



# On $\mathcal{I}_2$ -Convergence and $\mathcal{I}_2^*$ -Convergence of Double Sequences in Fuzzy Normed Spaces

Erdinç Dündar<sup>1\*</sup> and Muhammed Recai Türkmen<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Mathematics, Faculty of Science and Literature, Afyon Kocatepe University, 03200, Afyonkarahisar, Turkey

<sup>2</sup>Department of Mathematics, Faculty of Education, Afyon Kocatepe University, 03200, Afyonkarahisar, Turkey

\*Corresponding author E-mail: [edundar@aku.edu.tr](mailto:edundar@aku.edu.tr)

## Abstract

In this paper first, we investigate some properties of  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -convergence in fuzzy normed spaces. After, we study some relationships between  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -convergence and  $\mathcal{I}_2^*$ -convergence of double sequences in fuzzy normed spaces.

**Keywords:** Double sequences,  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -convergence,  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -Cauchy, Fuzzy normed space.

**2010 Mathematics Subject Classification:** 34C41, 40A35, 40G15

## 1. Introduction and Background

Throughout the paper  $\mathbb{N}$  and  $\mathbb{R}$  denote the set of all positive integers and the set of all real numbers, respectively. The concept of convergence of a sequence of real numbers has been extended to statistical convergence independently by Fast [11] and Schoenberg [30]. A lot of developments have been made in this area after the various studies of researchers [21, 25]. The idea of  $\mathcal{I}$ -convergence was introduced by Kostyrko et al. [15] as a generalization of statistical convergence which is based on the structure of the ideal  $\mathcal{I}$  of subset of the set of natural numbers  $\mathbb{N}$ . Das et al. [3] introduced the concept of  $\mathcal{I}$ -convergence of double sequences in a metric space and studied some properties of this convergence. A lot of developments have been made in this area after the works of [4, 16, 27, 31].

The concept of ordinary convergence of a sequence of fuzzy numbers was firstly introduced by Matloka [18] and proved some basic theorems for sequences of fuzzy numbers. Nanda [23] studied the sequences of fuzzy numbers and showed that the set of all convergent sequences of fuzzy numbers are a complete metric space. Şençimen and Pehlivan [29] introduced the notions of statistically convergent sequence and statistically Cauchy sequence in a fuzzy normed linear space. Hazarika [13] studied the concepts of  $\mathcal{I}$ -convergence,  $\mathcal{I}^*$ -convergence and  $\mathcal{I}$ -Cauchy sequence in a fuzzy normed linear space. Dündar and Talo [8, 9] introduced the concepts of  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -convergence and  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -Cauchy sequence for double sequences of fuzzy numbers and studied some properties and relations of them. Hazarika and Kumar [14] introduced the notion of  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -convergence and  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -Cauchy double sequences in a fuzzy normed linear space. A lot of developments have been made in this area after the various studies of researchers [17, 20, 32, 26].

Now, we recall the concept of ideal, convergence, statistical convergence, ideal convergence of sequence, double sequence and fuzzy normed and some basic definitions (see [1, 2, 5, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12, 19, 20, 21, 22, 24, 25, 28, 29]).

Fuzzy sets are considered with respect to a nonempty base set  $X$  of elements of interest. The essential idea is that each element  $x \in X$  is assigned a membership grade  $u(x)$  taking values in  $[0, 1]$ , with  $u(x) = 0$  corresponding to nonmembership,  $0 < u(x) < 1$  to partial membership, and  $u(x) = 1$  to full membership. According to Zadeh [33], a fuzzy subset of  $X$  is a nonempty subset  $\{(x, u(x)) : x \in X\}$  of  $X \times [0, 1]$  for some function  $u : X \rightarrow [0, 1]$ . The function  $u$  itself is often used for the fuzzy set.

A fuzzy set  $u$  on  $\mathbb{R}$  is called a fuzzy number if it has the following properties:

1.  $u$  is normal, that is, there exists an  $x_0 \in \mathbb{R}$  such that  $u(x_0) = 1$ ;
2.  $u$  is fuzzy convex, that is, for  $x, y \in \mathbb{R}$  and  $0 \leq \lambda \leq 1$ ,  $u(\lambda x + (1 - \lambda)y) \geq \min[u(x), u(y)]$ ;
3.  $u$  is upper semicontinuous;
4.  $\text{supp } u = \text{cl}\{x \in \mathbb{R} : u(x) > 0\}$ , or denoted by  $[u]_0$ , is compact.

