



Marketing Philosophies in Hospitality Businesses: The Case of Bolu

Konaklama İşletmelerinde Pazarlama Felsefeleri: Bolu Örneği

Yusuf DÜNDAR*
Cemal Ersin SİLİK**
Ertuğrul DÜZGÜN***

Abstract

With the changes in consumer behavior over time, there have been some developments in marketing philosophies. The main purpose of this research is to reveal the marketing philosophies adopted in accommodation establishments in protected areas. In this context, data has been collected from managers (n=42) responsible for marketing activities of accommodation establishments in Bolu city in Türkiye. In the study, marketing management philosophy (MMP) was measured using the scale developed by Tosun, Okumus and Fyall (2008). In this study, AMOS and SPSS programs were applied to analyse data. The data were evaluated using descriptive statistical methods and comparative tests. The main findings reveal that accommodation establishments mostly adopt manufacturing and product-orientation marketing management philosophies. This study is one of the limited studies revealing the marketing philosophies adopted, especially in accommodation establishments in protected areas and contributes to the relevant literature.

Keywords: Marketing philosophies, hospitality businesses, Bolu

JEL Codes: L83; Z33

Öz

Tüketici davranışlarının zaman içinde değişmesiyle birlikte pazarlama felsefelerinde de bazı gelişmeler olmuştur. Bu araştırmanın temel amacı, korunan alanlarda konaklama işletmelerinde benimsenen pazarlama felsefelerini ortaya koymaktır. Bu kapsamda veriler Türkiye’de Bolu ilinde bulunan konaklama işletmelerinin pazarlama faaliyetlerinden sorumlu yöneticilerinden toplanmıştır (n=42). Çalışmada pazarlama yönetimi felsefesi, Tosun et al. (2008) tarafından geliştirilen ölçek kullanılarak ölçülmüştür. Bu çalışmada verilerin analizi için AMOS ve SPSS programı kullanılmıştır. Veriler, betimleyici istatistiksel yöntemler ve karşılaştırmalı testler kullanılarak değerlendirilmiştir. Temel bulgular, konaklama işletmelerinin çoğunlukla üretim ve ürün odaklı pazarlama yönetimi felsefelerini benimsediklerini ortaya koymaktadır. Bu çalışma, özellikle korunan alanlardaki konaklama işletmelerinde benimsenen pazarlama felsefelerini ortaya koyan sınırlı çalışmalardan biri olup ilgili literatüre katkı sağlamaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Pazarlama Felsefeleri, Konaklama İşletmeleri, Bolu

JEL Kodları: L83; Z33

*Dr.Öğr. Üyesi, Aksaray Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler MYO, Otel, Lokanta ve İkram Hizmetleri Bölümü, ysfdundar42@gmail.com, ORCID: <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-4405-7557>.

** Dr.Öğr. Üyesi, Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli Üniversitesi, Turizm Fakültesi, Rekreasyon Yönetimi Bölümü, cemal.silik@hbv.edu.tr, ORCID: <http://orcid.org/0000-0001-8662-4188>.

***Dr.Öğr. Üyesi, Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal Üniversitesi, Turizm Fakültesi, Turizm Rehberliği Bölümü, duzugunertugrul@gmail.com, ORCID: <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-0786-3840>.

1. INTRODUCTION

Marketing methods that emerged in the economies of Western countries in the early 20th century have spread worldwide today (Fyall and Deptula, 2019). The critical point here is that the wishes and needs of consumers can be determined precisely. Developments in marketing philosophies are closely related to supply-demand situations with the changes in producers and consumers. Because the wishes and requirements of consumers are constantly changing. First, the priorities of businesses are to sell what they produce, while now they are to produce what they can sell. However, a network of relations with consumers has been established, and a period has started in which consumers are also involved in the production process. This process emphasizes the importance of marketing philosophies for businesses.

The tourism sector is experiencing a change especially with the increase in demand, the emergence of new values such as sustainability and social responsibility. A more comprehensive and diverse approach is needed at the level of consumer behavior (Gustavo, 2013). Today, it is seen that the production, product, sales and marketing philosophy approaches in the historical process are replaced by customer-oriented, relational marketing-oriented and customer experience-oriented approaches.

