Know About Hazrat Abu Bakr Caliphate?
- What Do You Know About Hazrat Umar Faruk Caliphate?

4.2.3. The proclamation of the republic

4.2.4. Abolition of the caliphate

4.2.5. Acceptance of the 1924 Constitution

4.3. Developments in Law

4.3.1. The End confusion in the Legal System

4.3.2. Acceptance of the Civil Code

4.4. Developments in Education and Culture

4.4.1. Tevhid-i Tedrisat Law

4.4.2. Letter Revolution and National Schools

4.4.3. Turkish history foundation

4.4.4. Turkish Language foundation

4.4.5. University Reform

4.4.6. Developments in Fine Arts and Sports

4.5. Developments in the Social Field

4.5.1. Hat Law and Change in Clothing

4.5.2. Close down of the dervish, lodges and shrines

4.5.3. Change in Calendar, Time and Measurements

4.5.4. The Surname Law

4.5.5. Modern Turkish Woman

4.6. Developments in Economy

4.6.1. İzmir Economic Congress and National Production Campaign

- Do you have any information about what happened during the time of the Hazrat Osman Caliphate?

- How was the caliphate period of Hazrat Ali?

- What Do You Know About the Beginning of the Umayyad Caliphate?

- How did the Umayyad Caliphate be fall/demolished?

- How Did Power Transfer From Umayyads to Abbasids Realize?

- How did the Abbasid Caliphate Fall/demolished?

4.6.2. Studies in the Field of  
Agriculture

4.6.3. Studies in Industry and  
Trade

4.6.4. Studies in the Maritime  
Area

4.7. Developments in Health

4.8. Forever republic

4.8.1. Witness of an era: speech

4.8.2. Tenth Year Speech

4.8.3. Atatürk's Speech to Youth

4.8.4. Republican Youth Trust

4.9. Basic Principles of Ataturk's  
Principles and Revolutions

Quantification and  
consideration

Unit 5. Democratization Efforts

5.1. Steps Toward  
Democratization

5.1.1. Strong Democracy, Strong  
State

5.1.2. Republican People's Party

5.1.3. Terakkiver Republican  
Party

5.1.4. Free Republican Party

5.2. Assassination Attempt to  
Mustafa Kemal

5.3. Threats to the Republic of  
Turkey

Quantification and  
consideration

Unit 6. Turkish Foreign Policy in  
the Atatürk Period

6.1. Basic Principles of Turkish  
Foreign Policy

---

6.2. Developments in Foreign Policy

6.2.1. Foreign Schools Problem

6.2.2. Foreign Debt Problem

6.2.3. Mosul Problem

6.2.4. Population Exchange Problem

6.2.5. Montreux Straits Convention

6.2.6. Turkey's participation in the League of Nations

6.2.7. Balkan Antant

6.2.8. Sadabat Pact

6.3 The Final Victory of the Misak-i nation: Hatay

Quantification and consideration

Unit 7. The Death of Ataturk And After

7.1. Death and Echoes of Atatürk

7.1.1. Death of Atatürk

7.1.2. Echoes of Atatürk's Death in Turkey

7.1.3. Echoes of Atatürk's Death Abroad

7.1.4. Election of İsmet İnönü as President

7.2. Lives With Human Works

7.3. The World Shaken Again

7.3.1. Footsteps of a New War

7.3.2. Entering the State of War Winners: Turkey

7.3.3. The End of II. World War

---

7.4. Effects of II. World War I in  
Turkey

7.5. Strong Steps Towards  
Democracy  
Quantification and  
consideration

---

**Kaynak:** Table 1, It was created using the data of the textbook on the history of the revolution of the Republic of Turkey and the history of Afghanistan.