Let  $L(\mathbb{R})$  be set of all fuzzy numbers. If  $u \in L(\mathbb{R})$  and  $u(t) = 0$  for  $t < 0$ , then  $u$  is called a non-negative fuzzy number. We write  $L^*(\mathbb{R})$  by the set of all non-negative fuzzy numbers. We can say that  $u \in L^*(\mathbb{R})$  iff  $u_{\alpha} \geq 0$  for each  $\alpha \in [0, 1]$ . Clearly we have  $\bar{0} \in L(\mathbb{R})$ . For

$u \in L(\mathbb{R})$ , the  $\alpha$  level set of  $u$  is defined by

$$[u]_\alpha = \begin{cases} \{x \in \mathbb{R} : u(x) \geq \alpha\}, & \text{if } \alpha \in (0, 1] \\ \text{supp } u, & \text{if } \alpha = 0. \end{cases}$$

A partial order  $\preceq$  on  $L(\mathbb{R})$  is defined by  $u \preceq v$  if  $u_\alpha^- \leq v_\alpha^-$  and  $u_\alpha^+ \leq v_\alpha^+$  for all  $\alpha \in [0, 1]$ . Arithmetic operation for  $t \in \mathbb{R}$ ,  $\oplus, \ominus, \odot$  and  $\otimes$  on  $L(\mathbb{R}) \times L(\mathbb{R})$  are defined by

$$(u \oplus v)(t) = \sup_{s \in \mathbb{R}} \{u(s) \wedge v(t-s)\}, \quad (u \ominus v)(t) = \sup_{s \in \mathbb{R}} \{u(s) \wedge v(s-t)\},$$

$$(u \odot v)(t) = \sup_{s \in \mathbb{R}, s \neq 0} \{u(s) \wedge v(t/s)\} \text{ and } (u \otimes v)(t) = \sup_{s \in \mathbb{R}} \{u(st) \wedge v(s)\}.$$

For  $k \in \mathbb{R}^+$ ,  $ku$  is defined as  $ku(t) = u(t/k)$  and  $0u(t) = \tilde{0}$ ,  $t \in \mathbb{R}$ .

Some arithmetic operations for  $\alpha$ -level sets are defined as follows:

$u, v \in L(\mathbb{R})$  and  $[u]_\alpha = [u_\alpha^-, u_\alpha^+]$  and  $[v]_\alpha = [v_\alpha^-, v_\alpha^+]$ ,  $\alpha \in (0, 1]$ . Then,

$$[u \oplus v]_\alpha = [u_\alpha^- + v_\alpha^-, u_\alpha^+ + v_\alpha^+], \quad [u \ominus v]_\alpha = [u_\alpha^- - v_\alpha^+, u_\alpha^+ - v_\alpha^-],$$

$$[u \odot v]_\alpha = [u_\alpha^- \cdot v_\alpha^-, u_\alpha^+ \cdot v_\alpha^+] \text{ and } [\tilde{1} \otimes u]_\alpha = \left[ \frac{1}{u_\alpha^+}, \frac{1}{u_\alpha^-} \right], \quad u_\alpha^- > 0.$$

For  $u, v \in L(\mathbb{R})$ , the supremum metric on  $L(\mathbb{R})$  defined as

$$D(u, v) = \sup_{0 \leq \alpha \leq 1} \max \{ |u_\alpha^- - v_\alpha^-|, |u_\alpha^+ - v_\alpha^+| \}.$$

It is known that  $D$  is a metric on  $L(\mathbb{R})$  and  $(L(\mathbb{R}), D)$  is a complete metric space.

A sequence  $x = (x_k)$  of fuzzy numbers is said to be convergent to the fuzzy number  $x_0$ , if for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists a positive integer  $k_0$  such that  $D(x_k, x_0) < \varepsilon$  for  $k > k_0$  and a sequence  $x = (x_k)$  of fuzzy numbers convergent to levelwise to  $x_0$  if and only if  $\lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} [x_k]_\alpha = [x_0]_\alpha$

and  $\lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} [x_k]_\alpha = [x_0]_\alpha^+$ , where  $[x_k]_\alpha = [(x_k)_\alpha^-, (x_k)_\alpha^+]$  and  $[x_0]_\alpha = [(x_0)_\alpha^-, (x_0)_\alpha^+]$ , for every  $\alpha \in (0, 1)$ .

Let  $X$  be a vector space over  $\mathbb{R}$ ,  $\|\cdot\| : X \rightarrow L^*(\mathbb{R})$  and the mappings  $L; R$  (respectively, left norm and right norm) :  $[0, 1] \times [0, 1] \rightarrow [0, 1]$  be symmetric, nondecreasing in both arguments and satisfy  $L(0, 0) = 0$  and  $R(1, 1) = 1$ .