Changes in consumer behavior also affect the marketing approaches of businesses. When the studies conducted in the literature are examined, it has been determined that there are a limited number of studies examining marketing philosophies, especially in accommodation establishments (Oh et al., 2004; Tosun et al., 2008; Kethüda and Çalışkan, 2011; Ödemiş and Hassan, 2021). In the study conducted by Oh et al. (2004), it was determined that there was a need for studies on the field of theory and philosophy in marketing research. In addition, the application of this study in the accommodation establishments in the protected areas of Bolu increases the importance of the study. Bolu is a destination covered with forests due to its geographical location. It is important that research is carried out, especially in such a specific area. Based on these points, this study, which has been prepared to fill the gap in the literature, will provide theoretical and practical contributions to marketing philosophies in accommodation establishments.

The main objective of this study is to reveal the marketing philosophies adopted in accommodation establishments (especially in protected areas). The literature review supports the importance of the study. In this context, the literature on marketing philosophies has been examined, and studies on the subject have been mentioned. Then, the findings obtained as a result of the application are discussed.

In order to realize the aim of the study, detailed sub-objectives were expressed in question sentences as follows:

Research Question 1: What are the marketing philosophies adopted in accommodation businesses in protected areas?

Research Question 2: Do the adopted marketing philosophies differ according to the type of business and the type of manager responsible for marketing?

2. CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

2.1. Marketing Philosophies

Marketing philosophies have been widely discussed in the literature in different fields (Bradshaw, 1974; Tosun et al., 2008; Talebi, 2017; McGee and Spiro, 1988; Morgan, 1996). Marketing philosophies are an essential guide for business managers. It focuses on providing services for the wishes and needs of consumers. In this context, there are generally three sections in the literature. These are customer orientation, integrated effort and profit direction (McGee and Spiro, 1988). When the studies conducted in the literature are examined, it is determined that marketing philosophies consist of periods such as production, product, sales, customer orientation and social marketing (Greyser, 1997; Keith, 1960; Kotler and Lee, 2005; Lamb et al., 2004; Morgan, 1996). These are generally a marketing management philosophy (Tosun et al., 2008).

In Keith's (1960) study titled "The Marketing Revolution", a classification of marketing philosophies was made for the first time. This study has four stages: production, sales, marketing and marketing control philosophies. Especially production and sales philosophies are widely adopted from 1869 to the mid-1950s (Ödemiş and Hassan, 2019). When the proposed approaches to marketing philosophies are examined, it is expressed as the production period from the beginning of the industrial revolution to the 1920s, the sales period between 1920-1960, the marketing period between 1960-1985, and the relationship period from 1985 to today. The four periods of marketing philosophies are given in Table 1 (Taghipourian and Bakhsh, 2017).

Table 1: Marketing Philosophy Periods

Era	Industrial Revolution- 1920's Production	1920-1960 Sales	1960-1985 Marketing	1985 to present Relationship
Philosophies	Production philosophy Product philosophy	Sales philosophy Transaction marketing philosophy	Marketing philosophy Social marketing philosophy Total quality management philosophy Holistic marketing philosophy Distribution plan philosophy	Relationship marketing philosophy Network marketing philosophy Customer relationship philosophy Market orientation philosophy Targeted customer exploitation

Reference: Taghipourian and Bakhsh, 2017.

The direction of the current approaches has evolved towards social marketing, the connection of marketing with other sectors, creating the future, achieving excellence, creating value management instead of customer satisfaction, and marketing one-to-one instead of marketing (Taghipourian and Bakhsh, 2017). The important point here is that the beginning of a marketing period does not mean the end of the previous one (Tosun et al., 2008).

The production period consists of two philosophies: product and production. The production period focuses more on mass production, extended distribution, low-cost and profitable transactions (Taghipourian and Bakhsh, 2017). The basic cliché in the production period is expressed as "Build it and they will come". In this period, the quality of the products is dealt with rather than marketing. For this reason, businesses are constantly focused on developing their products (Fyall and Deptula, 2019).

The sales period covers sales and transactional marketing philosophies. In sales philosophy, customer awareness forms profitability (Taghipourian and Bakhsh, 2017). In this period, businesses predict that advertising and sales activities affect the sales volume. In this period, the primary goal is to increase the business's profitability through collective sales (Fyall and Deptula, 2019).

The marketing period consists of five philosophies: marketing, social marketing, total quality management, holistic marketing and a design for distribution. In marketing philosophy, businesses produce the goods and services requested by the customers in a way that will satisfy them and make a profit (Taghipourian and Bakhsh, 2017). This period is a period in which the strategic mindset changes for businesses. There has been a transition from a "sell what we can make" to a "make what we can sell". The main goal here is to respond to and satisfy the wishes and needs of the consumer (Fyall and Deptula, 2019).

