

REPRODUCTION OF GENDER INEQUALITY IN THE CONTEXT OF TURKISH EDUCATION POLICIES

TOPLUMSAL CİNSİYET EŞİTSİZLİĞİNİN TÜRK EĞİTİM POLİTİKALARI BAĞLAMINDA YENİDEN ÜRETİMİ

Ebru Eren¹

ABSTRACT

The research aims to discuss the limitations of gender based on international agreements and the national legislation, and thus a relational and comparative research model. The fact that the gender problematic has not been evaluated in terms of all components of Turkish education policies (that directly mediate themselves in this reproduction) is gaps in the literature. In this study, it will be assumed that gender inequality is reproduced ideologically in education. Legal arrangements made in the Turkish education system, State Development Plans, National Education Councils, etc. policy documents will be evaluated by content analysis. By highlighting how gender inequality is reproduced through Turkish education policies, we will demonstrate that nowadays the education problems stem from the inconsistency between determination and implementation policies.

Keywords: Education policy, gender, equality, social reproduction, Türkiye”

ÖZ

Uluslararası anlaşmalar ve ulusal mevzuat doğrultusunda, toplumsal cinsiyet sınırlılıklarının karşılaştırmalı araştırma modeli ile tartışılması amaçlanmaktadır. Yeniden üretim sürecine hizmet eden Türk eğitim politikaları bağlamında, toplumsal cinsiyet sorunsalının kapsamlı olarak değerlendirilmemiş olması literatürde bir eksikliklerdir. Bu çalışmada, toplumsal cinsiyet eşitsizliğinin eğitimde ideolojik olarak yeniden üretildiği varsayılacaktır. Türk eğitim sisteminde yapılan yasal düzenlemeler, Devlet Kalkınma Planları, Milli Eğitim Şuraları vb. politika belgeleri içerik çözümlemesi ile değerlendirilecektir. Toplumsal cinsiyet eşitsizliğinin, Türk eğitim politikaları aracılığı ile nasıl yeniden üretildiği vurgulanarak, eğitim sorunlarının belirleme ve uygulama politikaları arasında olan tutarsızlıktan kaynaklandığı savunulacaktır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Eğitim politikası, toplumsal cinsiyet, eşitlik, toplumsal yeniden üretim, Türkiye”

¹ Sorbonne Nouvelle - Paris III, ebrueren@hotmail.fr, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-3482-0504

Sorumlu yazar / Corresponding Author: Ebru Eren, e-posta: ebrueren@hotmail.fr

Gönderilme /Submitted: 26.01.2024 **Kabul/ Accepted:** 20.10.2024

1. INTRODUCTION

Each system is shaped according to the ideology adopted by the state (Boudon, 1986). The fundamental/ implementation policy, just like the education policy, are the result of intergenerational ideology transfer through political control and social reproduction (Bourdieu and Passeron, 1970): The state aims to transfer its dominant ideology to the society (Sönmez, 2017, p. 56). In this study, the notions of “education policies” and “reproduction” will be discussed in the same problematic. Education policies include all the political decisions/practices that the state uses to build the identity it aims at: In line with the target, individuals are raised in harmony with the social patterns learned in time, and individuals are equipped according to the desired cultural characteristics, and accepted stereotypes; society is shaped according to the value system (xxxx, 2018a, p. 226). In this context, reproduction affects all policy practices that the state applies to protect the current social order in line with the identity defined in terms of history, politics and culture, and to raise harmonious future generations by controlling individuals (Laslett and Brenner, 1989). The state provides social reproduction through education policies.

The reproduction of social order is directly related to education policies (Vogel, 2003). Education is a social area where ideology is produced (Apple, 2012) and maintained by reproduction (Maguire, 2000). Education policies, which are an ideological apparatus (Althusser, 2010), act as a bridge between the state and society (Wiborg, 2000, p. 238). Since these policies are based on an ideology, they ensure the continuity of the society (Tural, 1991,

p. 19): The ideal state and ideal society are constructed with an idea-based education policy. With ideological education, the state should idealize and normalize the individual and thus realize its bio-power by controlling society (Foucault, 2011). In line with power relations, education policies aim to internalize the social value system in accordance with the norms of the state. Stereotypes are the social regulation made with education (Meyer, 2007).

Ideological transformations affect education policies, and these policies affect social order (Kaplan, 2011). In this respect, education policies, which are a means of socialization, are seen as an important step in the development of society if they are in line with the interests of the state: If the development of the state are integrated with these policies, there will be a social change (Dewey, 2003). In that case, education is a disciplinary mechanism in which the social order is reproduced with the dominant ideology: Education fulfills the function of reproduction: Social values and stereotypes are transferred to the society in line with the ideological identity (a new/acceptable citizen for the state) and the individual is controlled into a social environment (Ünal, 2005). In this context, the individual is accepted as the inheritor and developer of sociopolitical values (Bourdieu and Passeron, 1964, p. 83), and is positioned at the center of the state’s political control and social reproduction process. Education policies play an effective role in this process.

