OPUS►

RESEARCH ARTICLE

Comparing Product Advertising Videos: User Comments on Traditional Celebrities vs. Youtubers

Fatma Halide Kıvrak[1] I Ali Kıvrak[2]

[1] Research Assistant, Ibn Haldun University, Business School, İstanbul/Türkiye
ORCID: 0000-0002-1379-9347
E-Mail: halide.kivrak@ihu.edu.tr

[2] Research Assistant, Ibn Haldun University, Communication School, İstanbul/Türkiye
ORCID: 0000-0002-1251-6448
E-Mail: ali.kivrak@ihu.edu.tr

Corresponding Author:
Fatma Halide Kıvrak

Abstract

Businesses are modifying their strategies to respond to the constantly changing media environment. In the past, marketing teams relied on traditional celebrities to promote brands and boost sales. Recently, social media celebrities such as Instagrammers, Tiktokers, youtubers, and influencers have emerged as popular options for marketing communication due to their significant attention and preference. Despite considerable research on traditional and social media influencer endorsements, there remains a gap in understanding how social media users perceive and interact with these endorsements. This study investigates the differences in topic, sentiment, and pragmatics of user comments on Youtube advertisement videos showcasing traditional celebrities and youtubers. We examined user comments on eight advertisement videos using content analysis, with half featuring traditional celebrities and the other half featuring youtubers. The findings indicate that including traditional celebrities in videos leads to increased user focus on brand features, along with greater expressions of admiration and positive sentiment. Furthermore, traditional celebrities are more effective than influencers in fostering favourable and reliable brand awareness. Possible explanations for these results are considered, and their theoretical and practical implications are derived.

Keywords: *celebrity endorsements, social media influencer endorsements, user comments, social media marketing, YouTube ad videos*

Öz

İşletmeler, medya ortamındaki dinamik değişimlere yanıt olarak marka desteği uygulamalarını uyarlamaktadır. Geçmişte geleneksel ünlüler, marka farkındalığı yaratmak ve satışları artırmak için pazarlama ekiplerinin öne çıkan seçimiyken son yıllarda Instagrammer'lar, Tiktoker'lar, Youtuber'lar ve influencer'lar gibi sosyal medya ünlüleri büyük ilgi görmeye başlamış ve pazarlama iletişiminde aynı amaçla tercih edilmeye başlanmıştır. Hem geleneksel ünlü desteklerinin hem de sosyal medya fenomen desteklerinin etkisi kapsamlı bir şekilde incelenmiş olsa da sosyal medya kullanıcılarının bu destekleri nasıl algıladıkları ve bu desteklerle nasıl etkileşim kurdukları konusunda ek araştırmalara ihtiyaç duyulmaktadır. Bu çalışma, Youtube'da yayınlanan ve geleneksel ünlüler ile Youtuber'ların yer aldığı ürün reklam videolarına yönelik izleyici yorumlarındaki farklılıkları incelemektedir. Yarısında geleneksel ünlülerin, diğer yarısında ise Youtuber'ların yer aldığı sekiz reklam videosuna ilişkin kullanıcı yorumları içerik analizine tabi tutulmuştur. Sonuçlar, videolarda geleneksel ünlüler yer aldığında, izleyicilerin marka ayrıntılarına daha fazla dikkat ettiğini ve daha fazla övgü ve olumlu duygular ifade ettiğini göstermektedir. Ayrıca, geleneksel ünlülerin olumlu ve güvenilir marka tanınırlığını teşvik etme konusunda influencer'lardan daha fazla etkiye sahip olduğu görülmüştür. Bu sonuçlara ilişkin olası açıklamalar ele alınmış ve teorik ve pratik çıkarımlar yapılmıştır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: *ünlü onayları, sosyal medya influencer onayları, kullanıcı yorumları, sosyal medya pazarlaması, Youtube reklam videoları,*

Introduction

YouTube has evolved from a simple video-sharing platform into a widespread and influential presence today, going beyond just providing entertainment. With a massive 11.4 % share of global internet data traffic (Armstrong, 2023), Youtube ranks second only to the streaming giant Netflix. Additionally, it has an impressive user base of 2.3 billion active users. This digital platform profoundly influences various aspects of life, including education, commerce, and social interaction, becoming deeply integrated into the core of contemporary society (Zhou et al., 2020).

Youtube's immense size is a major factor in its widespread presence. Youtube serves as a continuous repository of audiovisual expression, with an additional sixty hours of new content uploaded every minute (Madhavika & Rathnayake, 2020). The substantial amount of content ensures a constant influx of new and diverse materials, attracting viewers and enticing them to repeatedly engage with the platform's captivating content. Unsurprisingly, this results in significant financial power. In the realm of social media advertising, YouTube holds the second-highest position in terms of popularity as of January 2023. Youtube experienced a 33% yearly growth rate and accounted for 29% of the total digital advertising market share in 2020. In a market where the annual digital advertising expenditure amounts to an astonishing $226 billion, Youtube alone draws in 74.8 billion monthly visitors and 5.8 billion distinct users. On average, users spend 36 minutes on the platform during each visit (Kemp, 2023).

In the ever-evolving field of advertising, the growing influence of digital and social media has compelled marketers to seek innovative communication methods to engage their target audiences efficiently. In the context of social media, influencer marketing has become a crucial element of firms' advertising strategies, acting as a catalyst for increased interaction between brands and consumers (Stubb et al., 2019). This approach utilises key opinion leaders, known as influencers, to forge connections between their followers and brands (Bi & Zhang, 2023), marking a departure

from traditional mass marketing techniques (Haapasalmi, 2017). To illustrate, marketers currently employ influencers to spread word-of-mouth (WOM) endorsements of their products on social media, underscoring the increasing importance of this marketing channel, especially through the strategic use of electronic word-of-mouth (e-WOM) (Liu et al., 2015).

The rise of social media has led to the emergence of a distinctive celebrity phenomenon referred to as 'micro-celebrities' or social media celebrities (Khamis et al., 2017). These individuals, such as youtubers and Instagrammers, build their reputations through active engagement with their social media followers (Schouten et al., 2020). Therefore, apart from relying on traditional celebrities like actors, supermodels, and athletes to amplify their brand awareness on social media, businesses are progressively leveraging social media influencers, such as vloggers and 'Instafamous' personalities, to promote and endorse their brands (Ahmed et al., 2015).

This has spurred numerous studies comparing the effectiveness of social media influencers and traditional celebrities in brand promotion (Djafarova & Trofimenko, 2019; Gräve, 2017; S. V. Jin et al., 2019; Nouri, 2018; Piehler et al., 2022; Schouten et al., 2020). However, within the context of social media marketing on YouTube, there is a notable gap in understanding the brand-related impact of online videos created by social media celebrities and traditional celebrities, particularly through user comments. Therefore, our study addresses this gap by focusing on two distinct categories of influencers within the popular social media platform, YouTube. These two categories are traditional celebrities and youtubers (as social media celebrities). By examining video comments from users on this social media platform, the research aims to understand whether youtubers' ad videos or traditional celebrities' ad videos differentiate from each other regarding the topics, pragmatics, and sentiments of the comments.

