

Cumhuriyet İlahiyat Dergisi - Cumhuriyet Theology Journal

ISSN: 2528-9861 e-ISSN: 2528-987X

CUID, June 2018, 22 (1): 679-703

**Examination of the Claims of Distortion on the Qur'ân
which is in al-Qummî Commentary***

Nesrişah Saylan

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi, Fırat Ü., İlahiyat Fakültesi,
Kur'an-ı Kerim Okuma ve Kıraat İlmi Anabilimdalı
Assistant Professor, Fırat U., Faculty of Theology,
Depart. of Qur'an Reading and Recitation Science
Elazığ, Turkey

nsaylan@firat.edu.tr

orcid.org/0000-0002-5805-8630

Article Information / Makale Bilgisi

Article Types / Makale Türü: Çeviri / Translated Article

Received / Geliş Tarihi: 02 March / Mart 2018

Accepted / Kabul Tarihi: 13 June / Haziran 2018

Published / Yayın Tarihi: 15 June / Haziran / 2018

Pub Date Season / Yayın Sezonu: Haziran/June

Volume / Cilt: 22 **Issue / Sayı:** 1 **Pages / Sayfa:** 679-703

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.18505/cuid.420326>

* This article has been published previously in Turkish: Saylan, Nesrişah. "Kummî Tefsirinde Kur'ân'ın Metni Konusundaki Tahrif İddialarının İncelenmesi". *Cumhuriyet İlahiyat Dergisi-Cumhuriyet Theology Journal* 21, sy. 3 (Aralık/December 2017): 1535- 1564. <https://doi.org/10.18505/cuid.334824>

Examination of the Claims of Distortion on the Qur'ân which is in al-Qummî Commentary

Abstract: In this study, the distortion of claims on the text of the Qur'ân in *Tafsîr al-Qummî* which is one of the main sources of Shi'a has been investigated. al-Qummî, the first scholar of the Shi'ite scholars, claims that in the account of the commentary are distorted in the text of the Qur'ân with various subtitles, such as the verses that are in the land of Allah's descendants and distorted verses. While interpreting the verses, he discloses this claim in detail and sometimes gives the correct shapes of the revelations as the difference of interpretation, sometimes based on the narrations, and sometimes in the way of reading the verse. In this study, the verses alleged to be literally distorted in his commentary have been determined and this claim has been compared with other commentaries. The purpose of the article in this context is; in the case of al-Qummî exegesis, it is the examination of the verses allegedly distorted in the Qur'ân and the determination of the Shi'î commentators based on the doctrine of sects by changing the text of the Qur'ân.

Keywords: Tafsîr, Qur'ân, Shi'a, al-Qummî, Distortion, Variant Readings.

Kummî Tefsirinde Kur'ân'ın Metni Konusundaki Tahrif İddialarının İncelenmesi

Öz: Bu çalışmada Şîa'nın temel kaynaklarından olan *Tefsîru'l-Kummî*'de Kur'ân'ın metni konusunda yer alan tahrif iddiaları incelenmiştir. İlk dönem Şîî âlimlerinden olan Kummî (ö. 329/941), tefsirinin mukaddimesinde Allah'ın indirdiğinin hilâfına olan âyetler, tahrif edilen âyetler gibi çeşitli alt başlıklarla Kur'ân metninde tahrif olduğunu iddia etmektedir. O, âyetleri yorumlarken bu iddiasını ayrıntılı bir şekilde açıklamakta ve söz konusu âyetlerin doğru indiriliş şekillerini bazen rivâyetlere dayanarak bazen de âyetin bu şekilde okunuşu yani kıraat farkları olarak vermektedir. Bu çalışmada onun tefsirinde lafzî açıdan tahrif olduğu iddia edilen âyetler belirlenmiş ve onun bu iddiası diğer tefsirlerle karşılaştırılmıştır. Bu bağlamda makalenin amacı; Kummî tefsiri örneğinde Kur'ân'da lafzî açıdan tahrif olduğu iddia edilen âyetlerin incelenmesi ve Şîî müfessirlerin mezhebin doktrinlerini Kur'ân'ın metni üzerinde değişiklik yaparak temellendirdiğinin tespiti edilmesidir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Kur'ân, Tefsir, Şîa, Kummî, Tahrif, Kıraat Farklılıkları.

SUMMARY

The Glorious the Qur'ân by almighty Allah, it is a divine book that has been revealed to Muhammad (pbuh) through Gabriel. It has been preserved from all kinds of changing, transmutation and distortion, since the day the Qur'ân was revealed. “إِنَّا نَحْنُ نَزَّلْنَا الذِّكْرَ وَإِنَّا لَهُ لَنَٰحَافِظُونَ” “We have, without doubt, sent down the message; and we will assuredly guard it (from corruption)”. This verse is the greatest proof that the Holy Qur'ân is under protection, and it has not been distorted or will not.

Distortion (falsification) is the change of the sacred texts by adding or subtracting the original text, arbitrarily changing the meaning, or misinterpreting the actual text. This term

is often used to describe Jews' and Christians' deliberately changing or misinterpreting their own sacred texts. However, this term is also used by the a few scholars of the Shi'as Imamiyya sect for the Qur'ān. There are two schools who claims the distortion of the Qur'ān within the Imamiyya Shi'ah. The first is the Akhbāris who claim that the Qur'ān has been distorted; and the second is the Usūlites who oppose this claim. Those who have Akhbārī thoughts do not only interpret the verses according to their sectarian teachings but go further and claim that these teachings are included in the text of the Qur'ān. As a matter of fact, one of those who have this idea is Qummī. The full name of Qummī, the first scholar of the Shi'ite scholars, is Abu'l-Hasan 'Alī b. İbrāhīm b. Hāshim. It is mentioned that al-Qummī, who had no information about the date of his birth in the sources, died in 329 Hijri. He has written books in almost all of science such as Tafsīr, Hadith, Fiqh and History. Among the books of Qummi, only the book he wrote in the field of commentary has reached the present day. Shi'a accepts this commentary as the main source. This work, which is classified under the category of *tafsīr bil riwayah* (narration commentary), is regarded as *tafsīr bil dirayah* (acumen commentator) because he gives weight to his own opinions.

Qummī, by trying to make the Qur'ān as book that only support 'Alī and his descendants, reflecting a complete ideology in the form of representation of political tafsīr in Shi'a. It is seen in the issues mentioned in the preface of his tafsīr that he used the method that supports this ideology. As a matter of fact, that Qummī in the preface attempt to explain the doctrines of the sect such as the imāmate, prophecy and the seized of Ahl al-bayt right of caliphate in the context of the verses that are different from that which Allah has revealed, distorted verses and taqdim and ta'khir verses in the Qur'ān text. Briefly, Qummī in the preface to of his tafsīr gives examples of some verses that are literally distorted, and explains these distortions in detail when interpreting the verses in question.

Qummī gives in the "distorted verses" section that there are deficiencies in some of the verses and claims that the verse is revealed in this way by adding words that are not actually found in the verse. According to Qummī, one of the words extracted from the text of the Qur'ān is "Alī" that version of this words in Arabic is "علي". These words are usually in the verses as "في علي" means that "about 'Alī", "في ولاية علي" "guardian of 'Alī", "في حق علي" "about 'Alī's right". According to Qummī, another expression derived from the Qur'ānic text is "آل محمد" means that "family of Muhammad". He sometimes bases his claim on the narrations that the verses revealed in that way and sometimes verse recited in that way among different recitations. Qummī says that some of the verses have been revealed as such by adding various phrases to verses besides "في علي" means that "about 'Alī" and "آل محمد" "family of Muhammad". Some of these words that added to verses are mentioned as the different style of recitation in other sources. In the other words this differentiate is related with how you are reciting. Qummī, another classification which he refers to regarding the allegation of distorting, is that some verses are different from those revealed. He gives examples of this issue in various forms. He sometimes claims that when someone reads a verse, he interrupts the recitation by saying that

“the verse has been revealed in this way” base on the narratives; sometimes saying that the verse is revealed differently by indicating the verse is not appropriate in terms of meaning and sometimes without making any explanation claims that how the verse revealed. Qummī's another distortion claim is that taqdim and ta'khir among the words constitute the verse. Qummī says that the verse is different from the one that was actually revealed, after he stated that it was taqdim and ta'khir among the words mentioned in the verses.

Qummī proves the allegations of distortion on the text of the Qur'ān in various ways. One of the ways he follows in this context is that giving the expressions like “نزلت هكذا”/ “the verse was revealed in this way”, and “نزل جبرائيل بهذه الآية هكذا”/ “Gabriel sent down the verse in this way” by changing the the different kind of revealing of those verses. The second way Qummī follows is that mentioning the verse different from the fact that it is by changing the its originality. The third way he follows is that mentioning added words as the different kind of the recitation. However, Qummī did not use this method that much. Indeed, while Shī'ī tafsīrs mention this kind of expressions as a different kind of recitation, Qummī mentions them as a different kind of revealing in his claim.

Most of the verses alleged to have been distorted in the Qummī's tafsīr are relate to the teachings of the Shī'a sect. In this context, Qummī uses various expressions while explaining his claim that some verses in the Qur'ān has been distorted. By adding 'Alī phrase, claims that “آل محمد”/ “His name has deleted from this place”, and by adding “آل محمد”/ “Muhammad's family”, claims that “فأسقطوا آل محمد من الكتاب”/ “Muhammad's family has been reduced from the book”. Sometimes, making some changes on words such as changing the structure of the term “أمة”/ “ummah” as “أئمة”/ “imāmiyya”. Under the influence of the ideology of Shī'a, Qummī asserts that Shī'ah teachings such as prophethood, and Imāmiyya are not just the Qur'ānic interpretations but rather are the Qur'ānic teachings by adding words to the text of the Qur'ān and making some changes in the construction of the Qur'ān.

INTRODUCTION

Tahrīf is an Arabic word derived from the word “حرف”, which means “side, direction”. Its dictionary meaning is to interpret an expression which can be interpreted in two ways with a specific meaning and to change the meaning of an expression.¹ Terminologically, it usually means changing holy texts by adding to or removing from originals texts, or arbitrarily changing the meaning of the text or interpreting the original text inaccurately. This concept is generally used to express misinterpretations of Jews and Christians of their own holy texts

¹ Abū al-Qāsim Maḥmūd b. 'Umar al-Zamakhshari, *Asāsu al-Balāghā*, ed. Muhammad Bāsil (Bairut: Dār al kutub al-‘ilmiyye, 1419/1998), 1: 183; Jamāl al-Dīn Abū l-Faḍl Muḥammad b. Mukarram b. 'Alī b. Aḥmed Ibn Manzūr, *Lisān al-‘Arab* (Cairo: Dār al-Maārif, 1119), 2: 837-840; Abū al-Qāsim Husayn bin Muhammed Raghīb al-Iṣfahānī, *Mufradātu alfāzi al-Qur'ān*, ed. Safvān Adnān Dāvūdī (Dimashk: Dār al Qalem, 1412), 228.

or deliberate distortions.² As a matter of fact, the word “Tahrîf”³ is used in the Qur'ân fourtimes to indicate that Jews distorted both wording and meaning in their books. Accordingly, distortion occurs in two ways. The first is to remove a word from its context and add another word, which is expressed in the Qur'ân as *tabdîl*⁴. The second way is to use the word to mean something, which seems impossible, or to constrict the meaning of a word with two meanings just to one, which is referred to as *taghyir*⁵ in the Qur'ân. So, *tahrîf* involves distortion of the meanings in the verses, amendments of wordings, making additions to the Qur'ân or extraction of some surahs and verses from the Qur'ân.⁶

Some of the scholars of the Imamiyya Shî'ah sect use this term for the Qur'ân and argue that the text of the Qur'ân is distorted.⁷ There are two schools in Imamiyya Shî'ah about *tahrîf* of Qur'ân. The first school is the Akhbâris, who argue that the Qur'ân is distorted, and the second one is the Usûlites, who oppose this idea. Those who hold the Usûliyyah ideas have adopted the deduction method in the determination of decretals. As a reflection of their absolute submission to the authorities of imams, those who hold the Akhbâriyyah ideas argue that oral and written narrations from imams as the only sources in *aqaid* and *fiqh*. In other words, it is a school of thought which does not regard reason, judicial opinion and deduction licit as they regard narrations from the imams as the only source for understanding and interpreting *nasses*.⁸ When the periods Akhbâriyyah and Usûliyyah reigned in *tafsir* tradition of Imamiyya are considered, four phases are seen. The first one is called the earlier period or the

² Frants Buhl, “Tahrif”, *İslam Ansiklopedisi*, c. 11 (Istanbul: Meb Publication, 1979), 667; Muhammet Tarakçı, “Tahrif”, *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi*, c. 39 (Istanbul: TDV Publication, 2010), 422.