When table 1 is examined; there are 7 units in Turkey; 4 units in Afghanistan. From 7 units in Turkey textbook, units are divided as 1. unit to 4 subjects/9 lessons; 2. unit to 8 subjects/33 lessons; 3. unit to 7 subjects/ 26 lessons; 4. unit to 9 subjects/41 lessons; 5. unit to 3 subjects/7 lessons; 6. unit to 8 subjects/11 lessons; 7. unit to 5 subjects/12 lessons. Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism course has a total of 44 subjects and 139 sub-section of this issue. 4 units in Afghanistan history textbook are divided into 35 lessons. There are 224 images on 212 pages in Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism textbook and 220 of these images are directly related to the units. Afghanistan history textbook contains 57 images on 88 pages. There is measurement and evaluation section at the end of each unit, and project tasks, answer key, commander of national struggle, glossary, chronology, bibliography, Turkey map, a map of the Turkish world at the end in Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism textbook. These sections are not included in Afghanistan history textbook, and there is a section at the end of the book that lists goals expected to be achieved by students who passed as 7th grade requirements. In addition, at the end of each lesson, homework is given to students to be present in next lesson, and students are asked to divide into groups and give presentations and discussions. However, students are not subjected to a measurement and evaluation related to this.

Faltering of Ottoman Empire in the face of growing Europe under the name of a Hero born, "Mustafa Kemal's exit the stage of history", and "Tripoli and Balkan wars" are described in first unite in Turkey. Under the title of "National awakening" in second unit: information about First World War fronts opened, "Armenian problem", invasion of Anatolia, "National Forces" (Kuvay-i milliye), "National and enemy societies", "Havza-Amasya circulars", "Erzurum-Sivas congresses", "Amasya meetings", "İrade-i millîye newspaper", "National Pact" (misak-ı milli), "Information on the occupation of Istanbul", opening of Assembly and Treaty of Sevres under the title of steps taken towards independence. In third unit named as "A National epic", "Independence or death", "Eastern and

southern fronts", "Resistances in Anatolia", "Western fronts", "Regular army", "Battle of İnönü", "Teşkilat-ı Esasiye Law", "National Anthem", "London conference", "Turkish-Afghan friendship and cooperation treaty", "Moscow treaty", "II. İnönü", "Kutahya-Eskisehir battles", "Maârif (education) congress", "National Tasks" (Tekalif-i Milliye), "Sakarya", "Great Assault", "Mudanya-Lausanne treaty", and National struggle in works of art and literature subjects are studied. Under the name of "Kemalism and Turkey" becoming modernized in fourth unit, "Principles of Atatürk", "Abolition of sultanate and caliphate", "Making Ankara the capital city", "Declaration of the republic", "Adoption of civil law", "The Law of Unification of Education" (Tevhid-i Tedrisat), "Letter reform", "Turkish Language Society" (TDK), "Turkish Historical Society" (TTK), "University reform", "Hat-surname law", "Closure of lodges", "Developments in the field of economy and health", "Speech", "Tenth year anthem", "Addressing youth", and basic principles of Atatürk's principles and reforms are described. Under the name of "Democratization efforts" in fifth unit, "Information about Republican People's Party", "Progressive Republican Party", "Free Republican Party", "Threats to Mustafa Kemal and assassinations against Turkey" are given. In sixth unit named as "Turkish foreign policy in Atatürk period", "Basic principles of Turkish foreign policy", "Developments in foreign policy", "Foreign schools issue", "External debt problem", "Mosul problem", "Exchange of population issues", "Montreux Convention Regarding the Regime of the Straits", "Turkey's join to nations league", "Balkan Pact", "Sa'dabad pact" and "Participation of Hatay, which Atatürk regarded as a personal issue and accepted as a 40-century Turkish homeland", as the last victory of "National Pact" (Misak-ı Millî) are described.