The importance of hidden curriculum emerges in the reproduction process with education policies. The Ministry of National Education does not specify the official curriculum sometimes in written form (usually

unwritten rules within the school). However, hidden programs exist in many places: in practice; in school, in the classroom, outside the classroom, etc. The set of messages/values that the state determines according to its dominant ideology and conveys to students with special coded patterns like all beliefs, attitudes, and behaviors in this direction etc. (Giroux, 1988). Social values are accepted through education policies in a society; stereotypes are reproduced in line with power relations. This is a result of the hidden curriculum that is effective in the reproduction process (contrary to the formal curriculum). State controls every component from the beliefs, attitudes and behaviors of the principals and teachers involved in school and classroom management to the internal rules of the school at the micro level and reproduces it with an ideology-based education management at the macro level according to the hidden curriculum (Tezcan, 2003).

2. REPRODUCTION WITH EDUCATION POLICIES: THE PROBLEMATIC OF GENDER INEQUALITY

Education policies reflect the social, economic and political situation of the state. To draw the borders of the state (political control) and to ensure social cohesion (reproduction) within the borders, fundamental/implementation policies should cover everyone without distinction such as class, origin, or gender. In this sense, education policies have an important role in the reproduction process of gender inequality: What is gender and how is it reproduced? (Butler, 2008). How is the reproduction of gender inequality observed through education policies? We will discuss the gender problem in the context of the Turkish

education policies: We will assume that gender inequality is reproduced ideologically. We will apply the comparative research model, by analyzing the content of national legislation regarding to international agreements. We will argue that the problems encountered in education, just like gender inequality, arise from the inconsistency between fundamental/implementation policies nowadays.

The paper is a research paper on gender in the context of education. Gender, biological sex, is based on the gender identity in the reproduction process (social reproduction). This identity is related to the rights and opportunities defined in line with the value system and is conveyed by cultural diplomacy institutions under the name of social duty/responsibility/expectation (Oakley, 1972). In this sense, the school is based on patriarchal authority and gender: It contains many messages about the reproduction of gender inequality (Arnot, 2002). School/classroom management at the micro level is shaped by the state's educational management (policy) at the macro level. To understand these gender-based messages (hidden curriculum) in school/classroom management, it is necessary to understand gender-based power relations in the context of education policies and reproduction process. The reproduction of gender inequality is not independent of patriarchal power relations (Foucault, 2011; Butler, 2008).

Education is not only a technical issue, but also a sociopolitical issue. For example, the way to combat gender inequality, which exists in every field such as education, is to investigate this inequality reproduced through education policy. The role of the hidden curriculum, which

came into play through this policy, should be discussed in the context of reproduction of gender inequality. Many obstacles such as patriarchal-based stereotypes, financial difficulties, regional impossibilities, early marriage, and childbirth deprive women of their most basic right to education (TÜSİAD, 2008) and pose a problem for the development of the state. Moreover, the state, which recognizes gender equality as stipulated by international agreements/national legislation, supports its education policy with social policy.

3. OBSERVATION OF GENDER INEQUALITY IN EDUCATION WITH CONTENT ANALYSIS

In the reproduction process, gender should be analyzed in terms of education policy (xxxx, 2021). As for the gender inequality in Türkiye, the problematic should be evaluated in terms of all components of the education policy (all reproduction mechanisms). International agreement and national legislation will explain the reproduction of gender inequality with education criteria. The content analysis will be used to extract the main features of the content in accordance with the comparison (Weber, 1989; Bardin, 2011). Gender equality is the basis of content analysis in the context of education policies (Scott, 2000):

- Equal access, attendance and completion in education (literacy rate, distribution of enrolled/graduated students, type/level/duration of education);
- Equality during education (gender distribution of administrator-teacher-student, physical condition of the institution, quality

of education, method, program and textbook);

- Equality gained after education (employment, salary, participation in political/social life) are the basic principles.

Reproduction of gender inequality in international law/national legislation will be analyzed according to the basic principles of education policy. The main reason to choose international law texts is that gender is defined by international agreements. The compatibility of national legislation with international agreements will be questioned according to the reproduction of gender inequality in the context of Turkish education policies. In the same context, the Ministry of National Education/Council of Higher Education will be evaluated through other policy documents and official curriculum.

4. REPRODUCTION OF GENDER EQUALITY THROUGH EDUCATION IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

In international law, the framework of gender is drawn through some agreements. These international texts provide concrete examples of gender equality.