The quadruple  $(X, \|\cdot\|, L, R)$  is called fuzzy normed linear space (briefly *FNS*) and  $\|\cdot\|$  a fuzzy norm if the following axioms are satisfied

1.  $\|x\| = \tilde{0}$  iff  $x = 0$ ,
2.  $\|rx\| = |r| \odot \|x\|$  for  $x \in X$ ,  $r \in \mathbb{R}$ ,
3. For all  $x, y \in X$ 
  - (a)  $\|x+y\|(s+t) \geq L(\|x\|(s), \|y\|(t))$ , whenever  $s \leq \|x\|_1^-, t \leq \|y\|_1^-$  and  $s+t \leq \|x+y\|_1^-$ ,
  - (b)  $\|x+y\|(s+t) \leq R(\|x\|(s), \|y\|(t))$ , whenever  $s \geq \|x\|_1^+, t \geq \|y\|_1^+$  and  $s+t \geq \|x+y\|_1^+$ .

Let  $(X, \|\cdot\|_C)$  be an ordinary normed linear space. Then, a fuzzy norm  $\|\cdot\|$  on  $X$  can be obtained by

$$\|x\|(t) = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } 0 \leq t \leq a\|x\|_C \text{ or } t \geq b\|x\|_C \\ \frac{t}{(1-a)\|x\|_C} - \frac{a}{1-a}, & \text{if } a\|x\|_C \leq t \leq \|x\|_C \\ \frac{t}{(b-1)\|x\|_C} + \frac{b}{b-1}, & \text{if } \|x\|_C \leq t \leq b\|x\|_C \end{cases}$$

where  $\|x\|_C$  is the ordinary norm of  $x (\neq 0)$ ,  $0 < a < 1$  and  $1 < b < \infty$ . For  $x = 0$ , define  $\|x\| = \tilde{0}$ . Hence,  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  is a fuzzy normed linear space.

Let us consider the topological structure of an *FNS*  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$ . For any  $\varepsilon > 0, \alpha \in [0, 1]$  and  $x \in X$ , the  $(\varepsilon, \alpha)$ -neighborhood of  $x$  is the set  $\mathcal{N}_x(\varepsilon, \alpha) = \{y \in X : \|x-y\|_\alpha^+ < \varepsilon\}$ .

Let  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  be an *FNS*. A sequence  $(x_n)_{n=1}^\infty$  in  $X$  is convergent to  $x \in X$  with respect to the fuzzy norm on  $X$  and we denote by  $x_n \xrightarrow{FN} x$ , provided that  $(D) - \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \|x_n - x\| = \tilde{0}$ ; i.e., for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there is an  $N(\varepsilon) \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $D(\|x_n - x\|, \tilde{0}) < \varepsilon$  for all  $n \geq N(\varepsilon)$ . This means that for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there is an  $N(\varepsilon) \in \mathbb{N}$  such that for all  $n \geq N(\varepsilon)$ ,  $\sup_{\alpha \in [0, 1]} \|x_n - x\|_\alpha^+ = \|x_n - x\|_0^+ < \varepsilon$ .

Let  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  be an *FNS*. Then a double sequence  $(x_{jk})$  is said to be convergent to  $x \in X$  with respect to the fuzzy norm on  $X$  if for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exist a number  $N = N(\varepsilon)$  such that  $D(\|x_{jk} - x\|, \tilde{0}) < \varepsilon$ , for all  $j, k \geq N$ .

In this case, we write  $x_{jk} \xrightarrow{FN} x$ . This means that, for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exist a number  $N = N(\varepsilon)$  such that  $\sup_{\alpha \in [0, 1]} \|x_{jk} - x\|_\alpha^+ = \|x_{jk} - x\|_0^+ < \varepsilon$ ,

for all  $j, k \geq N$ . In terms of neighborhoods, we have  $x_{jk} \xrightarrow{FN} x$  provided that for any  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a number  $N = N(\varepsilon)$  such that  $x_{jk} \in \mathcal{N}_x(\varepsilon, 0)$ , whenever  $j, k \geq N$ .

Let  $X \neq \emptyset$ . A class  $\mathcal{I}$  of subsets of  $X$  is said to be an ideal in  $X$  provided:

- (i)  $\emptyset \in \mathcal{I}$ ,
- (ii)  $A, B \in \mathcal{I}$  implies  $A \cup B \in \mathcal{I}$ ,
- (iii)  $A \in \mathcal{I}, B \subset A$  implies  $B \in \mathcal{I}$ .

$\mathcal{I}$  is called a nontrivial ideal if  $X \notin \mathcal{I}$ . A nontrivial ideal  $\mathcal{I}$  in  $X$  is called admissible if  $\{x\} \in \mathcal{I}$  for each  $x \in X$ .