In Afghanistan history textbook, subjects related to "Origins of history", "Students' knowledge about history science", "Benefits of knowing history", "Sources used by historians", "Historical time transformation" in first chapter; "Afghanistan's early civilizations", "Afghanistan's five-thousand-year history", "Arya, Vidi, Ustayi civilizations", "Afghanistan's ancient civilizations" (Pisdodian, Keynian), "Afghanistan and foreigners", "Establishment of independent Greek and Bahrainian governments", "Artistic and cultural ruins of Greek and Bahrati era", "Kushanians and important centers" (Badran, Hede, Bamyan), and "Yefteliler" in second chapter; "World civilizations", "Egypt", "Beynun'nehreyn", "Iran", "Indian", "Greek civilizations", "Roman Empire" in third chapter; "History of Islam", "Pre-Islamic status of Saudi Arabia", "The life of our Prophet Muhammed Mustafa" (P.B.U.H), "Beginning and conquests of Islam", "Hz. Abu Bakr", "Hz. Omar", "Hz. Osman", "Hz. Ali", "Umayyad and Abbasid caliphs and their destruction" are described. There are expressions in the books such as

"What do you know?", "let's meet", etc. to arouse students' curiosity. In addition, it was observed that the verb "falling" in the issues of how Umayyad and Abbasid caliphate dropped was used to mean to descend / be destroyed in Afghanistan.

Among the goals expected from students in 7th grade in Afghanistan, students are expected to have learned concepts such as "Fire Temple" (Zoroastrian Temple where fire is burned for worship), "Mythology" (oral tradition and stories), "Alexandria" (Greek base, a military base built by Alexander the Great), "Innovations", Asylum in the presence of Great God, Ensar (helper), "Buddhist" (Budha followers are in the process of being Buddhist), "Jeyhun: Amu Derya", "Jamal: Camel", "Hajj / El-Veda" (the last pilgrimage of Muhammed Mustafa), "Epic", "Prehistoric", "System": (Headlines, arrangement, folk celebrations of Aryan people in ancient times Like Nawruz celebration), "Seyhoun" (Sea voyage), "Indian" "Ivory", "Ghaz'ul" (war), "Inscription", "Coins", "Hajj", "Unity", "Vidi" (in terms of wisdom and intelligence), "Aryan poems".

#### **Findings Related to Second Research Question**

In both countries, lessons were designed from known to unknown, concrete to abstract and close to far principles, taking into account chronological order. Information about situation of Ottoman Empire against Europe, wars made, occupation of the country, resistance, Mustafa Kemal Atatürk's rise to stage of history as a leader, Havza-Amasya Circulars, Erzurum-Sivas Congresses, decisions taken are given in Turkey. It is mentioned about Turkey's establishment and proclamation of the republic, Atatürk's principles and revolutions, changes made in the field of political, social, legal, educational, health, established parties, joining Hatay to motherland, Mustafa Kemal's death, presidential election of Ismet Inonu's, and II. World war. In Afghanistan, the book starts with definition and sources of history and students' prior knowledge is examined. After teaching about transformation of time and history, early civilizations of Afghanistan, history of five centuries, its cultural structure and prominent personalities, information is given about ancient world civilizations of Egypt, Indian, Roman and Greek civilizations. In the last unit, topics related to Arabian Peninsula, birth of Islam, its spread, 4 caliphs, Umayyad and Abbasid periods are covered. First, local, then world history, and last Islamic history are described.

#### **Findings Related to Third Research Question**

"Root values" located in curriculum of Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism course was determined as integrated with other courses. These



values are justice, friendship, honesty, self-control, patience, respect, love, responsibility, patriotism, helpfulness. Although there is no section in Afghanistan history curriculum under the title of values, when contents of the textbook are analyzed, values of friendship, honesty, solidarity, sacrifice, kindness, forgiveness, brotherhood, unity, solidarity, patience, respect, love, patriotism, hospitality and helpfulness are preliminary appear to be in the plan.

Although there is no explanation about skills to be acquired in programs of relevant courses of two countries, it was observed that textbooks are designed for developing especially research examination, perception of space, perception of time-change and continuity, historical empathy, communication, collaboration, using evidence, reading maps, critical thinking, discussion skills.