4.1. United Nations Convention Against Discrimination in Education (1960): Mention of Gender?

According to the “Universal Declaration of Human Rights” declared by the UN on 10 December 1948, the “Convention Against Discrimination in Education” is accepted on 14 December 1960. Türkiye is not one of the states that are party to the agreement.

Any form of discrimination is mentioned in 19 articles of the Convention. Education is based on gender equality. Various measures are taken to ensure that differences such as origin, gender, language, religion, and political views do not cause any discrimination in the society:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “Of depriving any person or group of persons of access to education of any type or at any level” (art.1.1.a.); “All types and levels of education, and includes access to education” (art.1.2.); “Equivalent access to education, provide a teaching staff” (2.a.);
- Equality during education: “Of limiting any person or group of persons to education of an inferior standard” (art.1.1.b.); “The standard and quality of education, and the conditions under which it is given” (art.1.2.); “With qualifications of the same standard as well as school premises and equipment of the same quality, and afford the opportunity to take the same or equivalent courses of study” (2.a);
- Equality gained after education: “The purpose or effect of nullifying or impairing equality of treatment in education” (art.1.1.).

The Convention guarantees gender equality with the access, attendance and completion principal criteria in education: There are all measures against discrimination during/after education.

4.2. United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (1979): Mention of gender?

An awareness about gender inequality is created on a global scale (with the concern that

poor women have the least opportunity to meet their education and training needs, demand for equal rights based on equality between men and women and measures to eliminate all kinds of discrimination against women):

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “The same conditions for career and vocational guidance, for access to studies and for the achievement of diplomas in educational establishments of all categories in rural as well as in urban areas; this equality shall be ensured in pre-school, general, technical, professional and higher technical education, as well as in all types of vocational training” (art.10.a.); “The same opportunities to benefit from scholarships and other study grants” (art.10.d.); “The reduction of female student drop-out rates and the organization of programs for girls and women who have left school prematurely” (art.10.f);
- Equality during education: “Access to the same curricula, the same examinations, teaching staff with qualifications of the same standard and school premises and equipment of the same quality” (art.10.b.); “The same opportunities for access to programs of continuing education, including adult and functional literacy programs, particularly those aimed at reducing, at the earliest possible time, any gap in education existing between men and women” (art.10.e.); “The same Opportunities to participate actively in sports and physical education” (art.10.g.); “To obtain all types of training and education, formal and non-formal, including that relating to functional literacy” (art.14.2.d.);

- Equality gained after education: “The right to free choice of profession and employment, the right to promotion, job security and all benefits and conditions of service and the right to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training” (art.11.1.c.).

The reproduction of gender inequality is defined as basic principles in the context of education. Non-formal education is mentioned to prevent inequality in the reproduction process. However, the hidden curriculum is emphasized in this reproduction, stating that gender, the roles of men and women (art.10.c.), the importance of marriage/motherhood (art.16.1.e.; art.5.b.): The social position, the stereotypes related to social duty or responsibility are injected through education. Various measures are against the imposition of stereotypes, within the scope of education:

- Reproduction of social awareness through education: Family education (art.5.b.), “The same rights to decide freely and responsibly on the number and spacing of their children and to have access to the information, education and means to enable them to exercise these rights” (art.16.1.e.);
- Reproduction and quality control of educational content (methods/programs/textbooks): “The elimination of any stereotyped concept of the roles of men and women at all levels and in all forms of education by encouraging coeducation and other types of education which will help to achieve this aim and, in particular, by the revision of textbooks

and school programs and the adaptation of teaching methods” (art.10.c.).

4.3. United Nations Beijing Action Plan (1995): Mention of gender?

Like the Convention Against Discrimination in Education and the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, this Plan guarantees gender equality:

- Equal access, continuation and completion: “Ensure women’s equal access to economic resources, including land, credit, science and technology, vocational training, information, communication and markets, as a means to further the advancement and empowerment of women and girls, including through the enhancement of their capacities to enjoy the benefits of equal access to these resources, inter alia, by means of international cooperation” (art.35);
- Equality during education: “Ensure equal access to and equal treatment of women and men in education and health care and enhance women's sexual and reproductive health as well as education” (art.30);
- Equality gained after education: “Promote people-centered sustainable development, including sustained economic growth, through the provision of basic education, life-long education, literacy and training, and primary health care for girls and women” (art.27).

The rights of health (sexual health/reproductive health, art.30) and to education (basic education, lifelong education, science and technology, art.27) are one of the most fundamental rights and freedoms of the individual. The plan states that gender equality

(progress/empowerment of women, art.35) has positive results in the development of the state (economic growth, sustainable development, international cooperation, art.27). In this respect, education policies reflect the economic and geopolitical situation of the state.