The relationship period consists of seven philosophies: relationship marketing, transaction marketing, network marketing, customer relationship marketing, customer orientation, market orientation and targeted customer exploitation. The relationship period focuses on creating, maintaining and developing strong relationships between customers and other beneficiaries (Taghipourian and Bakhsh, 2017).

2.2. Literature Review

When the studies on marketing philosophies in the literature were examined, it was determined that philosophy studies in the field of tourism were limited. There are important studies examining marketing philosophies as a basic concept (McGee and Spiro, 1988; Morgan, 1996) and as a basic concept in the tourism sector (Bradshaw, 1974; Tosun et al., 2008; Talebi, 2017). However, there are studies in the literature examining marketing philosophies within the scope of technology companies (Chaston, 1998), hotel establishments (Oh et al., 2004; Kethüda and Çalışkan, 2011; Ödemiş and Hassan, 2021), customers (Taghipourian and Bakhsh, 2017), rural tourism development (Mihailovic and Moric, 2012). In addition, there are studies examining the historical development (Ödemiş and Hassan, 2019), future effects (Tadajewski, 2004), cultural effects (Tresidder, 2015) and effects on company performances (Siu, 2000) of marketing philosophies.

In the study by McGee and Spiro (1988), three focal points of marketing philosophies were mentioned. The first of these is customer orientation, which requires a full understanding of the customers' wishes, needs, and behaviors. The second is the integration effort that emphasizes integrating the marketing function with research, product management, sales and advertising. The third is the profit dimension in which money is intended to be earned. Marketing philosophies are long-term. It requires focusing on the basic needs of consumers rather than temporary products (McGee and Spiro, 1988). In the study conducted by Morgan (1996), marketing philosophy is one of a number of management philosophies (cost philosophy, product philosophy, production philosophy, sales philosophy, etc.) that are in constant competition for visibility in the organization in general (Morgan, 1996).

When the studies on marketing philosophies in the tourism sector are examined, a study conducted by Tosun et al. (2008), which makes significant contributions to the literature, is encountered. This study is aimed at the implementation of various marketing management philosophies by tourism organizations in Türkiye. The results of the study reveal that competence, availability of financial resources and business environment characteristics in the country affect the implementation of marketing management philosophies (MMPs) in organizations. In addition, it has been determined that most of establishments tend to adopt a

product orientation philosophy. The second important trend is the customer orientation (marketing orientation) philosophy. This philosophy is followed by manufacturing, selling and societal marketing orientations, respectively. The results of the study reveal that establishments with lower occupancy rates and capacity tend to adopt a more product-oriented marketing management philosophy (Tosun et al., 2008).

In the study conducted by Chaston (1998) on technology companies, new marketing philosophies are mentioned. It was emphasized that a hybrid marketing philosophy model should be presented in order to increase the employee productivity, performance and income of the establishments. In this context, it is recommended to combine the concepts of entrepreneurial, relational and transactional marketing (Chaston, 1998). In the study conducted for hotel businesses, it was determined that hotel businesses have a modern marketing approach in terms of determining customer needs, customer relations and customer orientation dimensions. In terms of profitability and integrated marketing, it has been determined that they have a marketing philosophy close to the sales approach (Kethüda and Çalışkan, 2011). In another study conducted for hotel businesses, marketing philosophies were examined within the scope of competitive advantages of hotel businesses. The findings reveal that the customer orientation factor of the marketing philosophies variable has an effect on the sub-factors (business goals and differentiation tools) of the competitive advantage variable and the competitive advantage variable (Ödemiş and Hassan, 2021). In the study conducted by Kethüda and Çalışkan (2011), it was determined that the marketing approach in hotel establishments did not differ according to hotel establishments. However, the study conducted by Ödemiş and Hassan (2021), concluded that the marketing approach differed according to the origin of the hotel businesses.

In the study conducted by Taghipourian and Bakhsh (2017), marketing philosophies were discussed from a customer perspective in four different periods (production era, sales era, marketing era and relationship era). In the study, each period is discussed within itself. In the study conducted by Mihailovic and Moric (2012), the role of the marketing concept in the sustainable rural tourism development process was investigated. The results of the study focus on the need to adopt a specific segmentation and collaborative marketing philosophy in the development of rural tourism (Mihailovic and Moric, 2012).

In the study conducted by Ödemiş and Hassan (2019), a conceptual review was made on the historical development of marketing philosophies. In the study, the views on marketing philosophies and the philosophical and theoretical development of marketing were examined periodically. The results reveal that there are very different opinions in the literature as well as similar opinions in terms of the philosophical and theoretical development of marketing. In addition, it has been determined that marketing philosophies are handled in two different periods as the pre-customer period and the customer orientation period in general (Ödemiş and Hassan, 2019). In the study conducted by Tadajewski (2004), the future development of marketing theories was discussed. The study emphasised the importance of science philosophy in marketing research (Tadajewski, 2004).