#### **Findings Related to Fourth Research Question**

In the direction of definition, explanation-based presentation method, question-answer method, research-examination method, given subject to students, grouping, presentation and discussion techniques are used. Especially in Afghanistan, there are explanations regarding use of collaborative education and discussion method by dividing students into double and triple groups in teaching history subjects. While doing so, students collect evidence and receive opinions from knowledgeable people in their close circle. There are explanations for their involvement in activities such as collecting stories related to subject, interviewing elderly.

#### **Result, Discussion and Suggestions**

Studies of Comparing Analysis Perception of Citizenship In Turkey's and Egypt's Social Studies Textbook and A Comparative Study: Egypt's and Turkey's Seventh Grade Social Studies Curriculum by Osmanoğlu (2015), *A comparative study of Turkey's and Afghanistan's educational systems* by Güleçen (2008), *Experience of modernization in Turkey and Afghanistan a comparative analysis of turnover Mustafa Kemal Atatürk and Amanullah Khan* by Rahimi (2015), Citizenship education in civics textbooks in the Japanese Junior high school curriculum by Morl&Davies (2015), Turks in Indonesia high school history books Malaysia by Tekin (2019), Turks in secondary and high school history books in India by Yürük (2019) are examples of comparative education in the fields of history, social studies, curriculum, textbook, and citizenship perceptions. Increase in the number of this type of research enables us to learn about national and universal human type that countries want to train in line with educational philosophy and policy they adopt. In the field of education, studies on education of different countries are important in a globalized world in terms

of being source regarding success differences between countries, their reasons and studies to increase quality of existing education system.

Alpargu (2007), in his study titled "Some observations on Turkey and Azerbaijan History textbooks", suggested that Turkey-Azerbaijan relations should be included more in the textbooks of both countries in line with the examples given from the textbooks of the two countries, and that the brotherhood aids they made to each other should be included more in the textbooks. Taking into account that the project of writing a common Turkish history, which was expressed in the Turkish World Studies Congress convened in 1994 under the leadership of the Turkish Historical Society, did not yield clear results, the determination of a common philosophy under the education framework of the independent Turkish States with the same ethnicity and the same language in the same geography will contribute to the consolidation of the concept of "one nation".

In the study of Aktaş (2019), in which he examined the Azerbaijan history textbooks, it was found that the important elements in history education such as statistics, cartoons and films were not sufficiently utilized in the textbooks and historical thinking skills are not used much. He concluded that techniques such as using primary sources and questioning the source were not used, and the sources used were few. It can be said that film, caricature and historical thinking skills are not used in Afghanistan history books. However, in the light of the information we obtained from the Afghanistan history book, it can be stated that it is important to reach primary sources and collect information from these sources. Aktaş concluded that in Azerbaijan history textbooks, case studies, poetry, preparation questions are used before the unit, and evaluation questions are used after the unit, and that there is a history curriculum at the end of the textbooks. Similar findings were also encountered in the Afghanistan history textbook.

In Türk, Ilgaz and Bilgili's study titled The Ottoman Image in Azerbaijan History Textbooks, the perspective of the history textbooks used in Azerbaijan today on the Ottoman Empire and the development of historiography education textbooks in Azerbaijan were examined. It has been concluded that there are two positive (neighboring brothers, children of the same ancestor-mother, blood brothers) and negative (invading, enslaving, oppressing with heavy taxes, ignorant) perspectives towards the Ottoman state.

8th grade Republic of Turkey Revolution History and Kemalism course and 7th grade Afghanistan History course are taught in second grade of primary education in both countries. Turkey textbook consists of 212 pages, Afghanistan

textbook consists of 88 pages. There are 224 images in Revolution History and Kemalism course and 57 images in history textbook of Afghanistan. 7 units in Turkey are divided into 44 section/139 subsections, and 4 units in Afghanistan are divided into 35 lessons. The order of content is arranged in chronological order, from known to unknown, in line with expanding environmental approach in both countries. The textbooks starts with the national anthem. The fact that the history book of Afghanistan starts with the expression "bismillahirrahmanirrahim" shows that the country provides theological education. In both countries, it is essential to train a national Turkish / Afghan citizen regardless of their content and method.