A nontrivial ideal  $\mathcal{I}_2$  of  $\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}$  is called strongly admissible if  $\{i\} \times \mathbb{N}$  and  $\mathbb{N} \times \{i\}$  belong to  $\mathcal{I}_2$  for each  $i \in \mathbb{N}$ . It is evident that a strongly admissible ideal is also admissible. Throughout the paper we take  $\mathcal{I}_2$  as a strongly admissible ideal in  $\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}$ .

Let  $\mathcal{I}_2^0 = \{A \subset \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : (\exists m(A), (i, j) \geq m(A) \Rightarrow (i, j) \notin A)\}$ . Then  $\mathcal{I}_2^0$  is a nontrivial strongly admissible ideal and clearly an ideal  $\mathcal{I}_2$  is strongly admissible if and only if  $\mathcal{I}_2^0 \subset \mathcal{I}_2$ .

Let  $X \neq \emptyset$ . A non empty class  $\mathcal{F}$  of subsets of  $X$  is said to be a filter in  $X$  provided:

- (i)  $\emptyset \notin \mathcal{F}$ ,
- (ii)  $A, B \in \mathcal{F}$  implies  $A \cap B \in \mathcal{F}$ ,
- (iii)  $A \in \mathcal{F}, A \subset B$  implies  $B \in \mathcal{F}$ .

Let  $\mathcal{I}$  is a nontrivial ideal in  $X, X \neq \emptyset$ , then the class  $\mathcal{F}(\mathcal{I}) = \{M \subset X : (\exists A \in \mathcal{I})(M = X \setminus A)\}$  is a filter on  $X$ , called the filter associated with  $\mathcal{I}$ .

Let  $(X, \rho)$  be a linear metric space and  $\mathcal{I}_2 \subset 2^{\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}}$  be a strongly admissible ideal. A double sequence  $x = (x_{mn})$  in  $X$  is said to be  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -convergent to  $L \in X$ , if for any  $\varepsilon > 0$  we have  $A(\varepsilon) = \{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : \rho(x_{mn}, L) \geq \varepsilon\} \in \mathcal{I}_2$  and we write  $\mathcal{I}_2 - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L$ .

If  $\mathcal{I}_2 \subset 2^{\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}}$  is a strongly admissible ideal, then usual convergence implies  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -convergence.

Let  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  be a fuzzy normed space. A double sequence  $x = (x_{mn})_{(m,n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}}$  in  $X$  is said to be  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -convergent to  $L_1 \in X$  with respect to fuzzy norm on  $X$  if for each  $\varepsilon > 0$ , the set  $A(\varepsilon) = \{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : \|x_{mn} - L_1\|_0^+ \geq \varepsilon\} \in \mathcal{I}_2$ . In this case, we write  $x_{mn} \xrightarrow{F\mathcal{I}_2} L_1$  or  $x_{mn} \rightarrow L_1 (F\mathcal{I}_2)$  or  $F\mathcal{I}_2 - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L_1$ . The element  $L_1$  is called the  $F\mathcal{I}_2$ -limit of  $(x_{mn})$  in  $X$ . In terms of neighborhoods, we have

$x_{mn} \xrightarrow{F\mathcal{I}_2} L_1$  provided that for each  $\varepsilon > 0$ ,  $\{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : x_{mn} \notin \mathcal{N}_{L_1}(\varepsilon, 0)\} \in \mathcal{I}_2$ . A useful interpretation of the above definition is the following;

$$x_{mn} \xrightarrow{F\mathcal{I}_2} L_1 \Leftrightarrow F\mathcal{I}_2 - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} \|x_{mn} - L_1\|_0^+ = 0.$$

Note that  $F\mathcal{I}_2 - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} \|x_{mn} - L_1\|_0^+ = 0$  implies that

$$F\mathcal{I}_2 - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} \|x_{mn} - L_1\|_\alpha^- = F\mathcal{I}_2 - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} \|x_{mn} - L_1\|_\alpha^+ = 0,$$

for each  $\alpha \in [0, 1]$ , since  $0 \leq \|x_{mn} - L_1\|_\alpha^- \leq \|x_{mn} - L_1\|_\alpha^+ \leq \|x_{mn} - L_1\|_0^+$  holds for every  $m, n \in \mathbb{N}$  and for each  $\alpha \in [0, 1]$ .

Let  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  be a fuzzy normed space. A double sequence  $x = (x_{mn})$  in  $X$  is said to be  $\mathcal{I}_2^*$ -convergent to  $L$  in  $X$  with respect to the fuzzy norm on  $X$  if there exists a set  $M \in \mathcal{F}(\mathcal{I}_2), M = \{m_1 < \dots < m_k < \dots; n_1 < \dots < n_l < \dots\} \subset \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}$  such that  $\lim_{k,l \rightarrow \infty} \|x_{m_k n_l} - L\|$ . In this

case, we write  $x_{mn} \xrightarrow{F\mathcal{I}_2^*} L_1$  or  $x_{mn} \rightarrow L_1 (F\mathcal{I}_2^*)$  or  $F\mathcal{I}_2^* - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L_1$ .