3. METHOD

3.1. Sample and Procedure

The data was collected from the managers responsible for marketing activities in the accommodation establishments in Bolu, Türkiye. Bolu province in Türkiye is one of the most popular alternative tourism destinations preferred by local tourists with its forested areas, nature and protected natural, historical and cultural areas, located between Istanbul and

Ankara provinces with the highest population. In the sample selection, the list of accommodation facilities (2022) published by Bolu Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism was used. There are 128 accommodation facilities in Bolu, 28 of which are tourism business certified and 100 of which are municipally certified. Using the formula developed by Yamane (2001) to calculate the sample size, the sample size was calculated as 96 in the 95% confidence interval. The managers responsible for marketing activities of 96 accommodation facilities, which were randomly selected from the list of accommodation facilities, were called by the researchers by phone. The relevant managers of the 16 plants could not be reached and the relevant managers of the 11 plants did not agree to participate in the research. The managers responsible for the marketing activities of 69 plants accepted to participate in the research. The questionnaires were sent to those who agreed to participate in the study by e-mail in the first week of July 2022. In the second week of August, 51 questionnaires were filled out and returned to the researchers via e-mail. The completed questionnaires were meticulously examined, and those unsuitable for analysis were removed from the data set. As a result, 42 usable questionnaires were collected. The rate of feedback is approximately 61%. Ethics committee approval of this study was received from Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal University's Human Research Ethics Committee in Social Sciences on 27.06.2022 with protocol number 2022/317 and resolution 8.

The vast majority of the participants (92.9%) work in municipal- certified facilities. Most of the establishments where the respondents work are family businesses (54.8%) and local businesses (35.7%). While the business owner is responsible for marketing activities in 40.5% of the establishments where the research was conducted, the general manager is responsible for 26.2%, the marketing manager is responsible for 21.4%, and the sales manager is responsible for 9.5%. 88.1% of the establishments operate all year round. The bed capacity of the establishments varies between 8 and 320. The average bed capacity is approximately 41. 98% of the establishments are small-scale accommodation establishments with 100 or fewer rooms (Özel, 2016). The number of personnel working in the establishments varies between 2 and 45. The average number of personnel employed is approximately 7.

3.2. Measures

In this study, a 5-point Likert scale (1-strongly disagree and 5-strongly agree) was applied. The scale items are taken from the foreign literature. For this reason, the language validity has been checked. The items were translated into Turkish by four language experts who speak both English and Turkish through the back-to-translation method (Brislin, 1976). Marketing management philosophy (MMP) was measured using the scale developed by Tosun et al. (2008). The scale consists of 5 dimensions (manufacturing orientation, product orientation, selling orientation, marketing orientation, societal marketing orientation) and 14 items.

3.3. Data Analysis

In this study, the AMOS program was used for confirmatory factor analysis. The measurement model was evaluated to control convergent validity and composite reliability. The overall χ^2 measure, CFI [comparative fit index], NFI [normed fit index], and RMSEA [root mean square error of approximation] were used to assess the goodness of fit of the statistical model. The maximum likelihood method was used to test the measurement model. In order to use the maximum likelihood method, the assumption of normal distribution must be fulfilled. For this reason, skewness and kurtosis values were examined. It was observed that skewness (-1.013 and -0.041) and kurtosis (1.986 and -0.201) values met the normal distribution assumption (George and Mallery, 2010). Based on the arithmetic averages, the

skewness and kurtosis values of the variables (by evaluating the groups separately) for all dimensions (manufacturing orientation, product orientation, selling orientation, marketing orientation, societal marketing orientation) and the (p) values resulting from the Levene test are presented in Table 2. The use of parametric tests (t-test, ANOVA) for comparative analysis by taking arithmetic means into account depends on fulfilling the normal distribution assumption and meeting the condition of homogeneity of variances. In order to ensure the normal distribution assumption, skewness and kurtosis values should be between +2 and -2 (George and Mallery, 2010). In order to ensure the homogeneity of the variances, the Levene test result (p) value must be greater than 0.05. T-test and ANOVA were used in cases where all of these conditions were met, and Mann-Whitney U and Kruskal-Wallis Test were used in cases where they could not be met. A statistics package program was applied for these tests.