Among common values expected to be gained in textbooks in both countries; justice, friendship, honesty, patience, respect, love, responsibility, patriotism, benevolence, solidarity, sacrifice, kindness, brotherhood, unity-solidarity, hospitality, research in skills, perception of space, perception of time-change and continuity, historical empathy, communication, collaboration, using evidence, map reading, critical thinking and discussion skills were observed.

There are explanations related to description, presentation way based on description, question-answer method, research and investigation method in handling of subjects in Turkey and Afghanistan textbooks. In this direction, there are expressions regarding use of collaborative teaching method by taking advantage of giving subjects to students, grouping, making presentations and discussion techniques. When students do this, it is suggested that they do activities outside classroom such as gathering evidence from knowledgeable people in their immediate surroundings, getting opinions, collecting stories about the topic, interviewing the elderly in collaboration with the environment. It was observed that new program design approaches were effective in establishing explanations based on constructivist approach in the direction of establishing a teacher accreditation board consisting of a team of 17 people in Afghanistan.

Development of applications that will enable students to learn while having fun can be encouraged in teaching of historical subjects.

Teaching-learning approaches can be developed that encourage students to use methods used by historians in education of subjects, where student plays as an active receiver from the position of passive receiver.

In particular, studies can be made to reduce content of textbooks in Turkey in order to improve quality rather than quantity.

Conducting field research and monographic studies on application of programs may be useful.

It is important for students, teachers and academicians to follow studies related to their fields in different countries in order to develop international tolerance and to improve quality of education.

---

**Disclosure Statement:** No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author.

**Funding:** The author received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

---

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- 📖 Akbaba, T. (2015). Contributions of Republic of Turkey to Afghanistan in the Field of Education (1932-1938). (Unpublished Master Thesis). İstanbul: İstanbul University/ Institute of Social Sciences.
- 📖 Andishmand, A. (2010). Why ISI İntervenenes in Afghanistan and How Can the İntervention be Stopped? Khorasan Zamin, 16 June.
- 📖 Aktaş, Ö. (2019). "Evaluation of the Textbooks of the Azerbaijan History". Iğdir University Journal Social Science, 19, 191-212.
- 📖 Alpargu, M. (2007). "Some Abservations about Turkey and Azerbaljan history course boks". Journal of Atatürk, 5 (3), 1 – 13.
- 📖 Ataie, N. (2015). Intervention in Afghanistan and New State Order. (Unpublished Master Thesis). Antalya: Akdeniz University/ Institute of Social Sciences.
- 📖 Bekmuradi, N. (2014) Contributions of Political Parties to Democratic System in Afghanistan After 2001. (Unpublished Master Thesis). Ankara: Gazi University/ Institute of Social Sciences.
- 📖 Büyüköztürk, Ş., Çakmak, E. K., Akgün, Ö. E., Karadeniz, Ş. ve Demirel, F. (2012). Scientific Research Methods. Ankara: Pegem.
- 📖 Demirel, Ö. (2006). The Learning Art. Ankara: Pegem A.
- 📖 Ekiz, D. (2013). Introduction to Research Methods and Methods in Education. Ankara: Anı.
- 📖 Erginer/ Özyurt, E. (2014). The Role of Turkish Republic Revolution History and Kemalism Lesson About Formation of Citizenship in Secondary