We say that an admissible ideal  $\mathcal{I}_2 \subset 2^{\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}}$  satisfies the property (AP2), if for every countable family of mutually disjoint sets  $\{A_1, A_2, \dots\}$  belonging to  $\mathcal{I}_2$ , there exists a countable family of sets  $\{B_1, B_2, \dots\}$  such that  $A_j \cap B_j \in \mathcal{I}_2^0$ , i.e.,  $A_j \cap B_j$  is included in the finite union of rows and columns in  $\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}$  for each  $j \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $B = \bigcup_{j=1}^\infty B_j \in \mathcal{I}_2$  (hence  $B_j \in \mathcal{I}_2$  for each  $j \in \mathbb{N}$ ).

**Lemma 1.1.** ([14], Theorem 3.7) Let  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  be fuzzy normed space,  $\mathcal{I}_2$  be a admissible ideal and  $(x_{mn})$  be a double sequence in  $X$ . Then,  $x_{mn} \xrightarrow{\mathcal{I}_2^*} L_1$  implies  $x_{mn} \xrightarrow{\mathcal{I}_2} L_1$ .

**Lemma 1.2.** ([14], Theorem 3.8) Let  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  be fuzzy normed space,  $\mathcal{I}_2$  be a admissible ideal with property (AP2) and  $(x_{mn})$  be a double sequence in  $X$ . Then,  $x_{mn} \xrightarrow{\mathcal{I}_2} L_1$  if and only if  $x_{mn} \xrightarrow{\mathcal{I}_2^*} L_1$ .

## 2. Main Results

In this section first, we investigate some properties of  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -convergence in fuzzy normed spaces. After, we study some relationships between  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -convergence and  $\mathcal{I}_2^*$ -convergence of double sequences in fuzzy normed spaces.

**Theorem 2.1.** Let  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  be a fuzzy normed space. If a double sequence  $(x_{mn})$  in  $X$  is  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -convergent to  $L_1$ , then  $L_1$  determined uniquely.

*Proof.* Let  $(x_{mn})$  be any double sequence and suppose that

$$F\mathcal{I}_2 - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L_1 \text{ and } F\mathcal{I}_2 - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L_2,$$

where  $L_1 \neq L_2$ . Since  $L_1 \neq L_2$ , we may suppose that  $L_1 > L_2$ . Select  $\varepsilon = \frac{L_1 - L_2}{3}$ , so that the neighborhoods  $(L_1 - \varepsilon, L_1 + \varepsilon)$  and  $(L_2 - \varepsilon, L_2 + \varepsilon)$  of  $L_1$  and  $L_2$  respectively are disjoint. Since  $L_1$  and  $L_2$  both are  $\mathcal{I}_2$ -limit of the sequence  $(x_{mn})$ . Therefore, both the sets

$$A(\varepsilon) = \{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : \|x_{mn} - L_1\|_0^+ \geq \varepsilon\} \text{ and } B(\varepsilon) = \{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : \|x_{mn} - L_2\|_0^+ \geq \varepsilon\}$$

belongs to  $\mathcal{I}_2$ . This implies that the sets

$$A^c(\varepsilon) = \{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : \|x_{mn} - L_1\|_0^+ < \varepsilon\} \text{ and } B^c(\varepsilon) = \{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : \|x_{mn} - L_2\|_0^+ < \varepsilon\}$$

belongs to  $\mathcal{F}(\mathcal{I}_2)$ . Since  $\mathcal{F}(\mathcal{I}_2)$  is a filter on  $\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}$  therefore  $A^c(\varepsilon) \cap B^c(\varepsilon)$  is a non-empty set in  $\mathcal{F}(\mathcal{I}_2)$ . In this way we obtain a contradiction to the fact that the neighborhoods  $(L_1 - \varepsilon, L_1 + \varepsilon)$  and  $(L_2 - \varepsilon, L_2 + \varepsilon)$  of  $L_1$  and  $L_2$ , respectively, are disjoint. Hence, we have  $L_1 = L_2$ . □

**Theorem 2.2.** Let  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  be a fuzzy normed space,  $(x_{mn})$  be a double sequence in  $X$  and  $L_1 \in X$ . Then,  $FP - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L_1 \Rightarrow F\mathcal{I}_2 - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L_1$ .