Table 2: Analysis Results of the Tests That Can Be Used

Dimensions**	Variables	Groups	Skewness	Kurtosis	Levene (p)	Parametric	Nonparametric	Tests
MO	Business Type	Family business	0.382	-0.640	0.583	*		T-test
		Local business	-0.300	-1.303				
		Business owner	0.302	-0.968				
	Marketing Executive	General manager	0.610	-0.239	0.807	*		ANOVA
		Marketing manager	-0.502	-0.009				
PO	Business Type	Family business	-0.265	-0.942	0.853	*		T-test
		Local business	-0.668	-1.189				
		Business owner	-0.291	-1.207				
	Marketing Executive	General manager	-0.108	-1.597	0.206	*		ANOVA
		Marketing manager	-0.690	-0.800				
SO	Business Type	Family business	-0.857	0.987	0.735	*		T-test
		Local business	-0.256	-1.294				
		Business owner	-0.238	-0.387				
	Marketing Executive	General manager	-0.708	-0.836	0.352	*		ANOVA
		Marketing manager	0.698	-0.797				
MaO	Business Type	Family business	-1.435	2.314	0.985		*	Mann-Whitney U
		Local business	-0.818	-0.470				
		Business owner	-0.473	-0.054				
	Marketing Executive	General manager	0.234	-1.307	0.221		*	Kruskal-Wallis Test
		Marketing manager	-2.083	4.932				
SMO	Business Type	Family business	-1.162	2.170	0.082		*	Mann-Whitney U
		Local business	-1.024	1.137				
		Business owner	-0.410	-0.490				
	Marketing Executive	General manager	0.008	-1.066	0.291		*	Kruskal-Wallis Test
		Marketing manager	-2.214	5.805				

** MO: manufacturing orientation, PO: product orientation, SO: selling orientation, MaO: marketing orientation, SMO: societal marketing orientation

4. RESULTS

4.1. Descriptive Results

The mean MMP arithmetic score was 4.16 (sd:0.43). The arithmetic average of manufacturing orientation marketing management philosophy (MOMMP) is 4.30 (sd:0.48), the arithmetic average of product orientation marketing management philosophy (POMMP)

is 4.28 (sd:0.58), the arithmetic average of selling orientation marketing management philosophy (SOMMP) is 4.11 (sd:0.52), the arithmetic average of marketing orientation marketing management philosophy (MaOMMP) is 4.06 (sd:0.62), and the arithmetic average of societal marketing orientation marketing management philosophy (SMOMMP) is 4.11 (sd:0.57).

4.2. Measurement Results

Due to its multidimensional structure, MMP was included in the measurement model as multidimensional (second level confirmatory factor analysis). The results of second-level confirmatory factor analysis showed that the scale had almost acceptable fit indices ($\chi^2 = 83.289$, $df = 60$, $p < 0.05$, $\chi^2/df = 1.388$, $RMSEA = 0.097$, $CFI = 0.831$, $NFI = 0.615$). χ^2/df value < 5.0 indicates a “reasonable fit” (Wheaton et al., 1977; Marsh and Hocevar, 1985). CFI and NFI values greater than or equal to 0.90 indicate acceptable fit (Tabachnick and Fidell, 2007; Byrne, 2016). These values, especially the NFI value, are not at the desired level. It is estimated that this is since the number of samples is not at the desired level. On the other hand, RMSEA value < 0.08 indicates acceptable fit (Gürbüz, 2021). The RMSEA value is slightly above this value. Again, it is thought that this is because the sample number is not at the desired level. Since the factor load (-0.040) was too low, 1 item was removed from the scale. The factor loads of the remaining 13 items were statistically significant ($p < 0.05$). The alpha coefficients for the scale are between 0.838 and 0.540. As can be seen in Table 3, composite reliability (CR) values range between 0.881 and 0.533. The average value extracted (AVE) ranges between 0.278 and 0.479.

Table 3: Measurement Model

Variables	λ	a	CR	AVE
MMP		0,838	0,882	0,372
MO		0,631	0,644	0,479
It is extremely important for our sales volume to increase the affordability and accessibility of our product.	0,783			
Increasing the capacity of our service and production is the most significant duty for us.	0,588			
PO		0,540	0,546	0,375
Products and services we sell have an essential act in determining our job polity.	0,597			
Enhancing our service qualification is the most significant duty for us.	0,628			
SO		0,594	0,615	0,363
Clients who are persuaded to purchase our services will like this.	0,465			
Our clients will not consider purchasing adequate from our services unless they make enough sales and promotional efforts.	0,487			
Enhancing the sales volume of our hotel is the most essential duty for us.	0,797			
MaO		0,544	0,533	0,278
We educate personnel on how to make visitors sense like VIPs.	0,536			
We periodically check up our product progress studies to provide they are aligned with clients' wishes.	0,441			
Increasing the pleasure of our clients more than our rivals is the most essential duty for us.	0,594			
SMO		0,644	0,664	0,401
Satisfying our customers without compromising the welfare of the society is the most important task for us.	0,539			
Our hotel has improved and performed various personnel education programmes on how to serve a community responsibly.	0,726			
We take all kinds of measures to minimize the damage to the environment caused by our activities.	0,620			