This study aims to examine the differences in user comments on advertising videos posted on YouTube which feature traditional celebrities and social media influencers. The opinions expressed in the user comments are evaluated across three

main categories: topic, pragmatics, and sentiment. The primary research question addressed in this study is as follows:

Research Question: What is the overall impact of celebrity endorsements versus online influencer endorsements on user comments' YouTube video ads?

Based on this main research question 3 sub-questions formulated:
1. What is the influence of the type of endorser on the topic discussed in the comments made by users?
2. What communication styles do users display in their comments based on the type of endorser?
3. How do endorser types influence the emotional aspects of user comments on advertising videos?

To answer these questions, we analysed comments from eight advertising videos featuring prominent brands (*Coca Cola, Magnum, Mavi, Oppo, Maybelline, Ruffles, Teknosa, and Lipton*). These videos were divided evenly between traditional celebrities and youtubers. Our assessment covered three main categories: topic, pragmatic aspects, and sentiment of the comments based on the coding scheme developed by Wendt et al. (2016).

This study enhances the field of digital advertising by conducting a comparative analysis of the effect of social media influencers and traditional celebrities on user engagement in YouTube videos. This study also addresses a knowledge gap by examining user comments on endorsement ad videos and providing data on how users perceive such ads. Moreover, the research contributes to the discussion on the comparative effectiveness of influencer and celebrity endorsements, a subject that marketing experts have extensively debated. We anticipate that the study's findings will aid marketing practitioners in crafting more effective marketing strategies.

2. Literature Review

2.1. The Comparison of Celebrity and Online Influencer Endorsements in Marketing Communications

Celebrity and online influencer endorsements have become essential elements of marketing communication strategies, exerting a substantial influence on consumer behaviour and brand perception. Extensive research has been conducted on the influence of celebrity endorsements on consumer buying behaviour, revealing that it can significantly affect consumers' attitudes, behaviour, and intentions to make a purchase.

Businesses have long engaged celebrities to endorse and promote their products or services for profit, and empirical evidence has demonstrated the high effectiveness of this approach in boosting market performance and elevating brand values (Erdogan, 1999). In addition to this, the concept of influencer marketing initially stemmed from celebrity endorsements, leveraging the recognition gained by traditional celebrities due to their professional talents (Schouten et al., 2020). Tam's (2020) study investigates how opinion leaders on social media influence marketing. The results show that, especially when they communicate effectively, offer insightful information, and are modelled by their audience, influencers are seen as opinion leaders. These influencers indicate their major influence on consumer behaviour and preferences, so guiding modern marketing plans. The study emphasises how social media influencers help to promote brands and consumer involvement by their perceived authority and trustworthiness in particular sectors, so stressing the need of including both influencers and their audiences into public relations and marketing campaigns. This corresponds with theoretical viewpoints on the impact of opinion leaders in shaping public opinion and behaviour of the users inside social networks.

Brands employ influencer marketing, a deliberate strategy, to promote their products by partnering with influential individuals who have influence over their followers (Stubb et al., 2019). Social media influencers, ordinary individuals

who have transformed into online celebrities or micro-celebrities through content creation, typically specialise in specific niches like cosmetics, healthy living, travel, or fashion (Lou & Yuan, 2019). The most prevalent influencers fall into four categories: celebrities, industry experts and thought leaders, bloggers and content creators, and micro-influencers (Geyser, 2024). Industry experts and opinion leaders are individuals respected by the public for their expertise, position, or competence in a specific field. Professional roles such as journalists, industry experts, academicians, or professional advisors often engender this respect (Geyser, 2024). Bloggers and content creators, essential components of both influencer marketing and public relations activities, have played a significant role over the past few decades. Bloggers contribute to online community content, considered a form of online PR, as studies have found that networks of bloggers and youtubers constitute communities (Gannon & Prothero, 2018). Additionally, content creation extends to video, with youtubers creating channels on Youtube, offering an attractive platform for companies as their popularity grows.

Marketers view blogging as a contemporary form of digital word-of-mouth. For instance, blog users' trust in bloggers' recommendations has a significant and influential impact on their attitudes and intentions towards online shopping (Hsu et al., 2013). Micro-influencers are regular individuals recognised for their expertise in specific niche areas, holding substantial influence within their social media communities. Companies often need to proactively approach micro-influencers, as these influencers may not be aware of a company's existence until contacted for product promotion (Geyser, 2024).

In recent years, the popularity of social media influencers has experienced significant growth, leading to the widespread integration of influencer marketing into corporate strategies (Vrontis et al., 2021). Carcavilla & Aguirre (2022) assert that influencer personalities have gained popularity alongside mass media, revolutionising marketing communications. Their study concludes that, unlike its competitors, Gucci's communication strategy focuses on enhancing product awareness

and positioning the brand as a trend-setter and influencer. Furthermore, Lou and Yuan (2019) investigated how influencers' trustworthiness, attractiveness, and knowledge influence followers' trust in branded posts. Their findings suggest that these attributes not only influence brand awareness but also play a role in shaping purchase intentions.

Companies' increasing investment in influencers for brand and product promotion has not only impacted marketing strategies but has also become a subject of study in consumer research literature. Some studies suggest that consumers perceive influencers as more trustworthy than traditional celebrities in advertisements (Campbell & Kirmani, 2000).

According to Jin et al. (2019), consumers perceive Instagram celebrities' brand posts as more credible, evoking a more positive attitude compared to traditional celebrities' advertisements. A Twitter study by Swant (2016) reveals that consumers trust social media influencers as much as they trust their friends.

De Veirman et al. (2017) emphasised the importance of follower count, indicating that influencers with high follower numbers are perceived as more sympathetic. In another study, Veirman (2019) investigates the persuasive power of online influencers on children, underscoring their progression as a new source in advertising.

In a recent study, Hess et al. (2022) revealed how important relationships with consumers are for the new generation of social media influencers compared to traditional celebrities. Childers et al. (2019) explored the experiences of advertising professionals regarding influencer marketing, highlighting its significance as a thriving industry that demands strategic decision-making.

Supporting these ideas, Breves et al. (2019) demonstrated that the compatibility between an influencer and a brand positively impacts both the influencer's image and the effectiveness of advertising.

In terms of e-commerce, Bylock and Lidberg (2018) examined the motivations for using influencer marketing to establish brand awareness internationally. Their findings underscore the practical implication that a comprehension of

influencer marketing facilitates word-of-mouth promotion and contributes to enhanced brand awareness. Booth and Matic (2011) provided valuable insights into how influencers impact traditional target audiences, guiding professionals to refine their strategies through collaboration. The integration of influencer index data into a comprehensive social media strategy presents an all-encompassing approach to optimising brand equity.

Fan (2020) conducted a study comparing traditional celebrity endorsements by interviewing consumers and discovered results that oppose the prevailing literature. In this qualitative study, interviewees showed a predominantly unfavourable disposition towards online do-it-yourself (DIY) celebrities and their promotional endeavours. In contrast, interviewees perceived traditional celebrity endorsers as more favourable and influential in their endorsement roles, resulting in a positive perception and effectiveness. Fan (2020, p. 179) suggests that cultural differences could explain the results, which contradict the existing literature.