³ The word “tahrif (distortion)” is used four times in the Qur'ân in el-Baqarah 2/75, an-Nisâ 4/46, al-Mâide 5/13, 41.

⁴ el-Baqarah 2/58, al-A'raf 7/162.

⁵ al-An'âm 6/53, ar-Ra'd 13/11.

⁶ Muhsin Demirci, *Kur'ân Tarihi* (Istanbul: IFAV Publication, 2015), 273.

⁷ Muhammad Husayn al-Dhahabi, *al-Tafsîr wa-l-mufasssîrîn* (Cairo: Maktabatu Wahba, nd.), 2: 27-147; İhsan İllâhî Zahrî, *Şîa'nın Kur'an, İmâmî ve Takiyye Anlayışı*, trc. Sabri Hizmetli et al. (Ankara: Afşaroğlu Matbaası, 1984), 68-139; İsmail Cerrahoğlu, *Tefsîr Tarihi I* (Ankara: Fecr Publication, 1996), 1: 384-408; Süleyman Ateş, “İmâmîyye Şîasının Tefsîr Anlayışı”, *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 20: 147-172; İsmail Çalıřkan, *Siyasal Tefsîrin Oluşum Süreci*, (Ankara: Ankara Okulu Publication, 2003); Şaban Karataş, *Şîa'da ve Sünni Kaynaklarda Kur'an Tarihi*, (Istanbul: Ekin Publication, 1996); Sâkıp Yıldız, “Şîa'nın Kur'an-ı Kerim ve Tefsiri Hakkındaki Görüşleri”, *Atatürk Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 5 (1982): 51-54.

⁸ For detailed information see Metin Yurdağür, “Ahbâriyye”, *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi*, volüme 1 (Istanbul: TDV Publication, 1988), 490-491; Mazlum Uyar, *İmâmîyye Şîası'nda Ahbârîlik* (PhD diss., Dokuz Eylül Üniversitesi, 1996), 43-47; Mustafa Öz, “Usûliyye”, *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi*, c. 42 (Istanbul: TDV Publication, 2012), 214-215; Mustafa Öztürk, “Şîî-İmâmî Tefsîr Kültürünün genel Karakteristikleri”, *Tarihten Günümüze Kur'an'a Yaklaşımlar*, İlim Yayma Vakfı Kur'an ve Tefsîr Akademisi Publication, 251-256; Sabuhi Şahavatov, “İmâmîyye Şîası'nın Kur'an'ın Tahrifi Konusuna Yaklaşımı”, *Usûl İslâm Araştırmaları* 22 (Temmuz-Aralık 2014), 46-50.

first narration period (Hijri 1st and 4th centuries); the second one is called the middle period or the first acumen period (5th to 10th centuries AH); the third one is the late period or the second narration period (11th and 12th centuries AH); the fourth one is the last period or the second acumen period (13th to 15th centuries AH). In the first narration period when Akhbârism reigned, the fundamental source of Shi'ite commentaries were the narrations reported from the imams. Qummî was among the Shi'î- Imâmî mufasssîrs (glossator) who lived in this period.⁹ The real name of Qummî, who is one of the first period Shi'î scholars, Alî b. İbrahim b. Hâşim.¹⁰ He is also named with his child's name Ebu'l-Hasen. However, in some resources he is also called Muhammedî.¹¹ Qummî, whose date of birth is not known, is said to have died in 329 AH.¹² He wrote works in almost every field including tafsîr (exegesis), hadith, fiqh and history.¹³ The works of Qummî are as follows: *Kitâbü't-Tafsîr*,¹⁴ *Kitâbü'n-nâsîh ve'l-mensûh*,¹⁵ *Kitâbü'ş-Şerâi'*, *Kitâbü'l-Meğâzi*,¹⁶ *Kitâbü Kurbi'l-Isnâd*, *Kitâbü'l-Hayz*, *Kitâbü't-Tevhîd ve'ş-şirk*, *Kitâbü Fedâilî emîri'l-mü'minîn*, *Kitâbü'l-Enbiyâ*, *Risâlatü fi ma'nâ Hişâm ve Yûnis*, *Cevâbâtî mesâilî seelehü Muhammed b. Bilâl*, *Kitâbü'l-Muşezzir*,¹⁷ *Kitâbü İhtiyâri'l-Kur'ân ve rivâyâtihî*,¹⁸ *Fedâilü'l-Kur'ân*.¹⁹

⁹ For detailed information see Öztürk, "Şîî-İmâmî Tefsîr Kültürünün genel Karakteristikleri", 251-260.

¹⁰ Shams al- Dîn Muhammad b. Alî b. Ahmad ad- Dävüdi, *Tabakât al-mufasssîrîn* (Bairut: Dâr al kutub al-İlmiyye, 1403/1983), 1: 392.

¹¹ Abû 'Abd Allâh Shams al- Dîn Muhammad b. Ahmad b. 'Uthmân al-Dhababî, *Mizân al-i'tidâl fi naqdi ar-rijâl*, ed. 'Adil Ahmad 'Abd al-Mavjûd et al.. (Bairut: Dâr al kutub al-İlmiyye, 1416/1995), 5: 137; Ahmad b. Alî b. Hajar al-Asqalânî, *Lisân al-mizân* (Bairut: Dâr al-beshâir al-İslâmiyya, 1423/2002), 5: 477.

¹² 'Adil Nuvayhid, *Mu'jem al-mufasssîrîn min sadr al-islâm hatta al-asr al-hadîr*, ed. Hasan Halid (byy.: Muassasa Nuvayhid as- Saqâfiyye, 1403/1983), 1: 349; Muhammad Hâdi Ma'rifa, *at-Tafsîr wa-l-mufasssîrîn fi sevbihi al-qashib* (Mashad: al-Jâmiat ar-Ridâviyye li-l-'Ulûm al-İslamiyye, 1425), 1: 422.

¹³ Nuvayhid, *Mu'jem al-mufasssîrîn*, 1: 349.

¹⁴ Ibn Hajar, *Lisân al-mizân*, 5: 477; Dävüdi, *Tabakât al-mufasssîrîn*, 1: 392; Abû al-Abbâs Ahmad b. Alî b. Ahmad an-Najashî, *Rijâl an-Nejashî* (Bairut: yy., nd.), 249; Ma'rifa, *at-Tafsîr wa-l-mufasssîrîn*, 1: 422.

¹⁵ Ibn Hajar, *Lisân al-mizân*, 5: 477; Dävüdi, *Tabakât al-mufasssîrîn*, 1: 392; Najashî, *Rijâl*, 249; Ma'rifa, *at-Tafsîr wa-l-mufasssîrîn*, 1: 422.

¹⁶ Abû Ja'far Muhammad b. Hasan al-Tûsî, *al-Fihrist* (Najaf: al-Maktabatu al-Murtazâviyye, nd.), 89; Ibn Hajar, *Lisân al-mizân*, 5: 477; Dävüdi, *Tabakât al-mufasssîrîn*, 1: 392; Najashî, *Rijâl*, 249.

¹⁷ Najashî, *Rijâl*, 249.

¹⁸ Tûsî, *al-Fihrist*, 89.

¹⁹ Dävüdi, *Tabakât al-mufasssîrîn*, 1: 392

Anystudy of Qummî hasn't reached the present day but is his tafsîr study²⁰, which Shî'ah regard as a primary resource.²¹ This tafsîr is categorized as narrative tafsîr,²² is also regarded as dirâyet tafsîr as it mostly included his own views.²³ Qummî starts his tafsîr with an introduction containing verses characterized as nasikh (abrogating) and mansukh (abrogated), muhkam (clear) and mutashabih (ambiguous), verses with specific meaning and general wording or vice versa, with plural wording and singular meaning or vice versa, verses whose parts end in different surahs, distorted or transposable verses, verses that contrast with what Allah revealed, verses whose interpretation was concurrent with their revelations or the ones interpreted before or after their revelation etc.²⁴ Then he glosses the verses ranging from Sûrat al-Fâtihah to Sûrat An-Nâs. In this tafsîr, which mostly includes the narratives of Ahl al-Bayt Imams, tellings from tabi'un and sahaba, even if few, are also presented. The most frequently mentioned remarks are those from Muḥammad al-Bâqir (d. 114/733) and Ja'far al-Şâdiq (d. 148/765).²⁵

Reflecting a complete ideology through a representation of political tafsîr in Shî'ah, Qummî²⁶ seeks to portray The Qur'ân as a book that merely promotes the authority of Ali (d. 661) and his descendants.²⁷ Qummî himself determines the method required to realize this ideology. Therefore, within the group of verses that are interpreted after their revelation, which he mentions in the preface, are included topics regarding raj'at (return), Mahdî's reincarnation, the usurpation of Ahl al-Bayt's right for caliphate after Prophet's demise and God's promise of help for the fight against their foes.²⁸ Qummî identifies the verses that cannot possibly be affiliated to this group as distorted or verses whose texts are transposed, verses that contradict with what Allah revealed. In the introduction of his tafsîr, he shows the distortions of some verses categorized as stated above with exemples and elucidates these distortions elaborately while interpreting the verses. We are going to examine the verses

²⁰ This tafsîr has been also reported to be problematic in many respects. As a matter of fact, the tafsîr has three different reference and narrative chains, hence three different sources; which gives rise to the doubt that it might not in fact belong to Qummî. The tafsîr was also said to be a compilation of the narrator named Abu 'l-Fadl Abbas ibn Muhammad. For detailed information see Mustafa Öztürk, "Şî'îmâmî Tefsîr Kültürünün genel Karakteristikleri", *Tarihten Günümüze Kur'ân'a Yaklaşımlar* (İstanbul: İlim Yayma Vakfı Kur'an ve Tefsîr Akademisi Publication, 2010), 250-251.

²¹ Sayyid Muhammad Ali al-Ayâzî, *al-Mufasssîrûn hayatuhum ve manhacuhum* (Tahran: Vizaretu as-Saqafati wa-l-irşâdi-l-İslâmî, 1373), 329.

²² Ma'rifa, *at-Tafsîr wa-l-mufasssîrûn*, 1: 422.

²³ Aslan Habibov, *İlk Dönem Şî'î Tefsîr Anlayışı* (PhD diss., Ankara University, 2007), 70.

²⁴ Abû al-Hasan Ali al-Qummî, *Tafsîr al-Qummî*, (Kum: Muassasu al-İmâm al-Mahdî, 1435), 1: 25-50.

²⁵ Habibov, "İlk dönem Şî'î Tefsîr Anlayışı", 70.

²⁶ Çalışkan, *Siyasal Tefsirin Oluşum Süreci*, 87.

²⁷ Süleyman Ateş, "İmâmîyye Şiasının Tefsîr Anlayışı", *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 20 (1975): 150; Çalışkan, *Siyasal Tefsirin Oluşum Süreci*, 90.

²⁸ Çalışkan, *Siyasal Tefsirin Oluşum Süreci*, 91-92.

alleged to be distorted in Tafsir Qummī in accordance with the classification presented in its introduction.