4.3. Results for Comparison of Means

The evaluations of the employees responsible for the marketing of the establishments regarding MOMMP do not differ significantly according to the type of business ($t=-1.533$, $p>0.05$). The arithmetic average for “family business” is 4.21 and the arithmetic average for “local business” is 4.46. On the other hand, evaluations of MOMMP do not differ significantly according to the employees responsible for marketing activities ($F=1.012$, $p>0.05$). The arithmetic average for “business owner” is 4.32, the arithmetic average for “general manager” is 4.22, and the arithmetic average for “marketing manager” is 4.38. The evaluations of the employees responsible for the marketing of the establishments regarding POMMP do not differ significantly according to the type of business ($t=-1.611$, $p>0.05$). The arithmetic average for “family business” is 4.15 and the arithmetic average for “local business” is 4.46. On the other hand, evaluations of POMMP do not differ significantly according to the employees responsible for marketing activities ($F=0.683$, $p>0.05$). The arithmetic average for “business owner” is 4.23, the arithmetic average for “general manager” is 4.13, and the arithmetic average for “marketing manager” is 4.50. The evaluations of the employees responsible for the marketing of the establishments regarding SOMMP do not differ significantly according to the type of business ($t=-0.186$, $p>0.05$). The arithmetic average for “family business” is 4.10 and

the arithmetic average for “local business” is 4.13. On the other hand, evaluations of SOMMP do not differ significantly according to the employees responsible for marketing activities ($F=2.431$, $p>0.05$). The arithmetic average for “business owner” is 4.09, the arithmetic average for “general manager” is 4.21, and the arithmetic average for “marketing manager” is 4.11. The evaluations of the employees responsible for marketing of the establishments regarding MaOMMP do not differ significantly according to the type of business ($U=125$, $p>0.05$). On the other hand, evaluations of MaOMMP do not differ significantly according to the employees responsible for marketing activities ($X^2=5.532$, $p>0.05$). The evaluations of the employees responsible for the marketing of the establishments regarding SMOMMP do not differ significantly according to the type of business ($U=149.5$, $p>0.05$). On the other hand, evaluations of SMOMMP do not differ significantly according to the employees responsible for marketing activities ($X^2=4.907$, $p>0.05$).

5. DISCUSSION

5.1. Summary of Findings

The MMP adopted by the establishments has been found to be manufacturing, product, selling, societal marketing and marketing orientation, respectively. Selling, societal marketing and marketing orientation MMP are below the general arithmetic average. The evaluations of the employees responsible for marketing of the establishments according to the MMP do not differ according to the type of business and the person responsible for marketing activities.

5.2. Theoretical Implications

When the studies conducted in the literature are examined, there are limited studies examining marketing philosophies with the dimension of accommodation establishments (Oh et al., 2004; Kethüda and Çalışkan, 2011; Ödemiş and Hassan, 2021). The results of the literature reveal different dimensions of marketing approaches in hotel establishments. For example, in the study conducted by Kethüda and Çalışkan (2011), the marketing approach in hotel businesses does not differ from hotel businesses. On the contrary, in the study conducted by Ödemiş and Hassan (2021), it was determined that the marketing approach differs according to the origin of the hotel businesses. The results of this study support the results of the study conducted by Kethüda and Çalışkan (2011). The evaluations of the managers in the accommodation establishments regarding their marketing philosophies do not differ according to the type of business.

This study, which has been conducted for marketing philosophies in hotel establishments, supports the existing studies in the literature. In addition, the fact that this study is conducted in accommodation establishments in protected areas adds richness to the literature. It has been determined that the marketing philosophies in hotel establishments are manufacturing, product, selling, societal marketing and marketing orientation.