When analysing how cultural differences affect the endorsement strategies of traditional celebrities and online influencers, it is important to recognise that cultural contexts play a significant role in shaping how audiences perceive and value these endorsements (Winterich et al., 2018, pp. 70–71). The strategy of endorsement varies from culture to culture, adapting to their unique communication styles. Celebrities in high-context cultures, such as Korea, frequently assume social roles in advertisements, conforming to the culture's inclination for understated and indirect communication. In contrast, in low-context cultures like the USA, celebrities are commonly employed as spokespersons or opinion leaders, emphasising direct and explicit communication. The distinction is a result of the diverse communication styles and cultural values found in different societies, which in turn affect the way celebrities are used in advertising content (Choi et al., 2005). In some cultures, traditional celebrities are regarded as symbols of aspiration due to their esteemed status and notable accomplishments in their respective fields. Their endorsements have an influence on their public personas, associating products with their perceived distinction and accomplishment. For instance, in cultures characterised by a significant power distance and a collective mindset, such as India, celebrities wield a greater degree of influence, and their endorsements are more readily embraced by consumers (Abhishek & Sahay, 2016). In contrast, do-it-yourself celebrities, who have gained popularity through online platforms, frequently present a more relatable and ordinary persona, attracting audiences who appreciate genuineness and a sense of personal rapport (Agnihotri & Bhattacharya, 2020; Fan, 2020). The variations in perceived credibility and relatability, which arise from cultural values regarding fame, expertise, and relatability, result in different approaches to endorsement: traditional celebrities capitalising on their status and broad appeal, and self-made celebrities emphasising personal stories and community involvement.

2.2. Assessing Efficacy of Endorsement Using User Comments

Social media platforms offer numerous benefits for companies to effectively communicate with their stakeholders. The diverse engagement features offered by social media platforms facilitate the measurement of communication campaign effectiveness and specific outcomes such as brand awareness, trust, and purchasing attitudes (Bialkova & Te Paske, 2020). Engagement types are classified into three broad categories: creating, contributing, and consuming. These categories encompass engagement methods such as liking, disliking, commenting, tagging, watching, reposting, rating, inviting, and so on. (Dolan et al., 2019). Companies can benefit from using the engagement methods provided by social media platforms for their endorsement campaigns, similar to other marketing campaigns. In particular, user comments directly affect the customers' perceptions, brand image, and purchasing behaviours (S.-A. A. Jin & Phua, 2014; Rashid & Cetinkaya, 2020). Therefore, user comments provide valuable insights into the effectiveness of communication efforts on social

media (Dolan et al., 2019). Researchers commonly use comment and share counts as performance indicators for many aspects of communication efforts (Tafesse & Wood, 2021), however, Chang and Wu (2024) discovered that there is no correlation between the number of comments and share counts and product-centeredness, which refers to how customers mention products in their comments. Companies and marketing teams can easily extract insights using certain techniques like text analysis (Messenger & Whittle, 2011), sentiment analysis (AL-Bakri et al., 2022), word cloud, and machine learning (Lee & Ryu, 2019).

Each platform has its own methods of enabling users to comment on posts. Comments have the potential to cover a wide range of topics, as users are typically unrestricted in their ability to express their thoughts and opinions (Madden et al., 2013). To illustrate, on platform X (previously known as Twitter), every comment is also a tweet. Nevertheless, Facebook, YouTube, and Instagram all feature specific sections designated for user comments.

YouTube or other social media comments have the potential to influence other users' opinions about a particular product or brand (Chang & Wu, 2024; Dwivedi et al., 2021, p. 7), and they have a positive effect on increasing sales for businesses (Sondakh et al., 2022). YouTube's comment feature enables social engagement, interaction, and idea sharing between video creators and viewers (Xiao, 2023). In this regard, Zhao (2023) suggests that companies can improve marketing strategies by continuously monitoring and analysing user feedback and interactions on social media, implying that user comments can guide marketing communications. User comments not only help to monitor the effectiveness of marketing campaigns but also enhance other institutional communication efforts such as crisis communication (Che et al., 2023).

Ultimately, the diverse interactive capabilities of social media platforms not only provide a convenient means of reaching specific audiences, but also enhance the evaluation processes. Specifically, user comments constitute a powerful communication tool that enables direct engagement between audiences and content creators. The direct engagement shapes customer perception, brand awareness, and purchasing behaviours.

3. Research Design and Methodology

The objective of this study is to analyze the variation in user comments on video advertisements based on the type of endorsement. In this regard we employed a qualitative research design. Qualitative content analysis has a strong foundation in communication studies (Mayring, 2014, p. 39). Qualitative content analysis was chosen for its ability to systematically analyse different types of data such as user comments on YouTube video ads. Also, this method provides a deeper understanding on the user generated content and helps to explore new connections, patterns, themes and meanings.

3.1. Sample and Data Collection

The video selection process for this research was non-random due to the extensive and varied nature of the existing YouTube video population. The YouTube Ads Leaderboard, a webpage by Google that ranks the best advertisements on YouTube each month since 2017, was used as the basis for video selection. A total of 8 videos were chosen by purposive sampling, evenly split between traditional celebrities and youtubers. The videos selected from Turkish version of the website and ads are produced for Turkish market. Although limited, the comments selected for analysis offer a snapshot of public opinion on these marketing videos. Total 8493 comments were gathered from January 7 to 10, 2020. We used netlytic.org (now communalytic.org) web service to scrap the data. This service allows researchers to collect social media data from different platforms.

For the comment sample, 800 comments (100 per selected video) were randomly selected from the dataset. To select the comment sample each data is given a unique number randomly on Excel. The numbers are sorted and first 100 comments of each advertising video are coded.

Table 1. Characteristics of the sample

Channel	Endorser Type	View Count	Like Count	Comment Count	Acces Date
youtube.com/@teknosa	Influencer	1.9m	15k	2.2k	07.01.2020
youtube.com/c/RufflesTürkiye	Influencer	33m	44k	1.8k	08.01.2020
youtube.com/@LiptonTR	Influencer	1.6m	2.8k	0.174k	08.01.2020
youtube.com/@MaybellineNYTurkiye	Influencer	2.2m	20k	1.2k	07.01.2020
youtube.com/@Coca-Cola	Celebrity	2m	0.948k	1.1.k	09.01.2020
youtube.com/c/OPPOTürkiye	Celebrity	4.7m	9.8k	0.863k	10.01.2020
www.youtube.com/@mavi	Celebrity	2.1m	3.5k	0.246k	09.01.2020
youtube.com/@MagnumTurkiye	Celebrity	6.5m	10 k	0.910k	10.01.2020

Notes: m = million; k= thousand*

We choose to select an equal number of 100 comments from each YouTube channel, rather than employing a proportional stratified sampling technique. This approach makes sure that each channel is equally represented in the analysis,

Table 2. Categories and Subcategories in the Analysis of Video Comments by Wendt et al. (2016).