1. VERSES ALLEGED TO BE DISTORTED

Qummī, in the introduction of his tafsir, says that there are extractions in some verses and adds words that are not in fact contained in these verses, claiming them to have been revealed as originally this way. Under a number of subheadings, we can give below examples concerning the expressions he incorporated into the verses:

1.1. Verses to which added the word “علي” “Alī”

According to Qummī, some wordings, were removed from The Qur'ān. One of these is the word “علي”, “Alī”. These wordings usually appear in the verses as “في علي” (on Alī), “في ولاية علي” (on Alī’s guardianship), “في حق علي” (about Alī). When examples in Qummī’s tafsir on this subject are examined, the most of allegations on distorted verses are seen to be given through mentioned narratives. The individuals informed by Qummī about addition of the word “علي” “Alī” and some instances concerning this issue are given below:

Qummī, convey that the verse “لَكِنَّ اللَّهَ يَشْهَدُ بِمَا أَنْزَلَ إِلَيْكَ أَنْزَلَهُ بِعِلْمِهِ وَالْمَلَائِكَةُ يَشْهَدُونَ وَكَفَى بِاللَّهِ شَهِيدًا” “But Allah bears witness to that which He has revealed to you. He has sent it down with His knowledge, and the angels bear witness. And sufficient is Allah as witness.” (an-Nisā’4/166) was originally revealed as “لَكِنَّ اللَّهَ يَشْهَدُ بِمَا أَنْزَلَ إِلَيْكَ - فِي عَلِيٍّ - أَنْزَلَهُ بِعِلْمِهِ وَالْمَلَائِكَةُ يَشْهَدُونَ وَكَفَى بِاللَّهِ شَهِيدًا” “But Allah bears witness to that which He has revealed to you about Alī. He has sent it down with His knowledge. with phrade “في علي” (on Alī), ” through a narrative²⁹ he grounded on a reference

²⁹ In Qummī’s tafsir, the reference chain for this narrative is as “Qummī –His father (Ibrahim b. Hashim Abu Ishaq Qummī) - Ibn Abū Umayr - Abū Basīr - Abu 'Abdillāh”.

chain that he claims extended to Abu Abdallah³⁰ by saying “... حدثني ...” “... informed me”.³¹ A number of mufasssirs (commentators) subsequent to Qummī display this verse’s form of revelation as “في علي”, referring it to Qummī.³² Mufasssirs from the sect Ulūliyyah, al-Tūsī and Ṭabrisī do not include these narratives in their commentary for the aforementioned verse. They assert that this verse to be revealed to comfort the Prophet with regard to those who denied the revelation of The Qurʾān. The verse thus means that Allah, the omnipotent, bears witness to that The Qurʾān comes from him and represents the revelations.³³ al-Ṭabarī, one of the exegetes from the first periods, interpreted aforementioned verse in the same way,³⁴ which shows that Qummī, influenced by Akhbari view, distorted the verse.

In his narration³⁵ in which he similarly says “... حدثني ...” “... informed me” while interpreting the verse “إِنَّهُ هُوَ إِلَّا عِبْدٌ أَنْعَمْنَا عَلَيْهِ وَجَعَلْنَاهُ مَثَلًا لِّبَنِي إِسْرَائِيلَ” “He, was not but a servant upon whom We bestowed favor, and We made him an example for the Children of Israel.” (az-Zukhruf 43/59), Qummī explains the distortion of the verse through the following narrative:

³⁰ Another narrative Qummi conveys is about the verse “وَلَوْ أَنَّهُمْ إِذْ ظَلَمُوا أَنفُسَهُمْ جَاءُوكَ فَاسْتَغْفَرُوا اللَّهَ وَاسْتَغْفَرَ لَهُمْ” “And if, when they wronged themselves, they had come to you, and asked forgiveness of Allah and the Messenger had asked forgiveness for them, they would have found Allah Accepting of repentance and Merciful.” (an-Nisā’ 4/64). Qummi asserts this verse to have been revealed with the expression “يا علي” as “وَلَوْ أَنَّهُمْ إِذْ ظَلَمُوا أَنفُسَهُمْ جَاءُوكَ - يا علي - فَاسْتَغْفَرُوا اللَّهَ وَاسْتَغْفَرَ لَهُمُ الرَّسُولُ” “And if, when they wronged themselves, they had come to you, [O Ali], and asked forgiveness of Allah and the Messenger had asked forgiveness for them, they would have found Allah Accepting of repentance and Merciful.” (Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 209). He says Ali is the one who is addressed by the pronoun “ك” (you) in the expression “جَاءُوكَ” in this verse. This ascription is caused by the fact that the name “الرَّسُولُ” openly follows the pronoun “ك” (you). al-Rāzī (d. 606/1209), addressing this subject in his tafsir, says that the reason for the transition from transitive expression into intransitive structure is due to Allah’s will to exalt his Messenger and He thusly says “you had asked forgiveness for them” instead of “the Messenger had asked forgiveness for them”. Because, they came to the Messenger (the authority) to whom Allah had presented prophethood and whom He had bestowed with His inspirations. Abū Abdillāh Fahr ad-dīn Muhammad b. ‘Umar ar-Rāzī, *Mafātihu-l-ghayb*, Lubnan: Dār al-Fikr, 1981, 10: 167.

³¹ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 233-234. Also see Abū al-Nadr Muhammad b. Mas‘ūd al-Ayyāshī, *Tafsīru-l-Ayyāshī* (Bairut: Muassasa al-‘Alemī, 1411/1991), 1: 311.

³² Molla Muhsin Fayz-i Kāshānī, *Tafsīru-s-sāfi* (Tahran: Maktabatu as-sadr, 1379), 1:523; Sayyid Hashim b. Sulayman al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān fi tafsīri-l-Qurʾān* (Bairut: Muassasa al-‘Alemī, 1427/2006), 2: 356; al-Arusī Huvayzī, Shayh Abd Ali b. Jum‘a, *Tafsīru Nūri-s-Sakālayn* (b.y.: Intiṣirātu Ismāiliyyān, nd.), 1: 576

³³ Abū Ja‘far Muhammad b. Hasan al-Ṭūsī, *al-Tibyān fi tafsīri-l-Qurʾān* (Bairut: Dār Ahyā al-Turāth al-‘Arabī ts), 3: 395-396; Abū Alī Fadil b. Hasan Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān fi tafsīri-l-Qurʾān* (Bairut: Dār al-murtadā, 1427/2006), 3: 202-203.

³⁴ Abū Ja‘far Muhammad b. Jarīr al-Ṭabarī, *Jāmi‘u-l-bayān ‘an ta’vīli āyi-l-Qurʾān = Tafsīru al-Ṭabarī*, ed. Abdullāh b. Abd al-muhsin al-Turkī (Qahira: Dār al-Hijr, 2001), 7: 693-694.

³⁵ The reference chain for this narrative in Qummī’s tafsir is as “Qummī - His father - Waki’ - al-A‘amash, ‘Salmah ibn Kuhayl - Abi Sadiq - Salman al-Farsi”.

“The messenger of Allah said while sitting with sahaba: ‘Now the one resembling *Īsā* ibn Maryam shall enter’. Some of those who were sitting with the messenger of Allah left in an attempt to be the one who enters. *Alī* ibn *Abū Ṭālib* entered at that moment. One said to sahaba: ‘Muhammad has not consented to *Alī* being superior to us by resembling *Īsā* ibn Maryam. I swear by Allah, our gods we prayed to in jahiliyyah (age of ignorance) are more virtuous than him.’. Allah thereupon revealed in this assembly the āyah ‘*إِنَّ هُوَ عَلِيٌّ - إِلَّا عَبْدٌ أَنْعَمْنَا عَلَيْهِ وَجَعَلْنَاهُ مَثَلًا لِّبَنِي إِسْرَائِيلَ*’, ‘*Alī*, is not but a servant upon whom We bestowed favor, and We made him an example for the Children of Israel.’. The name *Alī* in this āyah has been effaced.”³⁶ This narrative of Qummī appears in *Shī'ah* exegeses with reference to him.³⁷ As is seen, Qummī sets forth the verse referring to *Īsā* and Israelites through his narrative saying it revealed as “*إِنَّ هُوَ عَلِيٌّ - إِلَّا عَبْدٌ*”, yet the name *Alī* has been effaced from the expression “*قمحى اسمه من هذا الموضوع*”. It is not appropriate to attach the word *Alī* into the latter verse and to say that it was revealed in this way because in the continuation of the verse, the wordings “*أَنْعَمْنَا عَلَيْهِ وَجَعَلْنَاهُ مَثَلًا لِّبَنِي إِسْرَائِيلَ*” “whom We bestowed favor and We made him an example for the Children of Israel” are read. The one who is described by this expression is *Īsā*.³⁸ Mufassirs from *Uṣūliyyah*, *al-Tūsī* and *Ṭabrisī* interpreted the verse remarking that the person described in its commentary through the expression “*إِنَّ هُوَ إِلَّا عَبْدٌ*” is *Īsā*.³⁹

Another example to this subject is the 43rd verse of *az-Zukhruf*. Qummī claims this verse to have been revealed as “*فَاسْتَمْسِكْ بِالَّذِي أُوحِيَ إِلَيْكَ - فِي عَلِيٍّ - إِنَّكَ عَلَى صِرَاطٍ مُسْتَقِيمٍ*” “So adhere to that which is revealed to you - about *Alī* -. Indeed, you are on a straight path.” with the wording “*في علي*”. He claims this through the expression “Thus revealed Allah to his prophet.” which he conveyed⁴⁰ as “... *حدثني* ...” “... informed me”⁴¹. According to the latter, this verse means “You are on *Alī*’s guardianship, and *Alī* is on a straight path.”⁴² This narrative of Qummī’s is presented

³⁶ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 951.

³⁷ Fayz-i *Kāshānī*, *Tafsīru-s-sāfi*, 4: 397; *al-Bahrānī*, *al-Burhān*, 7: 142; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tefsīr*, 4: 609.

³⁸ *al-Tabarī*, *Jāmi'u-l-bayān*, 20: 629; *Abū al-Qāsim Cārullāh Maḥmūd b. 'Umar b. Ahmad al-Zamakhsharī*, *al-Kashshāf 'an hākāiki ghavāmizi al-tanzil ve 'uyūni-l-akāvil fi vujūhi't-ta'vil*, ed. 'Adil Ahmad Abd al-mavjūd, et al. (Riyād: Maktaba al-Ubayqān, 1998), 5: 452; *ar-Rāzī*, *Mafātihu-l-ghayb*, 27: 223.

³⁹ *al-Tūsī*, *al-Tibyān*, 9: 210-211; *Ṭabrisī*, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 9: 69.

⁴⁰ The reference chain for this narrative in Qummī’s tafsir is seen as “Qummī - Ja'far b. Ahmad - 'Abd al-Karim b. ibn 'Abd al-Rahim - Muhammad ibn *Alī* - Muhammad ibn *Fuḍayl* - *Abū Hamzah al-Thumālī* - *Abu Ja'far*”.

⁴¹ Referring it to the narrative he conveys by the same means, Qummī remarks the verse “*ذَلِكَ بِأَنَّهُمْ كَرِهُوا*” “That is because they disliked what Allah revealed, so He rendered worthless their deeds.” (Muhammad 47/9) to be revealed as “*ذَلِكَ بِأَنَّهُمْ كَرِهُوا مَا أَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ فِي عَلِيٍّ - فَأُخِيطَ أَعْمَالُهُمْ*” “That is because they disliked what Allah revealed -about *Alī*-, so He rendered worthless their deeds.” Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 977. See. *al-Bahrānī*, *al-Burhān*, 7: 207-208; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 5: 31.