4.4. United Nations Millennium Development Goals (2000): Mention of gender?

8 goals are determined in this context. “Achieving global primary education” (goal 2) and “empowering women by promoting gender equality” (goal 3) are among the goals.

As of the first part of the declaration (values/principles), gender equality is adopted as basic principle. As emphasized within the scope of the Beijing Action Plan, the Millennium Development Goals stated that the “development of the state” (art.20) and thus its “geopolitical situation” (art.6) are related to the equality of opportunity in the society (“gender equality as an effective means”, art.20):

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “Girls and boys all over the world complete a full term of primary education... their access to education” (art.19);
- Equality during education: “Equality of opportunity for girls and boys in education” (art.19);
- Equality gained after education: “To strengthen the equality of women and men and to increase the effectiveness of women” (art.20).

4.5. Council of Europe Istanbul Convention (2011): Mention of gender?

Türkiye adopted the convention in 2011. The state withdrew from this convention with the President’s Decision dated 20 March 2021, despite being highly criticized by opposition parties, NGOs, and other state leaders in Türkiye.

As in the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, the Istanbul Convention evaluated gender inequality based on discrimination/violence and mentioned gender equality in education:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “Access to services to facilitate their recovery from violence, including access to health care and social services” (art.20);
- Equality during education: “Where necessary, teaching material on: gender-based violence against women, and the right to personal integrity - in all forms of education and at all levels” (art.14); “Provide training for professionals on dealing with victims or perpetrators of gender-based violence” (art.15); “Support and treatment programs should be established” (art.16);
- Equality gained after training: “Equality between men and women, non-stereotyped gender roles, respect, non-violent conflict resolution” (art.14); “Preventing perpetrators from re-offending and supporting them to adopt non-violent behaviors” (art.16).

It is important to ensure the integrity between education law (art.16) and education policies to promote gender equality (in the official curriculum, art.14; treatment programs, art.16). The hidden curriculum has a role in the reproduction of gender inequality through education. It is aimed to review the educational content with political control to break the

stereotypes, by stating that gender is reproduced with gender roles full of social stereotypes in the hidden curriculum (art.14) and violent behavior patterns (art.16). While violence against women is increasing day by day in Türkiye, (367 women were murdered in 2021, 438 women were murdered in 2023 and 71 women were murdered in the first part of 2024 - as of 29 June data - Ministry of Internal Affairs of Türkiye), the state should not, as a precaution against murder, withdraw from the Istanbul Convention: The state should regulate its education policies in accordance with the convention.

5. REPRODUCTION OF GENDER INEQUALITY BY EDUCATION IN THE NATIONAL LEGISLATION OF THE REPUBLIC OF TÜRKİYE

Türkiye accepted international agreements other than the Istanbul Convention and recognize the right to education. Are all the equality principles adopted to ensure the reproduction of gender inequality through education? To what extent is national legislation compatible with international agreements?

5.1. Constitution of the Republic of Türkiye (1982): Mention of gender?

According to the Constitution, education law is based on equality of opportunity (“education of students without financial discrimination”, art.42) and gender equality (“gender equality without discrimination”, 10; “compulsory for all citizens; male/female”, art.42). Gender equality is declared in the Constitution such as:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “No one can be deprived of the right to education and training; The state provides the necessary assistance through scholarships and other means so that they can continue their education;

Education and training activities cannot be prevented in any way” (art.42).

The constitution stated that education is a concrete result of political control (“education is determined and regulated by law... carried out under the supervision and control of the state”, art.42) and social reproduction (“in line with Atatürk’s principles and reforms”, 42). The basic condition for the reproduction of gender equality through education is the access of women and men to education (“cannot be deprived”, art.42), its continuity (“continuity of education”, art.42) and completion (“it cannot be prevented by any means”, art.42).

In this sense, national legislation is not compatible with international agreements. The education problems are due to the limitation in legal regulations: The necessary legal regulations are made for the application of gender equality.

5.2. National Education Basic Law (1973): Mention of gender?

According to the Constitution, the right to education, equality of opportunity (“open to everyone without discrimination... no privileges can be granted”, art.4; “students without financial discrimination, free...”, art.8) and gender equality (“equality for all men and women”, art.8); “male-female co-education”, art.15). There is a statement that “every Turkish citizen has the right to receive education” (art.7). Within the framework of this law, the basic principles supporting the reproduction of gender equality are as follows:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “Citizens benefit from education institutions after primary education to the extent of their interests and abilities” (art.7); “To enable them to study up to the highest levels” (art.8); “Some schools according to the type

of education, opportunities and necessities” (art.15).

As seen in the Constitution, the reproduction of gender inequality through education is limited only to equal access, attendance and completion. None statement about the official/hidden curriculum in the national legislation.