Category	Subcategory	Definition	Example Data
Topic	Video Content	Direct references to video elements like actors and plots.	Diger ülkelerde çekdirdikleri fotoğrafda cola ünlü her kimse onun yüzünü kapatıyor bir tek bu reklamda öyle deyil
	Brand	Mentions of specific products and/or brands enriching the analysis.	Ruffles yerken dinlemek cymhjhum
	Other Brands	Mentions of other brands and products.	Kolaya kaçma diyo yani koka kolaya kaçma diyo :D
	Advertising	Discussion of the advertising context within video content.	Abi bu reklamı ilk hintliler çekmiş deepika padukone coca cola yazınca görürsünüz
	YouTube Interaction	Sharing links, videos, and other content for user engagement.	Kanalimi takip eder misin lütfen 👋
	Off-Topic	Posts deviating from the core themes of the videos.	Ulan şu reklamı hazırlayan Kala Film veya oppo\'nun ceosu Syn weijian zhou size sesleniyorum. İşsizim, iş arıyorum :(
Pragmatic	Question	Posts containing direct queries or seeking information.	TELEVİZYONLARDA NEDEN DÖNMÜYOR REKLAM ??
	Information Provision	Posts providing explanations, insights, or additional information.	En çok ilgimi çeken Türklerin bu videoyu orjinalinden daha çok izlemiş olması 😂😂😂
	Video Recommendation	Posts suggesting other videos for user consideration.	#MerhabaArkadaşlar vlogumun linki m.youtube.com/watch**** ağlarım ya seçilmessem vallaha ağlarım
	Link to User	Posts referencing and fostering communication with other users.	merhaba enes abinin beğendiği videolar arasındaydım mail adresim :ag******@gmail.com
	Insult	Posts containing offensive language or derogatory remarks towards other users.	Mezar taşı reklamı olsa anlarımda magnum ne alaka ya
	Joke	Humorous posts injecting a light-hearted element into the commentary.	Enes Abinin videolari ile okula döndüğünüzü düşünürsek -0:sınıfta kaldın
	General Conversation	Personal anecdotes, non-topical reactions, or casual discussions between users.	Abi telefonuma şarkıyı indirilyrum açılmıyor 😡 çıldıracam direkt başlamadan başka şarkıya geçiyor
	Compliment	Positive statements expressing approval or admiration.	Çok güzel reklam oldu harika
	Critique	Negative statements providing feedback or criticism.	Bedava verseler kullanmaz bu telefonu sıla😡😡😡
	Approval and Opposition	Reflecting the evolving dynamics of the discussion by cataloguing agreements and disagreements within comments.	Aynen ya ben de izlediğimde aklıma ilk o gelmişti dhsvhshshs
Sentiment	Positive Assessment	Compliments, approvals, and oppositions on critique, constituting a positive evaluation.	diğer ülkelerin reklamlarına da izledim. Oyunculuk anlamında en güzeli bizimki.
	Negative Assessment	Critiques, approvals on critique, and opposition on compliments, forming a negative evaluation.	Şu aptal da reklamda oynadıya ÜLKE harbi kötüleşmeye başladı midem bulanıyor şunu görünce 🤮😖
	Mixed Assessment	Posts presenting a blend of positive and negative sentiments, or neutral comments that showcasing the nuanced nature of user assessments.	YA O KADAR UĞRAŞTIM VİDEOM İÇİN AMA SEÇİLMEDİ YA DA GÖRMEDİ ENES BATUR AMA BEN PES ETMİCEM

which is crucial when each channel's comments are considered equally significant. Moreover, this method simplifies the sampling process, making it more straightforward and efficient to implement. Additionally, by selecting an equal number of comments, we minimize potential biases that could arise from channels with disproportionately larger comment volumes, thereby ensuring a balanced representation across all channels. This strategy is particularly beneficial for comparative analysis, allowing for consistent and meaningful comparisons between the channels.

The attributes of the sample are detailed in Table 1.

3.2. Coding Scheme and Procedure

In this study, we employed deductive category assignment (Mayring, 2014, p. 95). In this analytical method researchers utilize a pre-coded coding scheme which is obtained from previous research and theory.

The data is systematically coded by applying these categories to the text. This approach is especially valuable when there is a well-defined theoretical framework directing the research and when particular facets of the data are the main focus. In our study we used the coding scheme formulated by Madden et al. (2013) and refined by Wendt et al. (2016) for analysing user comments on YouTube video ads to delineate main and subcategories. The main and subcategories of the coding scheme is detailed in Table 2.

To ensure reliability, multiple researchers independently coded a subset of comments and compared results to reach a consensus and to ensure consistency with the established coding scheme. We used Cohen's Kappa statistic to assess inter-coder agreement (Kappa = 0.75). When disagreements occurred, we implemented a correction process to resolve discrepancies between the two researchers' assessments. The final coding results were determined after discussing and reconciling the differing codes.

A compilation of 800 randomly chosen comments was systematically categorized into three overarching groups. Each category sheds light on distinct facets of user interaction. NVivo was used for the coding process.

The primary categories are 'Topic,' which reveals the subject matter discussed; 'Pragmatics,' which delves into the communication styles exhibited; and 'Sentiment,' which offers insights into the emotional undertones of user assessments towards brands. Table 2 presents a detailed breakdown of these main and subcategories.

4. Results

The study's analytical framework systematically examines differences between traditional celebrity and youtuber ad videos across main and subcategories. Frequency of codes are systematically presented in a table providing a comprehensive overview. Topic, Pragmatic and Sentiment themes and their sub-categories are analysed in detail in the following sections. The analysis reveals the characteristics and interrelationships of comments concerning topics, pragmatics, and sentiments related to various endorsement types in the ad videos, presented in Table 3.

Table 3. Frequency distribution of Topic, Pragmatic and Sentiment themes according to celebrity and youtuber categories.

	Codes	Celebrity	Youtuber
Topic	*Brand*	48	22
	Off-Topic	69	31
	Video Content	243	325
	Advertising	36	10
	Other Brands	4	8
	Youtube Interactions	1	4
Pragmatic	*Approval&Opposition*	27	9
	Compliment	124	104
	Critique	53	87
	General Conversation	96	101
	Information Provision	20	13
	Insult	17	8
	Joke	20	45
	Link To User	2	11
	Question	35	20
	Video Recommendation	4	3
Sentiment	*Positive*	158	149
	Mixed/Neutral	182	168
	Negative	60	83

4.1. Topics

Specifically, elements such as storyline, musical score, and actor performances are significantly prominent in the comments. The comments on videos endorsed by youtubers notably place a strong focus on visual content, a reflection of the growing popularity of influencers in this field. Celebrities surpass youtubers in brand discussions, suggesting a stronger emphasis on brand-related aspects in the former. This highlights the significance of brand recognition in promotional videos featuring celebrities. Additionally, videos with celebrity endorsements show a heightened focus on brand elements. This aligns with the long-standing perception of celebrities as the face of traditional advertising, endorsing, and promoting brands or products.