⁴² Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 952. Similarly, another narrative Qummī conveys is about the verse *al-Aḥzāb* 33/71. He claims this verse to be revealed as “*وَمَنْ يُطِعِ اللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُ فِي وَايَةِ عَلِيٍّ وَالْإِمَامَةِ مِنْ بَعْدِهِ - فَقَدْ فَازَ فَزْرًا عَظِيمًا*” “And whoever obeys Allah and His Messenger -about the custody of *Alī* and Imams coming after him- has

in following periods with reference to him. As a matter of fact, Fayz-i Kashani (d. 1090/1679), one of the Shi'ite mufassirs, mentions this narrative while interpreting the verse, referring it to Qummī.⁴³ al-Tūsī from Uşūliyyah, however, did not designate the meaning of the verse in the way Qummī put forward “فى علي”, and interpreted it instead with a general meaning which he explains to be Allah ordained his prophet to pray to Him purely, obey His orders and abstain from what He forbade.⁴⁴

Qummī, in the examples mentioned above, asserts that there are omissions in the foregoing verses, grounding this on a reference chain, which he set forth through the wording “... حدثني...” “... informed me”, ranging from himself to the one who narrated it first – sixth Imam, Ja'far ibn Muḥammed al-Şādiq (Abu 'Abdullah) – and claims that the verses were revealed as the words “فى علي” (about Ali) incorporated into them.⁴⁵ Furthermore, Qummī claims, without showing any reference, that the verse “وَإِذَا قِيلَ لَهُمْ مَاذَا أُنزِلَ لَكُمْ قَالُوا أَسَاطِيرُ الْأَوَّلِينَ” “And when it is said to them, what has your Lord sent down? They say, legends of the former peoples,” (an-Naḥl 16/24) was revealed as “وَإِذَا قِيلَ لَهُمْ مَاذَا أُنزِلَ لَكُمْ فِى عَلِيٍّ - قَالُوا أَسَاطِيرُ الْأَوَّلِينَ” “And when it is said to them, what has your Lord sent down about Ali? They say, legends of the former peoples.” with the expression “فى علي”.⁴⁶ Exegetes holding Akhbārī ideas remarked this verse to have been revealed as above by introducing the narrative in their interpretation of the verse.⁴⁷ Uşūlites, al-Tūsī and Ṭabrisī did not mention this narrative in their commentary and stated that heathens labeled the verse as “أَسَاطِيرُ الْأَوَّلِينَ”.⁴⁸ The words “أَسَاطِيرُ الْأَوَّلِينَ” are mentioned in many verses in The Qur'ān.⁴⁹ In these verses, it is seen that mushriks (idolaters) and infidels identify the revelation as “أَسَاطِيرُ الْأَوَّلِينَ” “legends of the former peoples”. For instance, the expression “يَقُولُ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا إِنْ

certainly attained a great attainment.” Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 835. Exegetes after al-Qummī give the revelation form of the verse as the foregoing referring it to Qummī. Fayz-i Kāşānī, *Tafsīru-s-sāfi*, 4: 393; Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 6: 317; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tefsīr*, 4: 309. As is seen, the general meaning as “whoever obeys Allah and His Messenger” is distorted into “whoever obeys Allah and His Messenger about the custody of Ali and Imams coming after him” by adding the phrase “فى ولاية علي والأئمة من بعده” “the custody of Ali and Imams coming after him.

⁴³ Fayz-i Kāşānī, *Tafsīru-s-sāfi*, 4: 393. al-Bahrani and Howayzi also cited Qummī while interpreting the verse. al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 7: 129; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 4: 604.

⁴⁴ al-Tūsī, *al-Tibyān*, 9: 202. Ṭabrisī as well interpreted the mentioned verse in the same way as al-Tūsī. Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 9: 65.

⁴⁵ For the narrative Qummī conveyed using similar means see. Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 252.

⁴⁶ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 548. Inserting the words “فى علي” in it, Qummī, presents the 27th verse of the Sūrah al-Baqarah as “الَّذِينَ يَنْفُضُونَ عَهْدَ اللَّهِ مِنْ بَعْدِ مِيثَاقِهِ فِى عَلِيٍّ - وَيَقْطَعُونَ مَا أَمَرَ اللَّهُ بِهِ أَنْ يُوصَلَ” “Who break the covenant of Allah after contracting it and sever that which Allah has ordered to be joined,” without commenting on it. For the relevant examples see Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 209; 1: 384; 3: 941.

⁴⁷ al-Ayyāshī, *Tafsīru-l-Ayyāshī*, 2: 279; al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 4: 436; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 48.

⁴⁸ al-Tūsī, *al-Tibyān*, 6: 372; Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 6: 114.

⁴⁹ al-An'ām 6/25; al-Muminūn 23/83; al-Furqān 25/5; an-Naml 27/68.

هَذَا إِلَّا أَسَاطِيرُ الْأَوَّلِينَ “those who disbelieve say, this is not but legends of the former peoples.” from 25th verse of al-An‘ām are referred to the infidels.⁵⁰ Qummī, on the other hand, presents the general phrase that appear in the verse with the expression “في علي” “about Ali” and he does not claim it for the other verses holding the same phrase.⁵¹ Consequently, Qummī regards the phrase “مَاذَا أَنْزَلَ رَبُّكُمْ” “What has your Lord sent down” of above-stated verse to have an omission which he believes to be fixed by adding the word “في علي” to the verse so that the verse reads as follows “مَاذَا أَنْزَلَ رَبُّكُمْ - في علي-” “What has your Lord sent down about Ali?”.

As for the verses cited above, Qummī either alleges that the verses were revealed as above referring it to the narratives by saying “he informed me, told me,” or sometimes he describes some verses as distorted in the text without mentioning any narrative. Qummī and others involved in Akhbārī way of thinking added these words into the The Qur’ān or claimed them to have been distorted in it in an attempt to ground their political view suggesting “caliphate is the right to Alī and his descendants” in The Qur’ān. Yet the mufasssirs bound up with the Uṣūliyyah such as al-Tūsī and Ṭabrisī did not embrace these claims that the The Qur’ān were distorted through these wordings by not including the narratives in their interpretation of these verses. When aforementioned verses are examined with regard to the context, together with the verses they precede or follow, it can be understood that the words “في علي” (on Alī), “في ولاية علي” (on Alī’s guardianship), “في حق علي” (about Alī) were added to the text of The Qur’ān and thus their claims do not reflect the truth.

1.2. Verses to which the words “آل محمد” “Muhammad’s family” were added

According to Qummī, another expression extracted from The Qur’ān is “آل محمد” “the family of Muhammad”. He puts forward this allegation in different ways. He either remarks that the verse to have been revealed this way referring it to the narratives or states that the verse should be recited like this because of the style of recitation.⁵² The verse “إِنَّ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا وَظَلَمُوا” “Indeed, those who disbelieve and commit wrong - never will Allah forgive them, nor will He guide them to a path.” (an-Nisā’ 4/168) is one of the examples

⁵⁰ al-Tabarī, *Jāmi’u al-bayān*, 14: 198-199.

⁵¹ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 287; 2: 692-693; 2: 718-719; 2: 746.

⁵² There are two opposite approaches held by Shi’ite scholars with regard to the different types of recitation. During the period before Buwayhids, in which the distortion allegations were common, the people adopted an obdurate attitude towards alternative versions of The Qur’ān and rejected them. In the narrative conveyed by al-Kulayni from his teacher Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm al-Qummi, when asked about “the The Qur’ān revealed on seven letters”, Imam Ja’far replies saying “this is a lie thrown into the pot by the foes of Allah and the The Qur’ān were revealed on one letter”. In the recent periods, however, Shi’ah has abandoned the view suggesting the The Qur’ān was distorted, embracing the idea that there are lots of versions concerning this matter. For detailed information see Meir M. Bar-asher, “Imamiyye Şiasının Kıraat Farklılıkları ve Kur’ân’a İlaveleri” Translated by Ömer Kara ve Mehmet Dağ, *Ekev Dergisi* 1/3 (1998): 216.

related to this subject. Basing it on Abu 'Abdullah's recitation, Qummī interprets this verse as “إِنَّ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا وظَلَمُوا آل محمد حقهم- لَمْ يَكُنِ اللَّهُ لِيُغْفِرْ لَهُمْ وَلَا لِيَهْدِيَهُمْ طَرِيقًا” “Indeed, those who disbelieve the rights of Muhammad's family and commit wrong - never will Allah forgive them, nor will He guide them to a path” by adding the expression “قرأ أبو عبدالله”.⁵³ Shi'ite interpreters subsequent to Qummī consider this structure of the verse as a form of recitation by referring it to Qummī.⁵⁴ Shi'ite mufassir al-`Ayyashi, Qummī's contemporary, remarked this verse to have been revealed with the above expression.⁵⁵ On the contrary, mufassirs that adopted the ideas of Uşūliyyah such as al-Tūsī and Ṭabrisī didn't mention the expression “آل محمد حقهم” in the interpretation of the verse neither as a way of recitation nor as a form of revelation.⁵⁶ The foregoing fact demonstrates that the Shi'ite mufassirs who held Akhbārī thought presented their claims of distortion in the text of The Qur'ān attributing them to recitation styles.⁵⁷ This method, however, is observed to be barely included in Qummī's mentions of alleged distortion.⁵⁸

One of the methods Qummī used while claiming distortion in The Qur'ān by arguing that the words “آل محمد” “Muhammad's family” had been extracted from it are his reports referring to the preceding narratives. Qummī, for instance, explains the form of revelation of the verse “وَقَالَ الظَّالِمُونَ إِن تَتَّبِعُونَ إِلَّا رَجُلًا مَسْحُورًا” “And the wrongdoers say (to believers), You follow not but a man affected by magic.” (al-Furqan 25/8) with a reference to Abu Ja'far⁵⁹ as: “Gabriel conveyed this verse to the Messenger of Allah as ‘وَقَالَ الظَّالِمُونَ لآل محمد حقهم- إِن تَتَّبِعُونَ إِلَّا رَجُلًا مَسْحُورًا’ ‘And those who do wrong –with regard to the rights of Muhammad's family- say, You follow not but a man affected by magic.’”⁶⁰ Akhbārī mufassirs explained the verse's form of revelation

⁵³ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 234.

⁵⁴ al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 2: 356-357; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 576.

⁵⁵ al-Ayyāshī, *Tafsīru-l-Ayyāshī*, 1: 311.

⁵⁶ al-Tūsī, *al-Tibyān*, 3: 397; Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 3: 203.

⁵⁷ For detailed information relevant to this subject see. Bar-asher, “Imamiyye Şiasının Kıraat Farklılıkları ve Kur'ân'a İlaveleri”, 207-235.

⁵⁸ Qummī's tafsir includes eight examples on recitation types. He gives five of them with a reference chain or directly as Abu 'Abdillāh's recitation without mentioning the reference chain. (Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 54; 1: 121; 1: 234; 3: 1037; 3: 1180) Yet in two occasions he mentions ibn Mas'ūd's recitation. (Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 521; 2: 560) In two cases, he puts it forward with an attribution to the derivatives of the phrase “قرأ”. (Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 677; 2: 737).

⁵⁹ In Qummī's tafsir, the reference chain for this narrative is as “Qummī - Muhammad ibn Abdullah - Muhammad ibn Ḥusayn - Muhammad ibn Sinān - Ammar ibn Marwan - Jābir Yazīd ibn al-Ju'fi - Abu Ja'far”.