*Proof.* Let  $FP - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L_1$ . For  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists a positive integer  $k_0 = k_0(\varepsilon)$  such that  $\|x_{mn} - L_1\|_0^+ < \varepsilon$ , whenever  $m, n > k_0$ . This implies that the set

$$A(\varepsilon) = \{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : \|x_{mn} - L_1\|_0^+ \geq \varepsilon\} \subset (\mathbb{N} \times \{1, 2, \dots, k_0\}) \cup (\{1, 2, \dots, k_0\} \times \mathbb{N}).$$

Since  $\mathcal{I}_2$  is a admissible ideal, then

$$(\mathbb{N} \times \{1, 2, \dots, k_0\}) \cup (\{1, 2, \dots, k_0\} \times \mathbb{N}) \in \mathcal{I}_2$$

and so  $A(\varepsilon) \in \mathcal{I}_2$ . Hence, we have

$$F\mathcal{I}_2 - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L_1.$$

□

**Theorem 2.3.** Let  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  be a fuzzy normed space.

- (i) If  $X$  has no accumulation point, then  $F\mathcal{S}_2$ -convergence and  $F\mathcal{S}_2^*$ -convergence coincide for each strongly admissible ideal  $\mathcal{S}_2$ .
- (ii) If  $X$  has an accumulation point  $L$ , then there exists a strongly admissible ideal  $\mathcal{S}_2$  and a double sequence  $(x_{mn})$  for which  $F\mathcal{S}_2$ - $\lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L$  but  $F\mathcal{S}_2^*$ - $\lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn}$  does not exist.

*Proof.* (i) Let  $x = (x_{mn})$  be a double sequence in  $X$  and  $L \in X$ . By Lemma 1.1,  $x_{mn} \xrightarrow{F\mathcal{S}_2^*} L_1$  implies  $x_{mn} \xrightarrow{F\mathcal{S}_2} L_1$ . Assume that  $F\mathcal{S}_2$ - $\lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L$ . Since  $X$  has no accumulation point, so there exists  $\varepsilon > 0$  such that

$$B_L(\varepsilon, 0) = \{x \in X : \|x - L\|_0^+ < \varepsilon\} = \{L\}.$$

Since  $F\mathcal{S}_2$ - $\lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L$ , so

$$\{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : \|x_{mn} - L\|_0^+ \geq \varepsilon\} \in \mathcal{S}_2.$$

Hence, we have

$$\{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : \|x_{mn} - L\|_0^+ < \varepsilon\} = \{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : \|x_{mn} - L\|_0^+ = 0\} \in \mathcal{F}(\mathcal{S}_2).$$

Therefore,  $F\mathcal{S}_2^*$ - $\lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L$ .

- (ii) Since  $L$  is an accumulation point of  $X$ , so there exists a sequence  $(t_i)_{i \in \mathbb{N}}$  of distinct points all different from  $L$  in  $X$  which is convergent to  $L$  such that the sequence  $\{\|t_i - L\|_0^+\}_{i \in \mathbb{N}}$  is decreasing to 0. Let  $\{T_i\}_{i \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a decomposition of  $\mathbb{N}$  onto infinite sets and put  $\Delta_i = \{(m, n) : \min\{m, n\} \in T_i\}$ . Then,  $\{\Delta_i\}_{i \in \mathbb{N}}$  is a decomposition of  $\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}$  and the ideal

$$\mathcal{S}_2 = \{A : A \text{ is included in a finite union of } \Delta_i\}$$

is a strongly admissible ideal. Put  $x_{mn} = t_i$  if and only if  $(m, n) \in \Delta_i$ . Put  $s_n = \{\|t_n - L\|_0^+\}$ , for  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Let  $\delta > 0$  be given. Select  $\gamma \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $s_\gamma < \delta$ . Then,

$$A(\delta) = \{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : \|x_{mn} - L\|_0^+ \geq \delta\} \subset \Delta_1 \cup \Delta_2 \cup \dots \cup \Delta_\gamma.$$

Hence,  $A(\delta) \in \mathcal{S}_2$  and  $F\mathcal{S}_2$ - $\lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L$ .