4.1.1. Brand

In the brand category, user comments are related with positive feedback, loyalty, and approval or disapproval towards endorsement choice of the brands. Celebrity endorsements boost reliability and trust if consumers value the brand's choice of celebrity and the favourable influence on their perception. Such comments "Sıla Gençoğlu'na hayranlığım dan dolayı OPPO kullanıyorum. Teşekkür ederim süper yaaa oppo 😉🤣" indicates this loyalty and approval towards celebrities and its transfered value towards the brand. There are also comments that show the disapproval of the users for the endorsers choice of the brand like "ulan ajdaya para vereceğinize dondurmalara her ay zam yapmayin 6 liraya magnum mu olur !!!😡😡". The comments in the brands category demonstrate that youtuber endorsements improve personal connection and relatability; users reflect positive feedback and more loyalty to the brand. Comments like "Ben zaten doğma büyüme liptonluyum" are examples of this loyalty attitude. Comments in both categories indicate the brands' strengths and the efficacy of the endorsement choices, but the main difference is the type of involvement of the users. Comments on celebrity endorsements support trust and reliability, and

comments on youtuber endorsements focus on personal connection and relatability.

4.1.2. Video Content

Celebrity and youtuber-endorsed YouTube ads both effectively engage users, however in slightly different ways under the video content category. Celebrity endorsements frequently pique *users' interest*, with many users wanting to learn more about the celebrities, and they tend to improve *brand perception and loyalty* due to the celebrities' influence. Celebrities frequently get positive feedback and admiration for their high-quality, entertaining content, as well as humour and comparative remarks. On the other hand, Youtuber endorsements get positive comments and appreciation mostly for their personal appeal and content originality. Through humour, relatability, and personal connections, they also inspire high degrees of involvement. Many times, viewers offer ideas and helpful criticism to show their support for ongoing advertisement campaign. Although both kinds of endorsements produce interesting and memorable material, celebrities usually use their well-known reputation to shape brand impression, while Youtubers rely on their personal relationship with the audience to improve involvement and relatability.

4.1.3. Advertising

In the advertising category, the analysis of comments on celebrity and youtuber endorsers indicates distinct features. Positive feedback for celebrity endorsements under the advertising category emphasises their production quality and effectiveness. However, Youtuber advertisements receive praise for their entertaining nature and relatability. Comments on celebrity ads tend to offer objective observations and comparisons, demonstrating a more analytical approach. In contrast, comments on Youtuber ads sometimes show more personalised viewpoints by including suggestions and personal preferences. From this observation we can suggest that there are different user expectations and receptions by the endorsement types.

4.1.4. Off-Topic

A significant portion of the comments that fall into this category consists of comments that are not relevant to the context at hand and some of the comments that fall into the off-topic category are difficult to place in any category due to their content and meaning, and. It was found that there was no significant difference between the content of celebrity endorsers and that of YouTube endorsers; however, when it came to the number of comments that were made, it was found that celebrity endorsers had a greater number of comments that were not related to the theme.

4.1.5. Other Brands & YouTube Interactions

In these categories, there is insufficient data to provide a final evaluation. However, under both celebrity and YouTube categories, users compared the ads with other brands' ad campaigns, or in a few instances, they mentioned different products. YouTube interactions refer to comments made by users when they share YouTube links, and there are more instances under the YouTube category that demonstrate a higher level of interaction between users.

4.2. Pragmatics

Celebrities garner more compliments than youtubers, who, conversely, receive more criticism. This implies that celebrities are regarded as more favourable or likeable by prospective customers in contrast to youtubers. Celebrities' admiration stems from their established reputations, roles requiring specific skills, and enduring association with traditional advertisements. Conversely, youtubers attract more criticism, possibly due to perceptions of less skill and their emerging status among the younger generation. The prevalence of humour in comments on Youtuber videos likely reflects their audience's preference for a humorous style. For other pragmatic categories, such as approval, general conversation, and information provision, among others, the analysis shows no significant

differences between the two types of endorsements.

4.2.1. Approval

While both celebrity and Youtuber endorsers get approval for their impact and content, the type of this approval differs in the category for approval. While Youtubers are praised for their originality, personal interactions, and authenticity, celebrities are praised for their public persona and professional activities. This difference emphasises the several roles and expectations that different audiences of these two kinds of influencers place on them.

4.2.2. Compliment

Frequently, people compliment celebrities for their appearances style, charisma, singing or performance ability. Users also praise celebrities for their impact and sponsorships and commercials. On their niche skills, relatability and authenticity, quality and inventiveness of their content, youtubers are praised, though. The motivating or instructive power of Youtubers' original, friendly, and humorous video ads is much valued by users. Although both youtubers and celebrities are valued for their work, their compliments reflect the expectations and relationships of their different audiences.

4.2.3. Critique

Users of both categories criticise the quality of the material, pointing out supposed shortcomings including inadequate originality or production value. The emphasis varies, though, in terms of authenticity and behaviour; for Youtubers, users express criticism of alleged lack of sincerity or commercialisation, while for celebrities, comments often centre on inappropriate behaviour or words impacting their public image. Furthermore, while celebrities are attacked for mismatched sponsorships and unmet public expectations, Youtubers also suffer criticism on the relevance of their material as well as audience interaction. Reflecting their different roles and approaches of

public interaction, these comparisons show the complex expectations and standards consumers have for celebrities against Youtubers.

4.2.4. General Conversation

When comparing the general conversations category for celebrity and youtuber endorsers, we observe both common and distinctive elements of *user engagement*. Reflecting a range of user interests and conversations on personal opinions, public image, and behaviour, both categories cover a broad variety of subjects. While comments on youtubers generally focus on their *personal life* and *social media presence*, comments on celebrity-endorsed ads often focus on more *public appearances* and *controversial remarks*. Although both groups exhibit high degrees of user engagement, youtubers receive more comments on their direct audience interactions like live streams and personal interactions. Both celebrities and youtubers start general discussions, however youtubers encourage their audience to have a closer and more interactive relationship which is a part of Youtube's media logic.

4.2.5. Information Provision

The category on information provision for celebrity and YouTuber endorsers demonstrates the role that users play as *sources of contextual and factual information*. Users share their comments on factual updates, such as "Hindistan'da bu reklamda Deepika rol almış çok güzel." They also correct some of the conversational errors, such as "Colaya kaçmayın gizili mesaj." These remarks are important for keeping other users updated about recent events, providing information, and ensuring the accuracy of the exchanged information. This category highlights the informative value of user involvement, in which case the emphasis is on spreading knowledge and elucidating details regarding celebrities and YouTubers.

4.2.6. Insult

The insult category for celebrity and youtuber endorsers reveals similar trends of offensive language and personal attacks. Often without constructive criticism, both groups have *rude and insulting* comments targeted directly at the individuals. While insults include strong criticism and dislike towards their *actions or presence* for youtubers, insulting comments often target the age and *appearance of celebrities*, sometimes damaging brand perception. Both groups highlight the entirely negative character of these exchanges since users show general hostility and dislike. The lack of helpful criticism emphasises the emotional intensity and personal character of these negative remarks since Youtuber insults also influence related companies.