⁶⁰ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 719; Conveying from Abu Ja'far⁶⁰, Qummī remarks that the verse “وَلَنْ يَنْفَعَكُمْ الْيَوْمَ إِذْ ظَلَمْتُمْ” “And never will it benefit you that Day, when you have wronged, that you are [all] sharing in the punishment.” (az-Zukhruf 43/39) was in fact revealed as “وَلَنْ يَنْفَعَكُمْ الْيَوْمَ إِذْ ظَلَمْتُمْ أَنْكُم فِي الْعَذَابِ” “And never will it benefit you that Day, when you have wronged –the rights of Muhammad's family-, that you are [all] sharing in the punishment”. Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 952; Moreover, referred to

as above.⁶¹ The above-cited verse as Qummī claims was its form of revelation is given in some sources as a style of recitation.⁶² Uṣūlites didn't include the words “آل محمد حقهم” nor did they mention the view suggesting that the verse was revealed in this form on its commentary.⁶³

Qummī is also seen to have mentioned the verse using the expression “وقال الله” “Allah said” within his claims that the The Qur'ān were distorted by the removal of the words “آل محمد” “Muhammad's family” from the text of The Qur'ān without giving any reference.⁶⁴ Besides, Qummī features the verse 59 of al-Baqarah as “فَبَدَّلَ الَّذِينَ ظَلَمُوا قَوْلًا غَيْرَ الَّذِي قِيلَ لَهُمْ فَأَنْزَلْنَا عَلَىٰ آلِ مُحَمَّدٍ حَقَّهُمْ- رَجْرًا مِنَ السَّمَاءِ بِمَا كَانُوا يَفْسُقُونَ” using the expression “وقال الله” along with the wordings “آل محمد حقهم” “the rights of Muhammad's family.”⁶⁵ Following a method similar to the latter, he claims the verse “وَسَيَعْلَمُ الَّذِينَ ظَلَمُوا أَيَّ مُنْقَلَبٍ يَنْقَلِبُونَ” “Those who have wronged are going to know to what return they will be returned” (ash-Shu'arā' 26/227) to have been revealed⁶⁶ as “وَسَيَعْلَمُ الَّذِينَ ظَلَمُوا آلِ مُحَمَّدٍ حَقَّهُمْ- أَيَّ مُنْقَلَبٍ يَنْقَلِبُونَ” Those who have wronged -the rights of Muhammad's family- are going to know to what return they will be returned.” with the wording “آل محمد حقهم”.⁶⁷ In the example, Qummī remarks the verse to be revealed as above “by swearing by Allah” as “هكذا والله نزلت”.⁶⁸ We can argue that he only reflects his individual opinions as he uses neither in this expression in a narrative nor in his report about the recitation styles.

Within the examples related to this subject, the expression “آل محمد” “Muhammad's family”, which is mentioned alongside the verb “ظلم” “to be unjust to, to wrong” or its derivatives⁶⁹ in Qummī's tafsir, is alternatively associated with the verb “اصطفى” “to choose” only in the verse “إِنَّ اللَّهَ اصْطَفَىٰ آدَمَ وَنُوحًا وَآلَ إِبْرَاهِيمَ وَآلَ عِمْرَانَ عَلَى الْعَالَمِينَ” “Indeed, Allah chose Adam and Noah and the family of Abraham and the family of 'Imran over the worlds” (Āl 'Imrān 3/33). Qummī says that the verse was revealed as “إِنَّ اللَّهَ اصْطَفَىٰ آدَمَ وَنُوحًا وَآلَ إِبْرَاهِيمَ وَآلَ عِمْرَانَ وَآلَ مُحَمَّدٍ عَلَىٰ

Qummī, this narrative is contained in other sources. Fayz-i Kāshānī, *Tafsīru-s-sāfi*, 4: 392; al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 7: 126.

⁶¹ Fayz-i Kāshānī, *Tafsīru-s-sāfi*, 4: 5; al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 5: 435; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 4: 7.

⁶² al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 5: 435-436.

⁶³ al-Ṭūsī, *al-Tibyān*, 7: 473; Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 7: 205.

⁶⁴ Qummī adds the phrase “آل محمد حقهم” into the text of the verse in some cases using the expression “وقال” without mentioning any narrative and in others without using any wordings For the examples relevant to this see Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 310; 2: 447; 3: 865; 3: 940; 3: 941; 3: 1010; 3: 1018.

⁶⁵ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 79; Besides, the verse was also mentioned to have been revealed in this form. Fayz-i Kāshānī, *Tafsīru-s-sāfi*, 1: 136.

⁶⁶ Ṭabrisī (d. 548/1154), one of the Shi'ite mufassirs, reports this form of the verse to be a form of recitation. Abū Alī Fadil b. Hasan Ṭabrisī, *Tafsīru javāmiu al-jāmi* (Qum: Muassasa al-Nashri al-Islāmī, 1423), 2: 695.

⁶⁷ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 740; Qummī's claim is also included in the other Shi'ah sources. Fayz-i Kāshānī, *Tafsīru-s-sāfi*, 4: 57; al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 5: 519; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 73-74.

⁶⁸ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 740;

⁶⁹ For the other relevant examples see Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 310; 2: 608; 3: 933; 3: 1010; 3: 1018.

“الْعَالَمِينَ” “Indeed, Allah chose Adam and Noah and the family of Abraham and the family of 'Imran and the family of Muhammad over the worlds” claiming the words “وآل محمد” to have been removed from the book.⁷⁰ al-'Ayyashi, who held Akhbārī ideas and lived in the same period as Qummī, identified this claim as a revelation form of the verse.⁷¹ Shi'ite Akhbārī exegetes that lived after Qummī state the verse to be revealed this way referring to Qummī.⁷² However, Shi'ite exegetes al-Tūsī and Ṭabrisī, who adopted Uṣūlites ideas, note that this is how Ahl al-Bayt recite it, which means they classify it as a recitation style.⁷³ This fact can be noticed when the aforementioned verses in general are examined together. They incorporate their sectarian views into the text of The Qur'ān either as the original revelation form of the verse or its style of recitation.

1.3. Verses to Which Some Wordings Apart from “في علي” “About Alī” and “آل محمد” “Muhammad’s family” are Added

Qummī, remarks that several expressions other than “في علي” “about Alī” and “آل محمد” “Muhammad’s family” were added to some verses which he claims to be revealed that way. A part of these wordings added to the verses appear within other sources as a different way of reading i.e. style of recitation. To exemplify, citing Abu Ja'far, Qummī gives the verse “فَمَا اسْتَمْتَعْتُمْ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ فَآتُوهُنَّ أُجُورَهُنَّ فَرِيضَةً” “So for whatever you enjoy from them, give them their due compensation as an obligation.” (an-Nisā' 4/24) as “فَمَا اسْتَمْتَعْتُمْ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ إِلَى أَجَلٍ مُّسَمًّى - فَآتُوهُنَّ أُجُورَهُنَّ” “So for whatever you enjoy from them -for a certain period of time-, give them their due compensation as an obligation.” claiming it to be the verification for mut'ah marriage.⁷⁴ al-'Ayyashi, who held Akhbārī notions and was a contemporary to Qummī, mentions this form of the verse as Abu Ja'far's recitation.⁷⁵ Yet Uṣūlites, al-Tūsī and Ṭabrisī, present this as the way of recitation of Ibn al-'Abbas, Ibn Mas'ūd (d. 32/652-53), Sa'id bin Jubayr (d. 95/714) and a group from Tabi'un.⁷⁶ Sunnī mufassirs such as al-Ṭabarī (d. 310/923),⁷⁷ al-Zamakhshari (d. 538/1144),⁷⁸ al-Rāzī⁷⁹ and al-Māturīdī (d. 333/944)⁸⁰ consider the foregoing verse as the recitation of Ubbay ibn Ka'ab (d. 33/654) and Ibn al-'Abbas (d. 68/687-88). As is seen, those who embraced the Akhbārī view refer their sectarian beliefs, which suggest that either this is how the verse

⁷⁰ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 151

⁷¹ al-Ayyāshī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 193.

⁷² al-Ayyāshī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 193; al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 2: 23; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 330.

⁷³ al-Tūsī, *al-Tibyān*, 2: 441; Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 2: 225; Javāmiu al-jāmi, 1: 279.

⁷⁴ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 198.

⁷⁵ al-Ayyāshī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 260.

⁷⁶ al-Tūsī, *al-Tibyān*, 3: 166; Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 3: 51; Javāmiu al-jāmi, 1: 388- 389.

⁷⁷ al-Ṭabarī, *Jāmi'u al-bayān*, 6: 587-589.

⁷⁸ al-Zamakhsharī, *Kashshāf*, 2: 57.

⁷⁹ al-Rāzī, *Mafātihu-l-ghayb*, 10: 53.

⁸⁰ Abū Mansūr Muhammad b. Mahmūd al-Māturīdī, *Ta'vilātu ahl al-sunna* (Bairut: Dār al kutub al-'ilmiyye, 2005), 3: 116.

originally revealed or how Abu Ja'far recited it, to the The Qur'an; while Uşūliyyah mentioned this verse in the same manner as the Sunnī mufassirs, accrediting above recitation to sahaba.

The verse “إِنَّ السَّاعَةَ آتِيَةٌ أَكَادُ أَخْفِيهَا” “Surely the Hour is coming up-I would almost conceal it.” (Ṭā-Hā 20/15) is another example to this subject. Conveying from Ali Ibn Ibrahim, Qummī notes the revelation form of the verse as “إِنَّ السَّاعَةَ آتِيَةٌ أَكَادُ أَخْفِيهَا مِنْ نَفْسِي” “Surely the Hour is coming up-I would almost conceal it from my own soul.”⁸¹ Mufassirs subsequent to Qummī also assert the verse to have been revealed as above, referring it to Qummī.⁸² The expression “من نفسي”, which al-Qummī argues to be a part of the verse, are remarked in a number of sources as a recitation style. One of the mufassirs from Uşūliyyah sect, Ṭabrisī mentions this form of the verse as the recitation of Ubbay ibn Ka'ab.⁸³ Likewise, Sunnī mufassirs al-Māturīdī,⁸⁴ al-Zamakhsharī,⁸⁵ and al-Rāzī⁸⁶ consider it to be Ubbay ibn Ka'ab's recitation, grounding it on his muṣḥaf. al-Ṭabarī, on the other hand, presents the verse with the expression “it is recited in this way in some recitations”.⁸⁷

The verse “النَّبِيُّ أَوْلَىٰ بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ مِنْ أَنفُسِهِمْ وَأَزْوَاجُهُ أُمَّهَاتُهُمْ” “The Prophet is more worthy of the believers than themselves, and his wives are their mothers.” (al-Aḥzāb 33/6) is also discussed in this regard. Adding the words “وهو أب لهم”, Qummī says the verse to be revealed as “النَّبِيُّ أَوْلَىٰ بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ مِنْ أَنفُسِهِمْ وَأَزْوَاجُهُ أُمَّهَاتُهُمْ -وهو أب لهم” “The Prophet is more worthy of the believers than themselves, and his wives are their mothers, -and He is their father-.”⁸⁸ The wordings remarked to be a part of the verse by Qummī are designated by Shi'ite interpreter Ṭabrisī as the recitation of Ubbay, ibn Mas'ūd, ibn Abbas, Muḥammad al-Baqir (pbuh) and Ja'far al-Ṣādiq (pbuh).⁸⁹ Though in some sources, this recitation is seen as “النَّبِيُّ أَوْلَىٰ بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ مِنْ أَنفُسِهِمْ وَهُوَ أَبُو لَهُمْ” “The Prophet is more worthy of the believers than themselves, and his wives are their mothers, -and He is their father-.”⁹⁰ al-Māturīdī gives this recitation relating it to Ubbay, ibn Mas'ūd and ibn Abbas.⁹¹

The verse “وَأَمَّا الْغُلَامُ فَكَانَ أَبَوَاهُ مُؤْمِنِينَ” “And as for the boy, his parents were believers,” (al-Kahf 18/80) is also cited among the examples related to this matter.⁹² Qummī remarks the latter

⁸¹ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 642.

⁸² al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 5: 167; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 375.

⁸³ Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 7: 11; Javāmiu al-jāmi, 2: 478.

⁸⁴ al-Māturīdī, *Ta'vīlāt*, 7: 273.

⁸⁵ al-Zamakhsharī, *Kashshāf*, 4: 73.

⁸⁶ al-Rāzī, *Mafātiḥu-l-ghayb*, 22: 22.

⁸⁷ al-Ṭabarī, *Jāmi'u al-bayān*, 16: 35.

⁸⁸ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 809. See. al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 6: 221-222; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 4: 237.

⁸⁹ Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 8: 93; Javāmiu al-jāmi, 3: 49.

⁹⁰ al-Ṭabarī, *Jāmi'u al-bayān*, 19: 16; al-Māturīdī, *Ta'vīlāt*, 8: 354; al-Zamakhsharī, *Kashshāf*, 5: 50.

⁹¹ al-Māturīdī, *Ta'vīlāt*, 8: 354.