5.3. Practical Implications

When the practical contributions of the study are examined, some suggestions have been developed for the managers responsible for marketing activities in hotel businesses. The results of the study reveal that the dominant view of marketing philosophies in accommodation establishments is an opinion on manufacturing and product understanding. However, developing and changing consumer behaviors are changing towards a marketing-oriented approach rather than manufacturing and product understanding. It is stated that a philosophy that includes personalized products and consumers is adopted. At this point, it is recommended that marketing managers in accommodation establishments take a marketing-

oriented approach rather than manufacturing and product understanding. Customers should be included in the production process by highlighting personalized products in their hotels. To provide competitive advantage, accommodation establishments should adopt marketing philosophies other than manufacturing and product understanding. In particular, the adoption of customer-oriented marketing approaches will provide an advantage at the point of differentiation.

The results of the study reveal that accommodation establishments should also adopt sustainable marketing philosophies. The applications of the participants in the study within SMOMMP can actually be seen at a sufficient level. 95.2% of the establishments have a non-smoking bar, restaurant, floor, etc. in the facility. 88.1% take measures to reduce chemical use. In addition, 73.8% distinguishes plastic, glass and iron from garbage and waste. On the other hand, 83.3% of the establishments reuse used materials such as towels and sheets for secondary purposes. In addition to that, 88.1% of the establishments have developed measures to reduce energy waste. However, only 40.5% of the establishments save water by using water-saving plumbing fixtures. The results reveal that establishments should take some measures in terms of saving. Necessary measures have to be taken especially for water saving.

5.4. Limitations and Future Research

The study is limited to accommodation establishments in Bolu province. Municipality-certified and small-scale establishments constitute the majority of accommodation establishments. In the following studies, this study can be made in the facilities with tourism operation certificate and a comparison can be made. In addition, a similar study can be carried out in the top three cities in Türkiye with the number of facilities and visitors, such as Istanbul, Antalya and Muğla, to reveal the dominant marketing approach in the Turkish hotel industry. In these studies, it can be tested whether marketing philosophies differ according to the size and types of establishments. The differentiation in marketing understanding in businesses where the marketing manager is responsible for marketing activities rather than the business owner and general manager can be examined in depth. The current study can be expanded by including accommodation establishments in different regions and areas. It is important to enrich this study with accommodation facilities in different regions.

6. CONCLUSION

In this study, the marketing philosophies of the establishments have been examined from the perspective of marketing managers in accommodation establishments. It has been concluded that the accommodation establishments in Bolu province in Türkiye have a manufacturing, product, selling, societal marketing and marketing-oriented approach, respectively. The development of the study results is important in terms of revealing the dominant marketing philosophies in accommodation establishments. Although the results are limited to the city of Bolu, they provide information about the marketing philosophies adopted by accommodation establishments. According to the results of the study, it has been concluded that accommodation establishments adopt traditional marketing philosophies.

Considering the developing and changing consumer behaviors, the differentiation of marketing philosophies in accommodation establishments is important. Different approaches should be adopted in line with the wishes and needs of consumers. In particular, determining customer-oriented marketing approaches will provide competitive advantage. Marketing approaches need to be addressed not only with marketing managers in accommodation establishments, but also with a more holistic structure. It will also be a natural result for businesses to adopt different marketing approaches due to their appeal to different target

markets. As a result, issues such as the type, objectives and target market of the business are important in the revealing of the marketing philosophies of the accommodation establishments. New results to be obtained from accommodation establishments in different countries and regions will contribute to the literature.

Ethics Statement: The authors declare that ethical rules are followed in all preparation processes of this study. In case of detection of a contrary situation, BİİBFAD Journal does not have any responsibility, and all responsibility belongs to the authors of the study. Ethics committee approval of this study was received from Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal University Human Research Ethics Committee in Social Sciences on 27.06.2022 with protocol number 2022/317 and resolution 8.

Author Contributions: All authors contributed equally to the topic identification, literature, data analysis, and reporting sections of the study.

Conflict of Interest: There is no conflict of interest between the authors.

Acknowledgement: We would like to thank the Editorial Board of BİİBFAD Journal for their intense interest and efforts and the referees for their contribution.