4.2.7. Joke

The Joke category for both Youtuber and Celebrity endorsers reflects a humorous interaction with the content. For celebrities, jokes frequently consist in *parodies*, *cultural references*, *comical criticism*, and increasing involvement with fun remarks. "Sene 2035 . Burulay öldü mu? Evet. Ajda pekkan cenazede bir ağladı bir ağladı...😂" is one of the examples of this comical criticism about celebrity endorsers. For Youtubers, too, joke comments consist of light-hearted comments, cultural references, and satire. For instance, comments like "TeknoSelamunAleyküm :D" and "2 kişinin bildiği sır değildir :)" contain cultural references for youtuber endorsed video ads. Although both genres employ comedy to captivate viewers, Youtuber interactions usually highlight relatability and personal connection in line with their content.

4.2.8. Link To User

The celebrity endorser category was excluded from the link to user category due to the limited amount of data for this category. Due to the content and nature of the advertisements, as well as the fact that youtuber endorsers promote interaction, more interactions between users occurred in the youtuber category. The endorser

type directly influences this category, resulting in a greater number of interactions for the YouTube endorsers, which is more likely to happen.

4.2.9. Question

Within the question category, users frequently turn to both celebrity and youtuber endorsers for a variety of purposes, such as seeking information, clarifications, opinions, and driving engagement. When it comes to celebrities, users often inquire about the specifics of video ads and the level of celebrity involvement. An example of such a question could be "Bu reklam hangi kanalda yayinlandi?" Similarly, Youtubers frequently receive questions from users about the content's specifics, such as "Bu videoyu hangi programla editlemiş?" Both groups also have questions that seek clarification on various aspects of their content, opinions, and recommendations, thereby fostering engaging discussions within the community. As an illustration, individuals may inquire about the opinions of others regarding a celebrity endorsement or the content of a popular youtuber's channel.

4.2.10. Video Recommendation

Regarding both of the categories, the data for the video recommendation category is rather limited for an evaluation.

4.3. Sentiment

The sentiment analysis reveals that the dataset exhibits predominantly consistent patterns. Overall, sentiments across both types of videos are mixed, with a noticeable prevalence of positive attitudes. However, youtuber-endorsed video ads tend to attract more negative comments, reflecting the higher level of criticism observed.

4.3.1. Positive Sentiments

For youtubers and celebrities, positive comments are mostly approvals. Users in the celebrity category usually emphasise the quality of the video content and express satisfaction with words

like "Kıskananlar çatlsın, çok güzelsin bebemmm 😀". Positive brand comments like "Sanırım bu gördüğüm en iyi coca cola reklamı" indicate users favour ads. These comments mainly express compliments or approval, so reflecting positive feedback. Youtubers receive positive feedback on their engagement and video quality. Youtubers' endorsed video ads are valued for their information, entertainment value, and inventiveness. Positive comments could be evaluated as compliments or approval, so expressing respect of the efforts of the YouTubers.

4.3.2. Negative Sentiments

Particularly in video content and brand categories, negative celebrity sentiment comments reflect users' criticism and disapproval. Many times, users criticise videos for lacking content or quality. These criticisms or disapprovals reveal consumers' dissatisfaction. Negative brand comments highlight marketing concerns by referencing consumers' negative experiences with advertising and promotion. Video material of poor quality, boring subjects, and false information is another target of criticism by YouTubers. Users may also find the YouTuber's behaviour or viewpoint objectionable. Complaints and criticism point to audience discontent.

4.3.3. Neutral/Mixed Sentiments

Comments for celebrity endorsements with neutral sentiment are objective and instructive. Usually, these remarks on ads are neutral and either instructive or descriptive. Usually, brand comments about ads and promotions offer objective facts or general comments. Most brand comments are neutral or mixed of emotional expression. Users also provided objective and instructive comments expressing neutrality towards YouTuber-endorsed ads.

5. Discussion and Conclusion

This study aims to understand the difference of the user reactions towards traditional celebrity and

youtuber endorsements in advertising campaigns. The main research question addressed was what is the overall impact of celebrity endorsements versus online influencer endorsements on user comments' YouTube video ads? The overarching question was further operationalized into three sub-questions on influence on the topics of comments, styles of communication in comments, and on emotional content of user comments.

The research contributes three valuable insights to the literature on marketing communication and celebrity endorsement. Firstly, we found that celebrity endorsements lead to more discussions about brand elements, while YouTuber endorsements focus more on video content. Secondly, celebrities receive more compliments and are viewed more favorably, whereas YouTubers attract more criticism and humorous comments. Thirdly, sentiments are generally mixed but mostly positive, with celebrity-endorsed videos garnering more positive sentiments and YouTuber-endorsed videos attracting more negative comments.

In terms of topic, traditional celebrities elicit many more brand-related comments, which indicates the deep-rooted perception of traditional celebrities as the image of the brand. Users love to express their admiration for the celebrity itself, which betters the reliability and credibility of the image of the brand. However, all the admiration created for celebrities is directed toward the brand that the admired celebrity endorsed.

In terms of pragmatic, comments on youtuber endorsements are a mix of critiques and compliments. It creates a form of engagement between youtubers and their audience, which is most often brought about through humour, a joking or casual way of speaking, and personal and direct interaction with other users. This denotes an informal and community-style communication on social media, which is predominantly used by the younger generation (Piehler vd., 2022). Therefore, while traditional celebrity endorsements remain a credible approach, it may be more effective for brands to leverage influencers when aiming to engage consumers who prefer to interact with brands on social media (Schouten vd., 2020).

In terms of sentiment, celebrity endorsements have more positive views in general, which can be attributed to their already-established fame/celebrity status and the professional production quality of the advertisements that they are placed within. Consistent with this result, an online experiment with 129 social media users in Russia revealed that, compared to instafamous' celebrities, traditional celebrities have a more positive impact on social media users' purchase intentions if the users have low self-esteem (Piehler vd., 2022). Additionally, Fan's (2020) study found that in non-Western societies, traditional celebrities are seen as more reliable and respected compared to social media influencers.

5.1. Practical Implications

A few strategic implications that could be taken through the view of such findings by the practitioners in the industry. Traditional celebrities can be better used for brand endorsements when intending to do build-up or make stronger the trust and reliability. This adds more value to the brand and harvests positive emotions amongst users because of the deeply etched public figure and reputation they possess. Youtubers can be better used to target young audiences and create content that relates more individually, utilize youtubers. Even though professional quality is still needed, there must be authenticity, especially when endorsing by these youtubers. This is because creating content that feels real and represents the personality of the youtuber will do the most in keeping their credibility and maintaining positive engagement. Through a keen look at user comments, a brand will be able to fully comprehend the consumer's perceptions, preferences, and needs. They should consider using sentiment analysis tools to obtain feedback on the success of the campaigns and, in return, be able to adjust the content created to better suit their strategy. Cultural differences are also part of what influences endorsement effectiveness. When using either traditional celebrities or social media influencers, a brand should adapt its endorsement strategies to the cultural expectations and values.

The study concludes with the information that the effect of traditional celebrities and YouTubers on user comments is varied within YouTube advertisements. While celebrities promote brand trust and reliability, YouTubers promote personal engagement and relatability. Understanding these dynamics, marketing professionals may be more adept in their element when it comes to crafting an advertising strategy around the strengths of both types of endorsements and eventually delivering the best approach possible for message communication and consumer engagement in today's digital age.