While the basic principles of gender equality in education are comprehensively addressed in international agreements, the national legislation are not regulated for practice (deprived of solutions). But which national legislation in practice?

6. REPRODUCTION OF GENDER INEQUALITY IN THE CONTEXT OF THE TURKISH EDUCATION POLICIES

It is important to examine policy documents and curricula in the context of the Turkish education policy.

6.1. State Development Plans (1963-2023): Mention of gender?

There is no mention of gender equality in education in the 1st (1963-1967), 3rd (1973-1977), 4th (1979-1983) and 5th (1985-1989) State Development Plans. The 6th plan (1990-1994) consists of an explanation as “the cornerstone of the Turkish society...the importance of protecting and educating women” (art.29, p.3). As a result, half of the State Development Plans (5/11) are not based on gender equality in education policies.

6.1.1. 2nd Five-Year State Development Plan (1968-1972): Mention of gender?

Gender equality is defined through non-formal education (maternal and child and public health and family planning programs; special women’s education programs) and reproduction process. The gender equality principles adopted in this process are as follows:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “In various non-formal education activities directed to the village and various levels of technical education for girls; Promotion of housewifery and motherhood information through programs to women in different social environments by the Ministry of National Education”;
- Equality during education: “Programs are developed for women; A Women’s education campaign by the Ministry of National Education with the help of ministries, public institutions, public associations and voluntary organizations dealing with this issue in order for it to be adopted/implemented throughout the country”;
- Equality gained after education: “Increasing the superior value of women -as housewives and mothers- in the Turkish society; Helping Turkish women to take their necessary place in social life”.

The reproduction of inequality is included against the reproduction of gender inequality in the plan.

According to the gender identity which is defined in accordance with political control and is imposed in reproduction, a woman is considered as the housewife/mother as the supreme value in the Turkish society (social expectation). In this process, this hidden curriculum is equipped with this social duty/responsibility inculcated: “The place that Turkish women should take in society, as it is aimed to convey the knowledge of housewifery/motherhood to large masses and to adopt/implement it throughout the country...” Therefore, although this plan guarantees equality in its appearance, it reproduces gender inequality with stereotypes with its fundamental/implementation policies in education.

6.1.2. 7th Five-Year State Development Plan (1996-2000): Mention of gender?

Most of these equality indicators are not included in this plan. Only the equality gained after education is indicated as: “Women’s participation in social life as an individual with equal status” (p.38). The reproduction through education (“raising the social status of women” -p.13-; “education for the highest level of welfare”, p.38) is explained by the development efforts of the state (“women’s education is the important driving force of development”, p.4; “with the emphasis on women’s education”, p.38).

The policies are not determined for their application in this plan. Although there are statements such as “promotion of equality between women and men” (p.13) and “elimination of the issues that negatively affect the place of the Turkish women in society” (p.38), the plan is deprived of concrete solution proposals: There are basic policies (Tural, 1991).

6.1.3. 8th Five-Year State Development Plan (2001-2005): Mention of gender?

Reproduction of gender inequality through education is mentioned as:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “Increasing the period of compulsory basic education to 8 years, increasing the education level of women” (art.806); “Ensuring effective participation of women in education... formal and non-formal education... written and visual communication tools” (art.815);
- Equality during education: “Increasing the literacy rate of women... courses” (art.806);
- Equality gained after education: “Elimination of prejudices from society” (art.815).

Just like the 8th Plan, the gender equality is adopted in the basic policies and not in the implementation policies. It is an important

limitation in terms of the application of gender equality in Türkiye.

6.1.4. 9th Five-Year State Development Plan (2007-2013): Mention of gender?

There are gender indicators in education:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “Reducing drop-outs in primary education... increasing transition rates to secondary education” (art.585.); “Access to education for rural girls, disabled people and children from low-income families” (art.623);
- Equality during education: “Education for raising awareness of society in order to prevent violence and abuse against women” (art.260); “Developing vocational training opportunities” (art.621);
- Equality gained after education: “Increasing employability to increase women’s participation in economic and social life” (art.621).

The period covered by the plan coincides with the period when the Republic of Türkiye signed the Istanbul Convention: The plan aims to prevent possible situations of violence against women and to raise awareness. However, the purpose is limited only to basic policies in education.

According to the plan, the basic condition for the reproduction of gender equality through education is gender: Access to education (“rural girls, children with disabilities and low-income family access to education”, art.623), its continuation (“transition to secondary education”, art.585) and completion (“reducing dropouts in primary education”, art.585). In line with the target, concrete suggestions are not specified in the plan.

6.1.5. 10th Five-Year State Development Plan (2014-2018): Mention of gender?