⁹² Another examples to this matter is the verse “فَلَمَّا خَرَّ تَبَيَّنَتِ الْجِنُّ أَنْ لَوْ كَانُوا يَعْلَمُونَ الْغَيْبَ مَا لَبِثُوا فِي الْعَذَابِ الْمُهِينِ” “But when Solomon's body fell, it became clear to the jinn that if they had known the unseen, they would not have remained in humiliating punishment..” (Saba' 34/14). After noting the verse to have been revealed as “فَلَمَّا خَرَّ -على وجهه- تَبَيَّنَتِ -الانس- أَنْ لَوْ كَانُوا -أي الجن- يَعْلَمُونَ الْغَيْبَ مَا لَبِثُوا فِي الْعَذَابِ الْمُهِينِ” “But

to have been revealed as “وَأَمَّا الْغُلَامُ فَكَانَ أَبَوَاهُ مُؤْمِنَيْنِ وَهُوَ طَبِيعَ كَافِرًا” “And as for the boy, his parents were believers, yet he was sealed as infidel”.⁹³ Shi'ite mufassir living in the period subsequent to Qummī and linked to Akhbārī thought, Arūsī al-Ḥuwayzī states the verse's form of revelation as above by referring it to Qummī.⁹⁴ al-Tūsī and Ṭabrisī introduce the verse in the form “واما والغلام فكان كافرا وكان ابواه مؤمنين” “And as for the boy, he was infidel, his parents were believers,” as the recitation of Ubbay and ibn Abbas who were among the sahāba.⁹⁵ al-Ṭabarī and al-Māturidī show this recitation with a reference to Ubbay ibn Ka'ab.⁹⁶

As understood from the examples given above, phrases mentioned to be of different ways of recitation within Shi'ah interpretations associated with Uṣūliyyah view, are reported by Qummī as original form of revelation. This demonstrates that while alleging distortion in the text of The Qur'ān, Qummī does not mention ways of recitation a lot, which is one of the methods appealed notably by other Shi'ite mufassirs, and usually remarks them as the form of revelation.⁹⁷

2. VERSES CLAIMED TO BE CONTRARY TO WHAT ALLAH REVEALED

In his introduction, Qummī reports a number of verses to be in a form contrary to what Allah revealed, presenting examples relevant to this matter in diverse ways. He occasionally

when Solomon's body fell, it became clear to the people that if the jinn had known the unseen, they would not have remained in humiliating punishment.”, Qummī says: “Because people said that the jinn knew the unseen. When Solomon fell, people understood that if the jinn had known the unseen, they wouldn't have known the year in which Solomon was actually dead yet they thought him to have been alive.” (Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 838.) Qummī's this comment are given in later works with a reference to him. (al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 6: 329-330; Arūsī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 4: 326.) Describing it as Ahl al-Bayt's recitation, al-Tūsī presents the verse as “فلما خر تبينت الانس أن لو كان الجن يعلمون الغيب ما لبثوا في العذاب المهين” “It became clear to the people that if the jinn had known the unseen, they would not have remained in humiliating punishment.” (al-Ṭūsī, *al-Tibyān*, 8: 384.) al-Māturidī and al-Zamakhsharī offer the verse as “فلما خر تبينت الانس على أن الجن لو كانوا يعلمون الغيب ما لبثوا في العذاب المهين” reporting it to be ibn Mas'ūd's recitation. (al-Māturidī, *Ta'vīlāt*, 8: 435; al-Zamakhsharī, *Kashshāf*, 5: 114; al-Ṭabarī introduces the style of recitation of the verse saying “it is this way in some recitations” without ascribing it to an individual. al-Ṭabarī, *Jāmi'u al-bayān*, 19: 243.)

⁹³ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 614; Also see al-Qurtubī (ö. 671/1273), Qummī, remarking the expression he gives as the verse's form of revelation to be as “أَنَّهُ طَبِيعَ يَوْمِ طَبِيعِ كَافِرًا” “When the seal affixed about this child, he was sealed to be an infidel” within Ṣaḥīḥ Hadith, says that this expression supports the view that the child was not pubescent. Abū Abdillāh Muhammad b. Ahmad b. Abī Bakr al-Qurtubī, *al-Jāmi' al-ahkāmī al-Qur'ān e'l-mübeyn limâ tedammenehû mine's-sünneti ve âyi'l-furkân*, thk. Abdullāh b. Abdü'l-Muhsin al-Turkī (Bairut: Muassasa al-Risāla, 2006), 13: 352.

⁹⁴ Arūsī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 283.

⁹⁵ al-Ṭūsī, *al-Tibyān*, 7: 81; Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 6: 287; *Javāmiu al-jāmi*, 2: 430-431.

⁹⁶ al-Ṭabarī, *Jāmi'u al-bayān*, 15: 357; al-Māturidī, *Ta'vīlāt*, 7: 200.

⁹⁷ For other examples on this subject see Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 424; 2: 493; 2: 494; 2: 587; 2: 614; 2: 628; 2: 697; 2: 738; 3: 1019; 3: 1044; 3: 1128; 3: 1166.

cites that he interrupted when someone recited in his presence by saying “the verse was revealed this way”. He sometimes claims that the verses were revealed in a different form as he found them improper with regard to their meaning or sometimes merely claims that the verse revealed this way. Below examples can be cited on this subject:

When interpreting the verse “كُنْتُمْ خَيْرَ أُمَّةٍ أُخْرِجَتْ لِلنَّاسِ تَأْمُرُونَ بِالْمَعْرُوفِ وَتَنْهَوْنَ عَنِ الْمُنْكَرِ” “You are the best nation produced for mankind. You enjoin what is right and forbid what is wrong and believe in Allah” (Āl ‘Imrān 3/110), Qummī conveys the following narrative of Abu ‘Abdillāh with the expression “حدثني أبي” “my father has informed me” as: “Abu ‘Abdillāh said to those who recited this verse “Best nation that killed the emir of the believers, Hasan and Husain?”. When asked “how this verse was revealed”, he replied “it was revealed as ‘كُنْتُمْ خَيْرَ أُمَّةٍ أُخْرِجَتْ لِلنَّاسِ’ ‘You are the best imams produced for the mankind. Don’t you see? Allah praises them at the end saying ‘You enjoin what is right and forbid what is wrong and believe in Allah.’”⁹⁸ Contemporary to Qummī, al-‘Ayyāshī from Akhbāriyyah says in a similar way that this verse was revealed to Muhammad about his tutelary as “كُنْتُمْ خَيْرَ أُمَّةٍ أُخْرِجَتْ لِلنَّاسِ” and Muhammad and his guardians are meant.⁹⁹ One of the Shi’ite mufassirs subsequent to Qummī, al-Bahrānī remarked the verse in his work to be as above without relating the narrative, referring it to Abu ‘Abdillāh.¹⁰⁰ Similar to the foregoing, another example in which the word “أُمَّةٍ” is distorted to “أُمَّةٍ” is the verse “أَنْ تَكُونَ أُمَّةً هِيَ أَرْبَى مِنْ أُمَّةٍ” “Because one community is more plentiful than another community.” (an-Nahl, 16/92). Qummī relates the Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm’s narrative within his claims of distortion in the verse. According to his narration, this verse is as “أَنْ تَكُونَ أُمَّةً هِيَ” “Because the Imams are smarter than your imams.” When he told “lo the son of the Messenger of Allah, we recite this verse as “هِيَ أَرْبَى مِنْ أُمَّةٍ”, he replied “shame on you! What is “أَرْبَى” supposed to mean? and motioned the word to be removed.¹⁰¹ Akhbāri exegetes mention this narrative on their tafsir citing Qummī.¹⁰² As for Uṣūlite exegetes, ruling out the narrative, did not remark the verse to have been revealed in this form.¹⁰³ The word “أُمَّةٍ” are mentioned in many verses in the The Qur’ān aside from these two.¹⁰⁴ In some of these verses, Qummī interprets the wording “أُمَّةٍ” as “أُمَّةٍ” “imams”, for example, in the verses “وَكَذَلِكَ جَعَلْنَاكُمْ أُمَّةً وَسَطًا” “And thus we have made you a just community,” (al-Baqarah 2/143), “فَكَيْفَ إِذَا جِئْنَا مِنْ كُلِّ أُمَّةٍ بِشَهِيدٍ” “So how will it be when We bring from every nation a witness and we bring you, against these as a witness?” (an-Nisā’ 4/41),¹⁰⁵ while in the verses “وَلَتَكُنْ مِنْكُمْ أُمَّةٌ يَدْعُونَ إِلَىٰ

⁹⁸ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 164.

⁹⁹ al-Ayyāshī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 219.

¹⁰⁰ al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān* 2: 89.

¹⁰¹ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 557.

¹⁰² al-Ayyāshī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 290-291; al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 4: 479-480; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 82.

¹⁰³ al-Ṭūsī, *al-Tibyān*, 6:422; Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 6: 148.

¹⁰⁴ al-Baqarah 2/128; 2/134; 2/141; 2/143; an-Nisā’ 4/41; al-‘Al-i ‘Imrān 3/104.

¹⁰⁵ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 198; 1: 203.

وَمِمَّنْ خَلَقْنَا أُمَّةً يَهْتَدُونَ” (Āl ‘Imrān 3/104), “الخَيْرِ” “And let there be from you a nation inviting to good,” (Āl ‘Imrān 3/104), “بِالْحَقِّ وَبِهِ يَعْدِلُونَ” “And among those We created is a community which guides by truth and thereby establishes justice.” (al-A‘rāf 7/181), he expounds the wording “أُمَّةً” as “The family of Muhammad and those guided by it” yet does not remark the cited verses to be revealed as containing these wordings.¹⁰⁶ The foregoing fact demonstrates that Qummī and others that likewise embraced the Akhbārī view either by transforming the word structure of “أُمَّةً” into “أُمَّةً” and claiming the verse to be revealed containing the latter or by interpreting the wording “أُمَّةً” as “imams and the family of Muhammad”. In other words, they ground the imamate doctrine of their sects on the The Qur’ān by either interpreting the verses precariously, i.e. inward distortion, or distorting the wordings and asserting them to be revealed that way.

The verse “لَهُ مُعَقِّبَاتٌ مِنْ بَيْنِ يَدَيْهِ وَمِنْ خَلْفِهِ يَحْفَظُونَهُ مِنْ أَمْرِ اللَّهِ” “For each one are angels before and behind him who protect him by the decree of Allah.” (ar-Ra‘d 13/11) as well exemplifies the foregoing subject. Regarding this verse, Qummī sets forth the narrative conveyed from Abu ‘Abdillāh. Here it is worth noting that as for the narratives about distortion allegations, Qummī sometimes mentions the reference chain extending to Abu ‘Abdillāh or sometimes narrates them at first hand as if he has heard them. Also in the latter verse, he conveys the Abu ‘Abdillāh’s narrative from the first person.¹⁰⁷ According to his narrative, when the verse was recited near Abu ‘Abdillāh, he said to the reader “Aren’t you an Arab? How can a follower be before, he is supposed to be behind” and when the reader asked how can it be, he replied saying the verse to have been revealed as “لَهُ مُعَقِّبَاتٌ مِنْ خَلْفِهِ وَرَقِيبٍ مِنْ بَيْنِ يَدَيْهِ يَحْفَظُونَهُ بِأَمْرِ اللَّهِ” “For each one are sentinels before and followers behind him who protect him by the decree of Allah.” In addition, he states that the expression “مِنْ أَمْرِ اللَّهِ”, which appears in the verse, should be as “بِأَمْرِ اللَّهِ”, explaining that no one is powerful enough to protect something from the order of Allah.¹⁰⁸ Shi’ite mufassirs that held the same thoughts as Qummī - Akhbārī- also mention the verse to be

¹⁰⁶ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 162-163; 1: 362.