- Education. (Unpublished Master Thesis). Ankara: Gazi University/ Institute of Social Sciences.
- 📖 Güleçen, S. (2008). A Comparative Study of Turkey's and Afghanistan's Educational Systems. (Unpublished Master Thesis). Elazığ: Fırat University/ Institute of Social Sciences.
- 📖 Hajiyarali, F. (2011). Ethnic Structure of Afghanistan and the Problem of Identity. (Unpublished Master Thesis). Antalya: Akdeniz University/ Institute of Social Sciences.
- 📖 Hasani, R. (2014). A Contrast between Global Human Rights and the Basic Rights of the Afghan Constitution. (Unpublished Master Thesis). Ankara: Gazi University/ Institute of Social Sciences.
- 📖 Hayat, N. (2016). Governance and Democracy in Afghanistan. (Unpublished Master Thesis). Ankara: Gazi University.
- 📖 Gubar, G. M., (1967). Afghanistan of History (Afghanistan der Mesir-i Tarih II). Kabil.
- 📖 MEB, (2018). History of the Republic of Turkey and Atatürk Course Curriculum (Secondary School Grade 8). Ankara.
- 📖 Ministry of Education, (2007). National Education Strategic Plan for Afghanistan 1385-1389. Kabil.
- 📖 Ministry of Education (1396/2017). Afghanistan 7th Grade History Textbooks. Kabil.
- 📖 MOE, (2016). Third National Education Strategic Plan. [www.moe.gov.af](http://www.moe.gov.af).
- 📖 Morl, C., Davies, I. (2015). Citizenship Education in Civics Textbooks in the Japanese Junior High School Curriculum. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 35 (2), 153-175.
- 📖 Pejend, F. (2005). Geography History of Afghanistan. Kabil: Meyvend.
- 📖 Rahimi, M.R. (2015). Experience of Modernization in Turkey and Afghanistan a Comparative Analysis of Turnover Mustafa Kemal Atatürk and Amanullah Khan. (Unpublished Master Thesis). Kocaeli: Kocaeli University/ Institute of Social Sciences.
- 📖 Rahimi, R. (2017). Arbitration in Afghanistan and Turkish Law. (Unpublished Master Thesis). Kocaeli: Kocaeli University/ Institute of Social Sciences.
- 📖 Şıvgın, H. (2009). The Importance of National History Education in Identity Development. *Academic Perspective*, 2 (4), 35-52.

- 📖 Osmanoğlu, A.E., Yılmaz, A. (2015). A Comparative Study: Egypt's and Turkey's Seventh Grade Social Studies Curriculum. *International Periodical for the Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic* Volume, 10 (15), 697-730.
- 📖 Osmanoğlu A. E., Öztürk, C. (2015). Comparing Analysis Perception of Citizenship in Turkey's and Egypt's Social Studies Textbook. *Journal Education and Training Pegem*, 2 (3).
- 📖 Pohanyar, S.M. (2001). *Zuhur-i Meshrutiyat ve Qurbaniyani Estibdad. Peshawar: Maiwand.*
- 📖 Rasuly-Palczek G. (2010). *State Building Struggle in Afghanistan: Centralization, Nationalism and Unrest.* (Ed. Schendel W. ve Zürcher E. J., 2004). *Identity Politics in Central Asia and the Islamic World.* (2nd Edition). Istanbul: Communication.
- 📖 Robson, B. (2002). *The Afghans: Their History and Culture.* Culture Profile. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No: FL 801600).
- 📖 Şimşek, H. & Yıldırım, A. (2016). *Qualitative Research Methods in the Social Sciences.* Ankara: Seçkin.
- 📖 TCDB, (2016). Ministry of foreign affairs of the Republic of Turkey, [https://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkiye-afganistan\\_siyasi-iliskileri.tr.mfa](https://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkiye-afganistan_siyasi-iliskileri.tr.mfa). Accessed 10 July 2019.
- 📖 Türk, İ., Ilgaz, S. and Bilgili, A. (2004). "Ottoman Image in Azerbaijan History Textbooks". *Ataturk University Kazım Karabekir journal of the faculty of education*, 9, 429-444.
- 📖 Yılmaz, A. (2005). *The Social Status of Women and Religious Education in Afghanistan.* (Unpublished Master Thesis). Isparta: Süleyman Demirel University/Institute of Social Sciences.