As 9th plan, this plan includes gender equality principles:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “Access to school, especially for disabled/girls in primary/secondary education... reduction of grade retention and drop-out” (art.147);
- Equality gained after education: “Increasing the level of women’s participation in business and social life, especially through education, economic and social development of countries” (art.45); “Active participation in employment/decision-making mechanisms... improving education (art.247); “The empowerment of women in social, cultural/economic life, the development of status by protecting the family institution, and the strengthening of social integration” (art.249).

The remarkable point of the plan is the absence of equality in education. The participation in the social life that women will deserve after receiving education is evaluated in terms of the development of the state. It should not be forgotten that the hidden curriculum is as important as the official curriculum in the reproduction of gender inequality through education policies.

This plan contains hidden curriculum information: According to the gender identity imposed by the state in this plan, a woman is considered as the “female bird that makes the nest”, like the Turkish proverb. According to this patriarchal-based stereotype, “strengthening the role of women in cultural/economic life is essential for the protection of the family institution and social integration” (art.249). While the plan aims to raise women as individuals compatible with society by controlling various stereotypes, gender inequality is reproduced through education policies.

6.1.6. 11th Five-Year State Development Plan (2019-2023): Mention of gender?

According to the plan, the construction of an ideal society is realized with an education policy based on gender equality (“the construction of a strong society is possible through the empowerment of women”, art.542). Gender equality indicators in education policies are as follows:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “Facilitating girls’/women’s access to resources through education” (art.542); “Increasing the enrollment, attendance and completion rates of women/girls at all levels of education” (art.601.1);
- Equality during education: “Women’s universities” (art.560.2); “Vocational training of women in the field of technology production such as coding and software” (art.570.1); “Development of women’s economic activities...training program and seminar for empowering entrepreneurs in e-commerce” (art.600.4); “According to the different labor needs of the provinces, women’s training, internship, on-the-job training” (art.600.6); “To prevent violence against women, early and forced marriages... training, seminars etc. awareness raising” (art.602.2);
- Equality gained after education: “Increasing their participation in social/economic life...improving the status of women in society” (art.542); “Women’s employment in the labor market” (art.570.1).

Education policies that come into play in the reproduction of gender inequality are fundamental: Although education’s accessibility (“registration”, art.601.1.), sustainability (“continuation”, art.601.1.), and completion (art.601.1.) are advocated in these plans and not supported by implementation policy (no statistical data).

The criteria of equality gained after education is important as in 7th and 10th plans: The development of the state is associated with the participation of women in social life through education. In line with this participation-development cause-effect relationship, the contents of the program to be applied in women's education are mentioned as: "Coding, software education" (art.570.1); "e-commerce training program" (art.600.4); "education according to the labor force of the provinces" (art.600).

The period covered by the plan (2019-2023) is the period of withdrawal from the Istanbul Convention (2021). While the focus of the convention is the prevention of violence against women, the state's withdrawal from the convention do not take any measures with its determination/implementation policies. It means that it does not support gender equality.

In the reproduction with education policies, the establishment of a university "where only women will be accepted" (art.560.2) is in the content of the last state development plan. The aim is to control the movement of women in the social order, to reproduce gender with the dominant ideology (Foucault, 2011; Butler, 2012). Patriarchal authority reproduces gender inequality (Arnot, 2002): Women's university does not make women's participation in social/political life equal with men, on the contrary, it isolates women from social life and makes them a second-class citizen who suffers from discrimination. However, according to the gender equality gained after education, the participation of everyone in social/political life should be equal, regardless of male or female. Women's university is not an acceptable policy proposal in this sense.

6.2. National Education Council Decisions (1939-2021): Mention of Gender?

There are 20 National Education Council Decisions: In the 2nd (1943), 4th (1949), 5th (1953), 6th (1970), 11th (1982), 13th (1990), 14th (1993), 17th (2006), 19th (2014) and 20th (2021) Council Decisions, there is no statement about gender equality (10/20). Some National Education Council Decisions give a definition of gender equality: 1st (1939); 3rd (1946); 6th (1957); 9th (1974); 10th (1981) and 15th (1996).

Most Council Decisions (16/20) are not based on gender equality. Only 4 National Education Council Decisions are directly related to gender equality in education. This is the first indication that the gender equality limitation in the Five-Year State Development Plan in education policies could not be overcome with the National Education Council Decisions. It is useful to examine other decisions (4/20):

6.2.1. 7th National Education Council Decisions (1962): Mention of Gender?

In terms of gender equality indicators in education, there are criteria as:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: "Transformation of girls' institutes into a three-year vocational school based on secondary school" (art.6); "A four-year high school that trains teachers...-girls technical college-" (art.F);
- Equality during education: "Naming girls/boys art institutes -girls/boys art high schools-" (art.8); "Having girls' art schools - women's vocational schools-" (art.9); "Having a technical teacher school for girls...-girls technical teacher school-" (art.F);
- Equality gained after education: "For our young girls to earn their living productively with good housewife and citizenship qualities" (art.6); "Making Turkish women competent in solving their problems related to food, nutrition, childcare and education; the opportunity to earn a living through one of the

handicrafts, which makes him competent to manage his house skillfully” (art.9).