¹⁰⁷ Another narrative that Qummī conveys using same means is about the verse “وَالَّذِينَ يَقُولُونَ رَبَّنَا هَبْ لَنَا مِنْ “أَزْوَاجِنَا وَذُرِّيَّاتِنَا فُرَّةً أَعْيُنٍ وَاجْعَلْ لَنَا مِنَ الْمُنْفِقِينَ إِمَامًا” “And those who say, "Our Lord, grant us from among our wives and offspring comfort to our eyes and make us an example for the righteous.” (al-Furqan 25/74.). Qummī claims that when this verse was read near Abu ‘Abdillāh, he replied “They ask Allah for a great favor, praying Him to bestow imam upon those who abstain from disobeying Allah”, whereon having asked “how this verse was revealed”, he said the verse to had been revealed as “وَالَّذِينَ يَقُولُونَ رَبَّنَا هَبْ لَنَا “مِنْ أَزْوَاجِنَا وَذُرِّيَّاتِنَا فُرَّةً أَعْيُنٍ وَاجْعَلْ لَنَا مِنَ الْمُنْفِقِينَ إِمَامًا” “And those who say, "Our Lord, grant us from among our wives and offspring comfort to our eyes and grant us an example from the righteous.” (Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 728.) The information suggesting the verse to have been revealed this way is also included in other Shi‘ah tafsirs. (Ṭabrisī, *Javāmiu al-jāmi*, 2: 664; al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 5: 479-480; al-Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 4: 43.) Relating it to Ahl al-Bayt’s form of recitation, Ṭabrisī gives the verse as “وَاجْعَلْ لَنَا مِنَ الْمُنْفِقِينَ إِمَامًا” (Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 7: 228.)

¹⁰⁸ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 512. For another example narrated through a similar method see Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 180.

revealed as above.¹⁰⁹ Bound up in Uṣūliyyah, Ṭabrisī mentions three forms of recitation related to the verse, which are “لَهُ مَعَاqIB مَن بَيْنَ يَدَيْهِ وَرَقَبَاءُ مَن خَلْفَهُ يَحْفَظُونَهُ بِأَمْرِ اللَّهِ” “لَهُ مَعْقِبَاتٌ مِّنْ خَلْفِهِ وَرَقِيبٌ مِّنْ بَيْنِ” “لَهُ رَقِيبٌ مِّنْ بَيْنِ يَدَيْهِ وَمُعَقِّبَاتٌ مِّنْ خَلْفِهِ يَحْفَظُونَهُ بِأَمْرِ اللَّهِ” and “يَدَيْهِ يَحْفَظُونَهُ بِأَمْرِ اللَّهِ” classifying them as exceptional.¹¹⁰

Qummī shares the following narrative conveyed from Abu 'Abdillāh, related to the fact that the verse “هَذَا كِتَابُنَا يُنطِقُ عَلَيْكُم بِالْحَقِّ” “This, Our Book, pronounces against you with the truth,” (al-Jāthiyah 45/29) was revealed in a different form through the reference,¹¹¹ which he mentions by using the expression “... حدثنا ...” “... narrated us”: “Surely, the Book have not spoken, nor it will. But the Messenger of Allah is the one who speaks with the Book. Allah the almighty ordained “هَذَا كِتَابُنَا يُنطِقُ عَلَيْكُم بِالْحَقِّ” “This, Our Book, makes you speak the truth”. Thereupon, when said that it is not the original version of the verse he replied as “Gabriel thusly revealed the verse to Muhammad. Hence the verse being different is a distortion from the book of Allah.”¹¹² It understood that, Qummī demonstrates the distortion on the book of Allah through the expression “ولكنه فيما حرف من كتاب الله” “It is a distortion from the book of Allah.”, basing it on the latter narrative. This narrative, which he presents in his tafsir, is given in the Shi'ah sources with a reference to Qummī,¹¹³ which indicates him to have been a baseline for the later works. Finally Ṭabrisī, Usūlite, argues the verse given as the form of revelation by Qummī to be the different way of recitation.¹¹⁴

3. VERSES WITH WORDS CLAIMED TO HAVE BEEN TRANSPOSED

Another element included in Qummī's claims of distortion is the transposition between the words of the verses. After noting a transposition between the wordings contained in the verses, he asserts the verse to be in fact different from how it was revealed. He makes his allegations as the form of revelation based on a narrative he conveys or puts it forward without mentioning any narrative. He, for instance, alleges there was a transposition between the words “وَأَسْجُدِي - وَارْكَعِي” seen in the verse “يَا مَرْيَمُ اقْنُتِي لِرَبِّكِ وَأَسْجُدِي وَارْكَعِي مَعَ الرَّاكِعِينَ” “O Mary, be devoutly obedient to your Lord and prostrate and bow with those who bow” (Āl 'Imrān 3/43), and asserts the original form of the verse to be as “يَا مَرْيَمُ اقْنُتِي لِرَبِّكِ وَارْكَعِي وَأَسْجُدِي مَعَ الرَّاكِعِينَ” “O Mary, be devoutly obedient to your Lord and bow and prostrate with those who bow”.¹¹⁵ Another example which Qummī claims to have transposed words is the verse “وَقَالُوا مَا هِيَ إِلَّا حَيَاتُنَا الدُّنْيَا نَمُوتُ”

¹⁰⁹ al-Ayyāshī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 219; al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 4: 255-256.

¹¹⁰ Ṭabrisī, one of the Shi'ite mufassirs, Ṭabrisī, *Javāmiu al-jāmi*, 2: 253; *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 6: 12.

¹¹¹ In Qummī's tafsir, the reference chain for this narrative is as “Qummī - Muhammad ibn Hammam - Ja'far ibn Muḥammad al-Fazārī - Al-Ḥasan ibn Alī - Al-Ḥasan ibn Ayyūb - Suleiman ibn Saleh - Abū Baṣīr - Abu 'Abdillāh”.

¹¹² Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 966-967.

¹¹³ al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 7: 181-182; al-Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 5: 5.

¹¹⁴ Ṭabrisī, *Javāmiu al-jāmi*, 3: 340.

¹¹⁵ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 1: 152.

“وَنَحْيَا” “And they say, There is not but our worldly life; we die and live,” (al-Jāthiyah 45/24).¹¹⁶ According to Qummī, there is a transposition between the words “نَمُوتُ وَنَحْيَا” “we die and live”. He expounds his claim by saying there is no resurrection after death in the worldly life. The verse thereby is supposed to be as “وَقَالُوا مَا هِيَ إِلَّا حَيَاتُنَا الدُّنْيَا نَمُوتُ وَنَحْيَا” “There is not but our worldly life; we live and die.”¹¹⁷ As is seen, taking the factual formation into account in the mentioned examples, Qummī claims that the verse should be in an order as “نَحْيَا وَنَمُوتُ” “we live and die”. His claim, however, can be refuted easily by paying attention to the use of the word “نَمُوتُ وَنَحْيَا” in the The Qur'ān. In fact, the expression is used in the The Qur'ān in the order “نَمُوتُ وَنَحْيَا” “we die and live” in the verse “إِنَّ هِيَ إِلَّا حَيَاتُنَا الدُّنْيَا نَمُوتُ وَنَحْيَا” “Life is not but our worldly life - we die and live.” (al-Mu'minūn 23/37).¹¹⁸

Qummī also features the allegation of distortion over transpositions in the text through a narrative he passes on. Applying the foregoing method for the verse “أَفَمَنْ كَانَ عَلَىٰ بَيِّنَةٍ مِنْ رَبِّهِ وَيَتْلُوهُ” “So is one who stands upon a clear evidence from his Lord? And a witness from Him follows it, and before it was the Scripture of Moses to lead and as mercy. Those believe in it” (Hud 11/17), he conveys a narrative from Abu Ja'far with a reference chain as “حدثني أبي” “my father informed me” argues that “Transposition was done in this verse during its compilation. The verse was revealed as “أَفَمَنْ كَانَ عَلَىٰ بَيِّنَةٍ مِنْ رَبِّهِ -يعنى رسول الله-” “So is one who stands upon a clear evidence from his Lord? And a witness from Him follows it, and before it was –the emir of the believers- and the Scripture of Moses to lead and as mercy. Those believe in it.”¹¹⁹ When we examine how the expression “إِمَامًا وَرَحْمَةً” is used in The Qur'ān, in the verse “وَمِنْ قَبْلِهِ كِتَابُ مُوسَىٰ أَوَّلِيكَ يُؤْمِنُونَ بِهِ” “And before it was the scripture of Moses to lead and as a mercy” also refers to the book that was revealed to Moses (al-Aḥqāf 46/12). While in the verses we mentioned the book that was revealed to Moses is described as “a leader and mercy”, Qummī claims these expressions are attributed to the pronoun “منه” i.e. Alī. The foregoing shows that apart from

¹¹⁶ Another relevant example can be the verse “وَقَالَ الَّذِينَ أُوتُوا الْعِلْمَ وَالْإِيمَانَ لَقَدْ لَبِئْتُمْ فِي كِتَابِ اللَّهِ إِلَىٰ يَوْمِ الْبَعْثِ” “But those who were given knowledge and faith will say, "You remained the extent of Allah 's decree until the Day of Resurrection,” (ar-Rūm 30/56). al-Qummī claims it to be as “وَقَالَ الَّذِينَ أُوتُوا الْعِلْمَ وَالْإِيمَانَ فِي كِتَابِ” “But those who were given knowledge and faith the extent of Allah 's decree will say, "You remained until the Day of Resurrection. Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 787; His claim also can be seen in later sources. al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 6: 165-166; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 4: 192. Ṭabrisī remarked a transposition within the verse using “قيل”. see Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 8: 57. For another example he conveyed using the same method see Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 601.

¹¹⁷ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 965-966; Qummī's claim is also mentioned in other sources. see Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 9: 101; al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 7: 180; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 5: 3.

¹¹⁸ A derivative of this expression also appears in the same order in 44th verse of the Sūrat an-Najm.

¹¹⁹ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 465; Also see al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 2: 89; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 2: 345.

interpreting the verses by incorporating Ahl al-Bayt into the The Qur'ān, he also distorts the text of The Qur'ān by transposing the words included in the verses.

Another method Qummī adopts while expressing his claims of transposition in The Qur'ānic text is his remarks suggesting the verse to have been revealed that way. For instance, he claims that there was a transposition in the commentary between the words of the verse “وَجَاءَتْ سَكْرَةُ الْمَوْتِ بِالْحَقِّ” “And the intoxication of death will bring the truth” (al-Kahf 50/19) and argues the verse to have been revealed as “وَجَاءَتْ سَكْرَةُ الْمَوْتِ بِالْحَقِّ” “And the death and the true intoxication will come.”¹²⁰ Akhbārīs succeeding Qummī give the revelation of the verse as above citing Qummī.¹²¹ Uşūlites, al-Tūsī and Ṭabrisī remark that this form of the verse to be Ahl al-Bayt's recitation.¹²² al-Ṭabarī attributes the recitation to Abū Bakr (d. 13/634),¹²³ whereas al-Zamakhshari mentions the verse as the recitation of Abū Bakr and ibn Mas'ud.¹²⁴ As is seen, this verse, which was reported to be a different way of recitation in other exegeses, appears as a form of revelation in the claims of Qummī, who held Akhbārī view.

CONCLUSION

Qummī, who is considered among the first period Shi'ite scholars with Akhbārī view and whose tafsir is regarded to be the main resource for Shi'ah, reflects a mere ideology concerning the representation of political tafsir. Aside from that, he interpreted the verses as he wished in order to ground the teachings of his sect on the Qur'ān, and he went further by claiming that these teachings were in fact contained in the Qur'ān. He thereby presents his claims that the text of the Qur'ān has been distorted in his introduction and mentions these allegations of distortion while interpreting the aforementioned verses.

In his tafsir, Qummī claims 62 verses to be distorted in the text of the Qur'ān. He presents his claim by adding the wordings “في علي” (about Ali), “آل محمد حقهم” (the rights of Muhammad's family) and some other words aside from the two phrase and by asserting the verses to be contrary to what Allah revealed and by noting transpositions between the words of the verses. Qummī intends to prove his claims of distortion through diverse means. The first method he follows within this context is to claim the verses to be revealed in that way, in which he sometimes mentions the reference chain ranging to the person that narrated the verse first, who is the sixth imam, Ja'far ibn Muḥammed al-Şādiq (Abu 'Abdillāh), with the expression “... حدثني” “... informed me” and sometimes he only cites Imam Ja'far without giving the reference chain. The number of the verses he thusly claims to be distorted is 35. The second method he employs to establish evidence for his claims of distortion is to mention a verse consonant with

¹²⁰ Qummī, *Tafsīr*, 3: 1004.