References

- Bolu Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism. (2022, June). *Accommodation facilities*. Republic of Türkiye Ministry of Culture and Tourism. <https://bolu.ktb.gov.tr/TR-158083/konaklama.html>.
- Bradshaw, T. K. (1974). Tourism: principles, practices, philosophies. *Journal of Leisure Research*, 6(4), 325-327.
- Brislin, R. W. (1976). Comparative research methodology: cross-cultural studies. *International Journal of Psychology*, 11(3), 215-229.
- Byrne, B. (2016). *Structural equation modeling with AMOS*. New York: Routledge.
- Chaston, I. (1998). Evolving "new marketing" philosophies by merging existing concepts: application of process within small high-technology firms. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 14(4), 273-291.
- Fyall, A., & Deptula, K. (2019). Revisiting traditional approaches to the marketing of tourism and hospitality. In A. Fyall, P. Legohérel, I. Frochot, & Y. Wang (Eds.), *Marketing for tourism and hospitality collaboration, technology and experiences*. New York: Routledge.
- George, D., & Mallery, M. (2010). *SPSS for windows step by step: a simple guide and reference, 17.0 update (10a ed.)*. Boston: Pearson.
- Greyser, S. (1997). Janus and marketing: the past, present and prospective future of marketing. In D. Lehmann, & K. Jocz (Eds.), *Reflections on the futures of marketing*. Cambridge: Marketing Science Institute.
- Gustavo, N. (2013). Marketing management trends in tourism and hospitality industry: facing the 21st century environment. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, 5(3), 13-25.
- Gürbüz, S. (2021). *AMOS ile yapısal eşitlik modellemesi*. Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.
- Keith, R. (1960). The marketing revolution. *Journal of Marketing*, 24, 35-38.
- Kethüda, Ö., & Çalışkan, G. (2011). Otel işletmelerinin pazarlama anlayışı: Fethiye’de bulunan otellerde bir araştırma. *Düzce Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 1(1), 49-73.

- Kotler, P., & Lee, N. (2005). *Corporate social responsibility: doing the most good for your cause*. Hoboken: Wiley.
- Lamb, C., Hair, J., & McDaniel, C. (2004). *Essentials of marketing*. Cincinnati: South-Western Publishing.
- Marsh, H. W., & Hocevar, D. (1985). Application of confirmatory factor analysis to the study of self-concept: First-and higher order factor models and their invariance across groups. *Psychological Bulletin*, 97(3), 562-582.
- McGee, L. W., & Spiro, R. L. (1988). The marketing concept in perspective. *Business Horizons*, 31(3), 40-45.
- Mihailovic, B., & Moric, I. (2012). The role of marketing philosophy in rural tourism development. *Tourism and Hospitality Management*, 18(2), 267-279.
- Morgan, R. E. (1996). Conceptual foundations of marketing and marketing theory. *Management Decisions*, 34(10), 19-26.
- Oh, H., Kim, B. Y., & Shin, J. H. (2004). Hospitality and tourism marketing: recent developments in research and future directions. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 23, 425-447.
- Ödemiş, M., & Hassan, A. (2019). Pazarlama felsefelerinin tarihsel gelişimine yönelik bir inceleme. *Gümüşhane Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Elektronik Dergisi*, 10(1), 128-139.
- Ödemiş, M., & Hassan, A. (2021). Pazarlama felsefelerinin otel işletmelerinin rekabetçi avantajları açısından incelenmesi. *Journal of Travel and Hospitality Business*, 18(2), 267-292.
- Özel, Ç. H. (2016). Otelcilik endüstrisi. In M. A. Kozak (Ed.), *Otel işletmeciliği*. Ankara: Detay Yayıncılık.
- Siu, W. (2000). Marketing philosophies and company performance of Chinese small firms in Hong Kong. *Journal of Marketing Theory and Practice*, 8(1), 25-37.
- Tabachnick, B. G., & Fidell, L. S. (2007). *Using multivariate statistics* (5th ed.). Boston, MA: Allyn and Bacon.
- Tadajewski, M. (2004). The philosophy of marketing theory: historical and future directions. *The Marketing Review*, 4, 307-340.
- Taghipourian, M. J., & Bakhsh, M. (2017). Marketing philosophies: from customer abuse to customer intimacy, and again a little customer torment. *Journal of Business Theory and Practice*, 5(3), 198-216.
- Talebi, H. (2017). Tourism: principles, practices, philosophies. *An International Journal of Tourism and Hospitality Research (Anatolia)*, 28(1), 113-115.
- Tosun, C., Okumus, F., & Fyall, A. (2008). Marketing philosophies evidence from Turkey. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 35(1), 127-147.
- Tresidder, R. (2015). Experiences marketing: a cultural philosophy for contemporary hospitality marketing studies. *Journal of Hospitality Marketing & Management*, 24(7), 708-726.

- Wheaton, B., Muthen, B., Alwin, D. F., & Summers, G. (1977). Assessing reliability and stability in panel models. *Sociological Methodology*, 8(1), 84-136.
- Yamane, T. (2001). *Temel örnekleme yöntemleri* (Çev. A. Esin, M. A. Bakır, C. Aydın, & E. Gürbüzsel). İstanbul: Literatür Yayınları.