These Decisions include each of the indicators of gender equality in education. In particular, the types of schools (“girls’ institutes”, art.6; “girls’ technical higher teacher’s school”, art.F) and the transformation of these schools for equal participation of every individual in education (“girls/boys art high schools”, art.8; “women’s vocational school”, art.9).

The equality gained after education is shared in addition to the official curriculum information above: According to the gender identity aimed, the women are considered as “our young girls” (art.6) or “Turkish women” (art.9), “housewives/citizens” (art.6) “... competent in childcare; manages her house skillfully” (art.9). Her social position, her duty/responsibility are explained with patriarchal-based stereotypes: The gender inequality is reproduced with political control.

6.2.2. 12th National Education Council Decisions (1988): Mention of Gender?

These decisions, which are like the 7th Council articles in terms of school type, are listed according to gender equality indicators in education:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “Admission of female students to vocational schools without examination... Encouraging school attendance” (art.A.19);
- Equality during education: “Student resources of Girls’ Art Education Colleges, Girls’ Vocational... and other vocational high schools” (art.III.6);
- Equality gained after education: “Graduates of technical higher education schools for girls... also graduates of male technical higher teacher schools... starting civil service

from a higher degree, just like the graduates” (art.T.29).

6.2.3. 16th National Education Council Decisions (1999): Mention of Gender?

The gender indicators in education are as follows:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “Providing scholarships to female students in order to increase schooling in post-primary education” (art.42);
- Equality during education: “Ensuring the participation of female students in vocational and technical education programs... No discrimination based on gender should be made in textbooks and other course materials” (art.36); “Directing our women to the profession through non-formal education” (art.44);
- Equality gained after education: “Education should be perceived in bringing the current workforce into the economy, and women's employment in production” (art.37).

As in the 7th and the 12th Council Decisions, the types of schools for women are discussed within the scope of equality in the 16th Council Decisions. Another point is that textbooks are mentioned for the first time in the reproduction through education (“textbooks should not be discriminated against based on gender”, art.36).

Since education is the prerequisite for the development of the state, “vocational training and employment of the female labor force in the economy” (art.37) are emphasized in the reproduction process. However, this “education should be supported by implementation policies” to be accepted in reproduction (art.37).

6.2.4. 18th National Education Council Decisions (2010): Mention of Gender?

As in the other Council Decisions, the scope of the gender equality is very limited to the 18th Council Decisions:

- Equal access, attendance and completion: “To promote the children with difficulties in access to secondary education... ensuring access for girls” (art.13); “Promote for female students to continue their secondary education” (art.14); “Equal numbers of male/female students... their participation in the democratic process” (art.34).

As seen in the national legislation, the reproduction of gender inequality is limited to equal access, attendance and completion in the 18th National Education Council Decisions. Considering that the basic framework of the Turkish education policy is drawn by the National Education Council Decisions and these decisions are incomplete in the basics/application, important problems exist in the Turkish Education System.

The Five-Year State Development Plans, one of the basic documents of the Turkish education policies, make up for this gap in national legislation and National Education Council Decisions. However, as a result, fundamental/implementation policies cannot be ignored. The Turkish education policies, which basically have limitations, are not supported by implementation policies.

6.3. Ministry of National Education/Council of Higher Education Policy Documents: Mention of Gender?

The social activities regulation document, which is among the policy documents of the Ministry of National Education/Council of Higher Education, and which come into play in the reproduction of gender inequality, should be examined in the context of the Turkish education policies.

6.3.1. Ministry of National Education Social Activities Regulation (2017): Mention of Gender?

There is only one article that includes the reproduction of gender inequality through education. Within the scope of the National Education Council Decisions, this article is completely deprived of fundamental/implementation policies (“raising awareness on gender equality issues”, art.7.1.).

The expression of “gender equality in education” in the 7th article is deleted (art.7.1.), because Türkiye withdrawal from the Istanbul Convention (2021): Education policies reflect the social, economic and political situation of the state: The dominant ideology directly affects the educational administration at the macro/micro level. Policies under the control: State reproduce gender inequality and particularly, education policies are integrated with patriarchal authority.

6.3.2. Council of Higher Education Gender Equality Attitude Document (2015)

The gender equality course, gender equality awareness for administrative/academic staff and students, and violence against women in higher education is discussed in the document (Council of Higher Education, 2015). To ensure gender equality in higher education, this document is sent to universities on November 9, 2015, asking to recognize gender equality in their bylaws.