Now suppose that  $F\mathcal{S}_2^*$ - $\lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L$ . Then, there exists  $H \in \mathcal{S}_2$  such that for  $M = \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} \setminus H$  we have  $FP$ - $\lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L$ , for  $(m, n) \in M$ . By definition of the ideal  $\mathcal{S}_2$ , there exists  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  such that

$$H \subset \Delta_1 \cup \Delta_2 \cup \dots \cup \Delta_k.$$

But then,  $\Delta_{k+1} \subset \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} \setminus H = M$ . Then, from the construction of  $\Delta_{k+1}$  it follows that for any  $n_0 \in \mathbb{N}$ ,

$$\|x_{mn} - L\|_0^+ = s_{k+1} > 0$$

hold for infinitely many  $(m, n)$ 's with  $(m, n) \in M$  and  $m, n \geq n_0$ . This contradicts that  $FP$ - $\lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L$ , for  $(m, n) \in M$ . Also the assumption  $F\mathcal{S}_2^*$ - $\lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = q$ , for  $q \neq L$  leads to the contradiction.  $\square$

**Theorem 2.4.** Let  $(X, \|\cdot\|)$  be a fuzzy normed space. If  $X$  has at least one accumulation point and for any arbitrary double sequence  $(x_{mn})$  of elements of  $X$  and for each  $L \in X$ ,  $F\mathcal{S}_2$ - $\lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L$  implies  $F\mathcal{S}_2^*$ - $\lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L$ , then  $\mathcal{S}_2$  has the property (AP2).

*Proof.* Assume that  $L \in X$  is an accumulation point of  $X$ . There exists a sequence  $(t_k)_{k \in \mathbb{N}}$  of distinct elements of  $X$  such that  $t_k \neq L$  for any  $k$ ,  $\lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} t_k = L$  and the sequence  $\{\|t_k - L\|_0^+\}_{k \in \mathbb{N}}$  is decreasing to 0. Put

$$s_k = \{\|t_k - L\|_0^+\},$$

for  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ . Let  $\{A_i\}_{i \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a disjoint family of nonempty sets from  $\mathcal{S}_2$ .

Define a sequence  $(x_{mn})$  as following:

$$x_{mn} = \begin{cases} t_i, & \text{if } (m, n) \in A_i \\ L, & \text{if } (m, n) \notin A_i, \end{cases}$$

for any  $i$ . Let  $\delta > 0$ . Select  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $s_k < \delta$ . Then,

$$A(\delta) = \{(m, n) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : \|x_{mn} - L\|_0^+ \geq \delta\} \subset A_1 \cup A_2 \cup \dots \cup A_k.$$

Hence,  $A(\delta) \in \mathcal{S}_2$  and so,

$$F\mathcal{S}_2 - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L.$$

By virtue of our assumption, we have

$$F\mathcal{S}_2^* - \lim_{m,n \rightarrow \infty} x_{mn} = L.$$

So, there exists a set  $H \in \mathcal{S}_2$  such that  $M = \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} \setminus H \in \mathcal{F}(\mathcal{S}_2)$  and

$$\lim_{\substack{m,n \rightarrow \infty \\ (m,n) \in M}} x_{mn} = L. \tag{2.1}$$

Now, put  $H_i = A_i \cap H$ , for  $i \in \mathbb{N}$ . Then,  $H_i \in \mathcal{S}_2$ , for each  $i \in \mathbb{N}$ . Also,

$$\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} H_i = H \cap \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} A_i \subset H \text{ and so } \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} H_i \in \mathcal{S}_2.$$

Fix  $i \in \mathbb{N}$ . If  $A_i \cap M$  is not included in the finite union of rows and columns in  $\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}$ , then  $M$  must contain an infinite sequence of elements  $\{(m_k, n_k)\}$ , where both  $m_k, n_k \rightarrow \infty$  and  $x_{m_k, n_k} = t_k \neq L$ , for all  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  which contradicts (2.1). Hence,  $A_i \cap M$  must be contained in the finite union of rows and columns in  $\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}$ . Therefore,

$$A_i \Delta H_i = A_i \setminus H_i = A_i \setminus H = A_i \cap M$$

is also included in the finite union of rows and columns. Thus,  $\mathcal{S}_2$  has the property (AP2).  $\square$