References

Abhishek, N. A., & Sahay, A. (2016). Role of culture in celebrity endorsement: brand endorsement by celebrities in the Indian context. *International Journal of Indian Culture and Business Management*, 13(3), 394. https://doi.org/10.1504/ijicbm.2016.078846

Agnihotri, A., & Bhattacharya, S. (2020). Endorsement Effectiveness of Celebrities versus Social Media Influencers in the Materialistic Cultural Environment of India. *Journal of International Consumer Marketing,* 33(3), 1–23. https://doi.org/10.1080/08961530.2020.1786875

Ahmed, D. R. R., Seedani, S. K., Ahuja, M. K., & Paryani, S. K. (2015). Impact of Celebrity Endorsement on Consumer Buying Behavior. *SSRN Electronic Journal*, 4(3), 159–170. https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2666148

AL-Bakri, N. F., Yonan, J. F., & Sadiq, A. T. (2022). Tourism Companies Assessment via Social Media Using Sentiment Analysis. *Baghdad Science Journal*, 19(2), 0422. https://doi.org/10.21123/bsj.2022.19.2.0422

Armstrong, M. (2023). *Netflix is Responsible for 15% of Global Internet Traffic*. Statista. https://www.statista.com/chart/15692/distribution-of-global-downstream-traffic/

Bi, N. C., & Zhang, R. (2023). "I will buy what my 'friend' recommends": the effects of parasocial relationships, influencer credibility and self-esteem on purchase intentions. *Journal of Research in Interactive Marketing*, 17(2), 157–175. https://doi.org/10.1108/JRIM-08-2021-0214

Booth, N., & Matic, J. A. (2011). Mapping and leveraging influencers in social media to shape corporate brand perceptions. *Corporate Communications: An International Journal*, 16(3), 184–191. https://doi.org/10.1108/13563281111156853

Breves, P. L., Liebers, N., Abt, M., & Kunze, A. (2019). The Perceived Fit between Instagram Influencers and the Endorsed Brand. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 59(4), 440–454. https://doi.org/10.2501/JAR-2019-030

Bylock, C., & Lidberg, T. (2018). *The importance of using influencer marketing in order to create brand awareness in international markets for e-commerce companies*. Linnaeus University.

Campbell, M. C., & Kirmani, A. (2000). Consumers' Use of Persuasion Knowledge: The Effects of Accessibility and Cognitive Capacity on Perceptions of an Influence Agent. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 27(1), 69–83. https://doi.org/10.1086/314309

Carcavilla, F., & Aguirre, A. I. (2022). The communication of Gucci's brand identity on its Instagram profile. *Doxa Comunicación, 34*, 177–200.

Chang, S.-T., & Wu, J.-J. (2024). A content-based metric for social media influencer marketing. *Industrial Management & Data Systems*, 124(1), 344–360. https://doi.org/10.1108/IMDS-05-2022-0303

Che, S. P., Zhou, Y., Zhang, S., Nan, D., & Kim, J. H. (2023). Impact of ByteDance crisis communication strategies on different social media users. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*, 10(1). https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-023-02170-3

Childers, C. C., Lemon, L. L., & Hoy, M. G. (2019). #Sponsored #Ad: Agency Perspective on Influencer Marketing Campaigns. *Journal of Current Issues and Research in Advertising*, 40(3), 258–274. https://doi.org/10.1080/10641734.2018.1521113

Choi, S. M., Lee, W. N., & Kim, H. J. (2005). Lessons from the rich and famous: A cross-cultural comparison of celebrity endorsement in advertising. *Journal of Advertising*, 34(2), 58–98.

https://doi.org/10.1080/00913367.2005.106391 90

De Veirman, M., Cauberghe, V., & Hudders, L. (2017). Marketing through instagram influencers: The impact of number of followers and product divergence on brand attitude. *International Journal of Advertising, 36*(5), 798–828. https://doi.org/10.1080/02650487.2017.134803 5

Djafarova, E., & Trofimenko, O. (2019). 'Instafamous'–credibility and self-presentation of micro-celebrities on social media. *Information Communication and Society, 22*(10), 1432–1446. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369118X.2018.14384 91

Dolan, R., Conduit, J., Frethey-Bentham, C., Fahy, J., & Goodman, S. (2019). Social media engagement behavior: A framework for engaging customers through social media content. *European Journal of Marketing, 53*(10), 2213–2243. https://doi.org/10.1108/EJM-03-2017-0182

Dwivedi, Y. K., Ismagilova, E., Hughes, D. L., Carlson, J., Filieri, R., Jacobson, J., Jain, V., Karjaluoto, H., Kefi, H., Krishen, A. S., Kumar, V., Rahman, M. M., Raman, R., Rauschnabel, P. A., Rowley, J., Salo, J., Tran, G. A., & Wang, Y. (2021). Setting the future of digital and social media marketing research: Perspectives and research propositions. *International Journal of Information Management, 59*(July 2020), 102168. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijinfomgt.2020.10216 8

Erdogan, B. Z. (1999). Celebrity Endorsement: A Literature Review. *Journal of Marketing Management, 15*(4), 291–314. https://doi.org/10.1362/026725799784870379

Fan, F. (2020). Exploratory study about audience response to product endorsements by online DIY celebrities and traditional celebrities. *Young Consumers, 22*(2), 169–184. https://doi.org/10.1108/YC-10-2020-1224

Gannon, V., & Prothero, A. (2018). Beauty bloggers and YouTubers as a community of practice. *Journal of Marketing Management, 34*(7–8), 592–619. https://doi.org/10.1080/0267257X.2018.14829 41

Geyser, W. (2024). *What is an Influencer?* Influencer Marketing Hub. https://influencermarketinghub.com/what-is-an-influencer/

Gräve, J. (2017). Exploring the Perception of Influencers Vs . Traditional Celebrities : Are Social Media Stars a New Type of Endorser ? *SMSociety'17*, 1–5.

Haapasalmi, J. (2017). *Advertiser Perception of Influencer Marketing. May*, 1–73.

Hess, A. C., Dodds, S., & Rahman, N. (2022). The development of reputational capital – How social media influencers differ from traditional celebrities. *Journal of Consumer Behaviour, 21*(5), 1236–1252. https://doi.org/10.1002/cb.2074

Hsu, C. L., Lin, J. C. C., & Chiang, H. Sen. (2013). The effects of blogger recommendations on customers' online shopping intentions. *Internet Research, 23*(1), 69–88. https://doi.org/10.1108/10662241311295782

Jin, S.-A. A., & Phua, J. (2014). Following Celebrities' Tweets About Brands: The Impact of Twitter-Based Electronic Word-of-Mouth on Consumers' Source Credibility Perception, Buying Intention, and Social Identification With Celebrities. *Journal of Advertising, 43*(2), 181–195.
https://doi.org/10.1080/00913367.2013.827606

Jin, S. V., Muqaddam, A., & Ryu, E. (2019). Instafamous and social media influencer marketing. *Marketing Intelligence and Planning, 37*(5), 567–579. https://doi.org/10.1108/MIP-09-2018-0375

Kemp, S. (2023). *Digital 2023: Global overview report*. Datareportal. https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2023-global-overview-report