¹²¹ al-Bahrānī, *al-Burhān*, 7: 291; Arusī Huvayzī, *Tafsīr*, 5: 111.

¹²² al-Tūsī, *al-Tibyān*, 9: 366; Ṭabrisī, *Mujmau-l-bayān*, 9: 181.

¹²³ al-Ṭabarī, *Jāmi'u al-bayān*, 21: 427.

¹²⁴ al-Zamakhshari, *Kashshāf*, 5: 598.

his evidence after noting the verse's original form to be different. He does not use the method of conveying a lot for the second method. There are only 18 verses he gives in this method. The third means adopted by him is to designate the attached wordings as different ways of recitation. Qummī's tafsir holds 9 examples relating to the types of recitation. He puts forward most of these examples either with a reference chain or with an attribution to Ja'far ibn Muḥammad al-Şādiq (Abu 'Abdillāh) without mentioning the reference chain. In addition, the expressions considered to be different forms of recitation in Shī'ah tafsirs appear as the verse's form of revelation in Qummī's claims, which demonstrates that while expressing his claims of distortion on the text of the Qur'ān, Qummī does not include manners of recitation a lot, which is one of the methods appealed greatly by other Shi'ite mufasssirs,

While expounding his claims of distortion in the text of the Qur'ān, Qummī uses several expressions, which are “نزل جبرائيل بهذه الآية هكذا” “the verse was revealed this way”, “نزل جبرائيل بهذه الآية هكذا” “Gabriel revealed the verse this way”, “أوحى الله إلى نبيه” “Allah thusly revealed to his messenger”. He at times sets forth the expressions “ولكنه فيما حرف من كتاب الله” “that is a distortion from the Book of Allah” after claiming distortions in the text of the Qur'ān, “فمعى اسمه من هذا الموضع” “His name has been deleted from this” after adding the word Alī, or “فأسقطوا آل محمد من الكتاب” “the family of Muhammad has been extracted from the Book” after inserting the words “the family of Muhammad”. Taking the factual order into consideration, he also occasionally remarks that there are transpositions between the words of the verses and that the stated verse was revealed in a different form. He, furthermore, mentions Shī'ah's imamate theory as a Qur'ānic wording after distorting, for instance, the word “أُمَّة” “ummah” into “أئمة” “Imams”.

Through all of these additions and alterations, Qummī, who holds Akhbārī ideas, sought to attach importance to Ahl al-Bayt by integrating it into the text of the Qur'ān, to submit evidence for the fact that the family of Muhammad i.e. Ahl al-Bayt was chosen, to demonstrate that the sect's prophetic and imamate theory is not only a Qur'ānic commentary but also a Qur'ānic wording and to ground the sect's teachings and jurisprudential laws on the Qur'ān by claiming them to be present in it. Moreover, he intends to base the claim that the family of Muhammad were persecuted and their rights were usurped on the Qur'ān. As a conclusion, Qummī's claims of distortion, which he mentioned in his tafsir under the influence of Shī'ah ideology, are observed to have influenced other Shi'ite exegetes that lived after him and held Akhbārī point of view. The fact that Shi'ite scholars such as Fayḍ Kashānī, al-Bahrānī, 'Arūsī al-Ḥuwayzī etc. mentioned these claims in the same manner during the interpretation of the verses by referring them to Qummī thereby backs the foregoing argument. Those who sought to transform the Qur'ān into a book that supports their own ideologies thusly asserted the claims of distortion. However, Al-Qur'an al-Kareem nullifies these efforts with its verse “إِنَّا نَحْنُ نَزَّلْنَا الذِّكْرَ وَإِنَّا لَهُ لَحَافِظُونَ” “Indeed, it is We who sent down the Qur'an and indeed, We will be its guardian.” (al-Ḥijr 15/9).

REFERENCES

- Ateş, Süleyman. "İmâmiyye Şiasının Tefsir Anlayışı". *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 20 (1975): 147-172.
- al-Arusî Huvayzî, Shayh Abd Alî b. Jum'a. *Tafsîru Nûri-s-Sakâlayn*. 5 vol. Qum: Intişirātu İsmâiliyyân, nd.
- al-Ayyâshî, Abû an-Nadr Muhammad b. Mas'ûd. *Tafsîru-l-Ayyâshî*. 2 vol. Bairut: Muassasa al-'Alemî, 1411/1991.
- al-Ayâzî, Sayyid Muhammad Alî. *al-Mufasssîrûn hayatuhum ve manhacuhum*. Tahran: Vizaretu as-Saqafati wa-l-irşâdi-l-İslâmî, 1373.
- al-Bahrânî, Sayyid Hashim b. Sulayman. *al-Burhân fi tafsîri-l-Qur'ân*. 8 vol. Bairut: Muassasa al-'Alemî, 1427/2006.
- Bar-asher, Meir M. "İmamiyye Şiasının Kiraat Farklılıkları ve Kur'ân'a İlaveleri". Translated by Ömer Kara ve Mehmet Dağ. *Ekev Dergisi* 1/ 3 (1998): 207-235.
- Buhl, Frants. "Tahrif". *İslam Ansiklopedisi*. c. 11: 667. Istanbul: Meb Publication, 1979.
- Cerrahoğlu, İsmail. *Tefsir Tarihi I*. 2 vol. Ankara: Fecr Publication, 1996.
- Çalışkan, İsmail. *Siyasal Tefsirin Oluşum Süreci*. Ankara: Ankara Okulu Publication, 2003.
- ad- Dāvūdî, Shams al- Dîn Muhammad b. Alî b. Ahmad. *Tabakât al-mufasssîrîn*. 2 vol. Bairut: Dâr al kutub al-'ilmiyye, 1403/1983.
- Fayz-i Kâshânî, Molla Muhsin. *Tafsîru-s-sâfi*. 5 vol. Tahran: Maktabatu as-sadr, 1379.
- Habibov, Aslan. *İlk dönem Şii Tefsir Anlayışı*. PhD diss., Ankara University, 2007.
- İbn Hajar, Ahmad b. Alî b. al-Asqalânî. *Lisân al-mizân*. Bairut: Dâr al-beshâir al-'İslâmiyya, 1423/2002.
- İbn Manzûr, Jamâl al-Dîn Abû l-Faḍl Muḥammad b. Mukarram b. 'Alî b. Aḥmad. *Lisân al-'Arab*. 6 vol. Cahira: Dâr al-Maârif, 1119.
- Qummî, Abû al-Hasan Alî b. İbrâhîm. *Tafsîr al-Qummî*. 3 vol. Qum: Muassasu al-İmâm al-Mahdî, 1435.
- al-Qurtubî, Abû Abdillâh Muhammad b. Ahmad b. Abî Bakr. *al-Jâmilî-ahkâmî al-Qur'ân e'l-mübeyn limâ tedammenehû mine's-sünneti ve âyi'l-furkân*. edited by Abdullâh b. Abdü'l-Muhsin al-Turkî. 24 vol. Bairut: Muassasa al-Risâla, 2006.
- Ma'rifa, Muhammad Hâdî. *at-Tafsîr wa-l-mufasssîrûn fi sevbih al-qashib*. 2 vol. Mashhad: al-Jâmiat ar-Ridâviyye li-l-'Ulûm al-İslamiyye, 1425.
- al-Mâturîdî, Abû Mansûr Muhammad b. Mahmûd. *Ta'vilât ahl as-sunna*. 10 vol. Bairut: Dâr al kutub al-'ilmiyye, 2005.
- an-Najashî, Abû al-Abbâs Ahmad b. Alî b. Ahmad. *Rijâl an-Nejashî*. Bairut: s.n., nd.
- Nuvayhid, Adil. *Mu'jem al-mufasssîrîn min sadr al-islâm hatta al-asr al-hadîr*. ed. Hasan Halid. 2 vol. Muassasa Nuvayhid as- Saqâfiyye, 1403/1983.
- Öz, Mustafa. "Usûliyye". *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi*. 42: 214-215. Istanbul: TDV Publication, 2012.

- Öztürk, Mustafa. "Şîf-îmâmî Tefsir Kültürünün Genel Karakteristikleri". *Tarihten Günümüze Kur'ân'a Yaklaşımlar*. İstanbul: İlim Yayma Vakfı Kur'an ve Tefsir Akademisi Publication, 2010.
- Raghib al-İşfahânî, Abū al-Qāsim Husayn bin Muhammad. *Mufradātu alfāzi al-Qur'ân*. ed. Safvān Adnān Dāvūdî. Dimashk: Dār al Qalem, 1412.
- ar- Rāzî, Abū Abdillāh Fahr ad-dīn Muhammad b. 'Umar. *Mafātihu-l-ghayb*. 32 vol. Lubnan: Dār al-Fikr, 1981.
- al-Tabarî, Abū Ja'far Muhammad b. Jarîr. *Jāmi'u-l-bayān 'an ta'vili āyi-l-Qur'ân = Tafsîru al-Tabarî*. ed. Abdullāh b. Abd al-muhsin al-Turkî. 26 vol. Qahira: Dār al-Hijr, 2001.
- Tabersî, Ebū Alî Fazıl b. Hasan. *Tefsîru cevâmiu'l-câmî*. 3 vol. Kum: Müessesetü'n-neşri'islâmî, 1423.
- Ṭabrisî, Abū Alî Fadil b. Hasan. *Tafsîru javâmiu al-jâmî*. 3 vol. Qum: Muassasa al-Nashri al-İslâmî, 1423.
- Ṭabrisî, Abū Alî Fadil b. Hasan. *Mujmau-l-bayān fî tafsîri-l-Qur'ân*. 10 vol. Bairut: Dār al-murtadā, 1427/2006.
- Tarakcı, Muhammet. "Tahrif". *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi*. 39: 422. İstanbul: TDV Publication, 2010.
- al-Ṭūsî, Abū Ja'far Muhammad b. Hasan. *al-Fihrist*. Najaf: al-Maktabatu al-Murtazāviyye, nd.
- al-Ṭūsî, Abū Ja'far Muhammad b. Hasan. *al-Tibyān fî tafsîri-l-Qur'ân*. 10 vol. Bairut: Dār Ahyā al-Turāth al-'Arabî, nd.
- Uyar, Mazlum. İmâmîyye Şîasi'nda Ahbârîlik. PhD diss., Dokuz Eylül University, 1996.
- Yurdagür, Metin. "Ahbârîyye". *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi*. 1: 490-491. İstanbul: TDV Publication, 1988.
- Zahîr, İhsan İlâhî. *Şîa'nun Kur'an, İmâmet ve Takiyye Anlayışı*. trc. Sabri Hizmetli et al. Ankara: Afşaroğlu Matbaası, 1984.
- al-Dhahabî, Abū 'Abd Allāh Shams al- Dīn Muhammad b. Ahmad b. 'Uthmān. *Mizān al-i'tidāl fî naqdi ar-rijāl*. ed. 'Adil Ahmad 'Abd al-Mavjūd Abd al-Mavjūd et al. 8 vol. Bairut: Dār al kutub al-'ilmiyye, 1416/1995.
- al-Dhahabî, Muhammad Husayn. *al-Tafsîr wa-l-mufasssîrûn*. 2 vol. Cairo: Maktabatu Wahba, nd.
- al-Zamakhshari, Abū al-Qāsim Maḥmūd b. 'Umar. *Asāsu al-Balāghā*. ed. Muhammad Bāsil. 2 vol. Bairut: Dār al kutub al-'ilmiyye, 1419/1998.
- al-Zamakhshari, Abū al-Qāsim Cārullāh Maḥmūd b. 'Umar b. Ahmad. *al-Kashshāf 'an hākāiki ghavāmizi al-tanzil ve 'uyūni-l-akāvil fî vujūhi't-ta'vil*. ed. 'Adil Ahmad Abd al-mavjūd, et al. 6 vol. Riyād: Maktaba al-Ubayqān, 1998.