## References

- [1] Bag, T. and Samanta, S.K., *Fixed point theorems in Felbin's type fuzzy normed linear spaces*, J. Fuzzy Math. **16**(1) (2008), 243–260.
- [2] Bede, B. and Gal, S.G., *Almost periodic fuzzy-number-valued functions*, Fuzzy Sets Syst. **147**(2004), 385–403.
- [3] Das, P., Kostyrko, P., Wilczyński, W. and Malik, P., *I and I\*-convergence of double sequences*, Math. Slovaca, **58**(5) (2008), 605–620.
- [4] Das, P. and Malik, P., *On extremal I-limit points of double sequences*, Tatra Mt. Math. Publ. **40** (2008), 91–102.
- [5] Diamond, P. and Kloeden, P., *Metric Spaces of Fuzzy Sets-Theory and Applications*, World Scientific Publishing, Singapore (1994).
- [6] Dündar, E. and Altay, B.,  *$\mathcal{S}_2$ -convergence and  $\mathcal{S}_2$ -Cauchy of double sequences*, Acta Mathematica Scientia, **34**(2) (2014), 343–353.
- [7] Dündar, E. and Altay, B., *On some properties of  $\mathcal{S}_2$ -convergence and  $\mathcal{S}_2$ -Cauchy of double sequences*, Gen. Math. Notes, **7**(1) (2011), 1–12.
- [8] Dündar, E. and Talo, Ö.,  *$\mathcal{S}_2$ -convergence of double sequences of fuzzy numbers*, Iranian Journal of Fuzzy Systems, **10**(3) (2013), 37–50.
- [9] Dündar, E. and Talo, Ö.,  *$\mathcal{S}_2$ -Cauchy Double Sequences of Fuzzy Numbers*, Gen. Math. Notes, **16**(2) (2013), 103–114.
- [10] Fang, J.-X. and Huang, H., *On the level convergence of a sequence of fuzzy numbers*, Fuzzy Sets Systems, **147** (2004), 417–415.
- [11] Fast, H., *Sur la convergence statistique*, Colloq. Math. **2** (1951), 241–244.
- [12] Felbin, C., *Finite-dimensional fuzzy normed linear space*, Fuzzy Sets and Systems, **48**(2) (1992), 239–248.
- [13] Hazarika, B., *On ideal convergent sequences in fuzzy normed linear spaces*, Afrika Matematika, **25**(4) (2013), 987–999.
- [14] Hazarika, B. and Kumar, V., *Fuzzy real valued I-convergent double sequences in fuzzy normed spaces*, Journal of Intelligent and Fuzzy Systems, **26** (2014), 2323–2332.
- [15] Kostyrko, P., Šalát, T. and Wilczyński, W., *I-convergence*, Real Anal. Exchange, **26**(2) (2000), 669–686.
- [16] Kumar, V., *On I and I\*-convergence of double sequences*, Math. Commun. **12** (2007), 171–181.
- [17] Kumar, V. and Kumar, K., *On the ideal convergence of sequences of fuzzy numbers*, Inform. Sci. **178** (2008), 4670–4678.
- [18] Matloka, M., *Sequences of fuzzy numbers*, Busefal, **28** (1986), 28–37.
- [19] Mizumoto, M. and Tanaka, K., *Some properties of fuzzy numbers*, Advances in Fuzzy Set Theory and Applications, North-Holland (Amsterdam), **1979**, 153–164.
- [20] Mohiuddine, S.A., Sevli, H. and Cancan, M., *Statistical convergence of double sequences in fuzzy normed spaces*, Filomat, **26**(4) (2012), 673–681.
- [21] Mursaleen, M. and Edely, O.H.H., *Statistical convergence of double sequences*, J. Math. Anal. Appl. **288** (2003), 223–231.
- [22] Nabiev, A., Pehlivan, S. and Gürdal, M., *On  $\mathcal{S}$ -Cauchy sequences*, Taiwanese J. Math. **11**(2) (2007) 569–5764.
- [23] Nanda, S., *On sequences of fuzzy numbers*, Fuzzy Sets Syst. **33** (1989), 123–126.
- [24] Pringsheim, A., *Zur theorie der zweifach unendlichen Zahlenfolgen*, Math. Ann. **53** (1900), 289–321.
- [25] Rath, D. and Tripathy, B.C., *On statistically convergence and statistically Cauchy sequences*, Indian J. Pure Appl. Math. **25**(4) (1994), 381–386.
- [26] Saadati, R., *On the I-fuzzy topological spaces*, Chaos, Solitons and Fractals, **37** (2008), 1419–1426.
- [27] Šalát, T., Tripathy, B.C. and Ziman, M., *On I-convergence field*, Ital. J. Pure Appl. Math. **17** (2005), 45–54.
- [28] Savaş, E. and Mursaleen, M., *On statistically convergent double sequences of fuzzy numbers*, Inform. Sci. **162** (2004), 183–192.
- [29] Şençimen, C. and Pehlivan, S., *Statistical convergence in fuzzy normed linear spaces*, Fuzzy Sets and Systems, **159** (2008), 361–370.
- [30] Schönberg, I.J., *The integrability of certain functions and related summability methods*, Amer. Math. Monthly **66** (1959), 361–375.
- [31] Tripathy, B. and Tripathy, B.C., *On I-convergent double sequences*, Soochow J. Math. **31** (2005), 549–560.
- [32] Türkmen, M. R. and Dündar, E., *On Lacunary Statistical Convergence of Double Sequences and Some Properties in Fuzzy Normed Spaces*, Journal of Intelligent and Fuzzy Systems, **36**(2) (2019), 1683-1690.
- [33] Zadeh, L.A., *Fuzzy sets*, Information and Control **8**(1965), 338–353.