Khamis, S., Ang, L., & Welling, R. (2017). Self-branding, 'micro-celebrity' and the rise of Social Media Influencers. *Celebrity Studies, 8*(2), 191–208. https://doi.org/10.1080/19392397.2016.121829 2

Lee, S. Y., & Ryu, M. H. (2019). Exploring characteristics of online news comments and commenters with machine learning approaches. *Telematics and Informatics, 43*, 101249.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tele.2019.101249

Liu, S., Jiang, C., Lin, Z., Ding, Y., Duan, R., & Xu, Z. (2015). Identifying effective influencers based on trust for electronic word-of-mouth marketing: A domain-aware approach. *Information Sciences*, *306*, 34–52. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ins.2015.01.034

Lou, C., & Yuan, S. (2019). Influencer Marketing: How Message Value and Credibility Affect Consumer Trust of Branded Content on Social Media. *Journal of Interactive Advertising*, *19*(1), 58–73. https://doi.org/10.1080/15252019.2018.1533501

Madden, A., Ruthven, I., & McMenemy, D. (2013). A classification scheme for content analyses of YouTube video comments. *Journal of Documentation*, *69*(5), 693–714. https://doi.org/10.1108/JD-06-2012-0078

Madhavika, W. D. ., & Rathnayake, R. M. N. M. (2020). Impact of Internet Usage on Undergraduate Academic Performance (Special Reference to YouTube online video platform usage). *Global Journal of Management and Business Research*, *20*(1), 17–24. https://doi.org/10.34257/gjmbrgvol20is1pg17

Mayring, P. (2014). *Qualitative Content Analysis: Theoretical Foundation, Basic Procedures and Software Solution*. https://doi.org/10.4135/9781446282243.n12

Messenger, A., & Whittle, J. (2011). Recommendations Based on User-Generated Comments in Social Media. *2011 IEEE Third Int'l Conference on Privacy, Security, Risk and Trust and 2011 IEEE Third Int'l Conference on Social Computing*, 505–508. https://doi.org/10.1109/PASSAT/SocialCom.2011.146

Nouri, M. (2018). The Power of Influence: Traditional Celebrity vs Social Media Influencer. *Advanced Writing: Pop Culture Intersections*, *176*(32).

Piehler, R., Schade, M., Sinnig, J., & Burmann, C. (2022). Traditional or 'instafamous' celebrity? Role of origin of fame in social media influencer marketing. *Journal of Strategic Marketing*, *30*(4), 408–420. https://doi.org/10.1080/0965254X.2021.1909107

Rashid, M., & Cetinkaya, A. Ş. (2020). E-comments in business. *International Journal of Management Research and Emerging Sciences*, *10*(4). https://doi.org/10.56536/ijmres.v10i4.118

Schouten, A. P., Janssen, L., & Verspaget, M. (2020). Celebrity vs. Influencer endorsements in advertising: the role of identification, credibility, and Product-Endorser fit. *International Journal of Advertising, 39*(2), 258–281. https://doi.org/10.1080/02650487.2019.1634898

Sondakh, D., Lumingkewas, V., Laoh, L. C., & Sandag, G. A. (2022). Pengaruh sosial media marketing terhadap penjualan usaha mikro kecil dan menengah (umkm). *Klabat Journal of Management*, *3*(1), 67. https://doi.org/10.60090/kjm.v3i1.823.67-82

Stubb, C., Nyström, A. G., & Colliander, J. (2019). Influencer marketing: The impact of disclosing sponsorship compensation justification on sponsored content effectiveness. *Journal of Communication Management*, *23*(2), 109–122. https://doi.org/10.1108/JCOM-11-2018-0119

Swant, M. (2016). *Twitter Says Users Now Trust Influencers Nearly As Much As Their Friends*. Adweek.

Tafesse, W., & Wood, B. P. (2021). Followers' engagement with instagram influencers: The role of influencers' content and engagement strategy. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, *58*, 102303. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jretconser.2020.102303

Tam, M. S. (2020). Sosyal Medya Etkileyicilerinin Kanaat Önderliği Rolü. *Gümüşhane Üniversitesi İletişim Fakültesi Elektronik Dergisi*, *8*(2), 1325–1252.

Veirman, M. De. (2019). *What Is Influencer Marketing and How Does It Target Children ? A Review and Direction for Future Research. 10*(December). https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.02685

Vrontis, D., Makrides, A., Christofi, M., & Thrassou, A. (2021). Social media influencer marketing: A systematic review, integrative framework and future research agenda. *International Journal of Consumer Studies*, *45*(4), 617–644. https://doi.org/10.1111/ijcs.12647

Wendt, L. M., Griesbaum, J., & Kölle, R. (2016). Product advertising and viral stealth marketing in online videos. *Aslib Journal of*

Information Management, *68*(3), 250–264. https://doi.org/10.1108/AJIM-11-2015-0174

Winterich, K. P., Gangwar, M., & Grewal, R. (2018). When celebrities count: Power distance beliefs and celebrity endorsements. *Journal of Marketing*, *82*(3), 70–86. https://doi.org/10.1509/jm.16.0169

Xiao, M. (2023). Engaging in Dialogues: The Impact of Comment Valence and Influencer-Viewer Interaction on the Effectiveness of YouTube Influencer Marketing. *Journal of Interactive Advertising*, *23*(2), 166–186. https://doi.org/10.1080/15252019.2023.2167501

Zhao, X. (2023). The Impact of Social Media on Communication and Marketing Strategies in the Digital Age. *Communications in Humanities Research*, *10*(1), 49–54. https://doi.org/10.54254/2753-7064/10/20231240

Zhou, Q., Lee, C. S., Sin, S.-C. J., Lin, S., Hu, H., & Fahmi Firdaus Bin Ismail, M. (2020). Understanding the use of YouTube as a learning resource: a social cognitive perspective. *Aslib Journal of Information Management*, *72*(3), 339–359. https://doi.org/10.1108/AJIM-10-2019-0290

YouTube Ad Videos

Coca Cola. (2019). Coca-Cola|Asansör [Video File]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CG480NxO0NA

Lipton Çay Turkey. (2019). Ne hayallerinin peşinden giderken ne de serinlerken #KolayaKacma 😎 #Reynmen [Video File]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZmLP4Ti-294

Magnum Turkey. (2019), Her zaman yeni, her zaman tutkulu… #GerçekHaz peşindeki ışıltısıyla o tam bir Magnum kadını! [Video File] YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=R9NF8zECe_0

Mavi. (2020). Serenay'dan ikonik bir jean hikayesi #MaviBenim #SerenayXmaviicon [Video File]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GRyx3h_MZCg

Maybelline New York Türkiye. (2019). Danla Biliç ile aynı anda ruj denemek ister misin? [Video File]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wkMoQk0ysx8

Oppo Türkiye. (2020). Sende ne yetenekler varmış Sıla? 😉 | OPPO Reklam Filmi [Video File]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=28UJtfMKKr0

Ruffles Türkiye. (2019). Ruffles Sunar: Dalgana Bak! – Anıl Piyancı & Berk Coşkun [Video File]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YXzkVI-P4ts

Teknosa. (2019). Enes Baturla Okula Dönüş [Video File]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nnLGJo_-src