However, the Council of Higher Education, which adopts the harmonization of fundamental/implementation policies to ensure integrity within the borders of the state, acted in line with the Ministry of National Education and completely abolished the Council of Higher Education Gender Equality Attitude Document in February 2019 (Council of Higher Education). This negative situation is explained on the grounds that gender equality does not “coincide with the values of the Turkish society” (Council of Higher Education, 2019). According to the state, this equality contradicts the dominant ideology.

7. MINISTRY OF NATIONAL EDUCATION/COUNCIL OF HIGHER EDUCATION OFFICIAL CURRICULUM: MENTION OF GENDER?

Gender equality is limited in key policy documents of the Turkish education policies. Official curriculum should be analyzed in terms of this equality:

7.1. Ministry of National Education Primary/Secondary Education Official Curriculum: Mention of Gender?

Human Rights, Citizenship and Democracy Course is given to 4th graders in primary education. Democracy and Human Rights Course is taught to all grades 9-12 in secondary education. These courses are not directly related to gender equality:

7.1.1. Primary Education 4th Grade Human Rights, Citizenship and Democracy Course (2016)

Following the signature of the Istanbul Convention (2011), Citizenship and Human Rights Education Course for 8th graders is added to the official curriculum between 2011 and 2016. However, after the removal of the course from the curriculum, another course is introduced in 2016, this time for 4th graders. This course is Human Rights, Citizenship and Democracy Course: It is compulsory for 4th graders and is taught for 2 hours per week (Ministry of National Education, 2022a). According to the official curriculum, only one of the 6 course units included gender equality achievements. The third unit in question is called Justice and Equality.

Y.4.3.1. and Y.4.3.2 coded Human Rights, Citizenship and Democracy Course, in the context of gender equality (art.Y.4.3.2) women's rights (art.Y.4.3.1) are mentioned very briefly. The Human Rights, Citizenship and Democracy Course is not taught at the other primary school levels (classes 1 to 8), except for the 4th grade. Why the Citizenship and Human Rights Education Course, which is taught to 8th grade since 2011, is removed from the official curriculum in 2016? Why the Human Rights, Citizenship and Democracy Course, which is compulsory for 4th grade, is limited to a single class (1/8th grade) in primary education?

7.1.2. Secondary School 9th-12th Grades Democracy and Human Rights Lesson (since 2013)

With the signature of the Istanbul Convention in 2011, the secondary education elective course prepared in accordance with this agreement by Ministry of National Education in 2013 is Democracy and Human Rights Course: It is a course offered to choose from the field of social sciences for 1 lesson per week in the Anatolian-Social Sciences-Science High Schools for 9th, 10th, 11th and 12th grades, (Ministry of National Education, 2022b).

According to the official curriculum, the course units have gender equality outcomes without distinction between 9th, 10th, 11th and 12th grade. These units are Human Rights and Freedoms, Pluralistic Perspectives on Diversity, and Peace and Reconciliation, respectively.

The Secondary Education Democracy and Human Rights Course aims to “prevent violence against women” (art.3) based on “gender equality” (art.1 and art.4; Istanbul Convention

focus). Gender equality is only a preposition in these course outcomes, just as it is in the Human Rights, Citizenship and Democracy Lesson at the primary education level. However, while the course taught in primary education is compulsory, this course in secondary education is an elective course. It is a point to be questioned within the framework of education policies.

Considering that Türkiye withdrew from the Istanbul Convention in 2021, the first/still most up-to-date official curriculum of the Democracy and Human Rights Course prepared by the Ministry of National Education in line with the convention is dated 2013. It is ideological to keep this course in the elective course pool. What needs to be done once again is to examine the content of the textbook prepared by the Ministry of National Education according to the hidden curriculum.

7.2. Council of Higher Education Under/Graduate Programs: Mention of Gender?

Gender courses taught as a course in postgraduate programs are classified according to the type of program:

7.2.1. Gender Course in Undergraduate Programs

Out of 207 universities in Türkiye, only 51 teach gender-based undergraduate programs. Most of these courses are given as elective courses (elective 49/51; compulsory 9/51). Sociology (14/51), Political Science (12/51), etc. from Social Sciences departments. Psychology (9/51) and Social Work (6/51), Health Sciences, Midwifery (4/51) and Nursing (4/51) take the

lead in terms of the number of gender-based courses. This is a limitation that should be seriously questioned, and the course content should be examined according to the hidden curriculum.

7.2.2. Gender Courses in Graduate Programs

Out of 207 universities, only 19 offer a gender-based course at the graduate level (see hidden curriculum): 13 graduate programs are gender-based. 12 programs (Politics, Sociology, Literature...) are gender elective courses. Besides these programs, there are also universities with gender-related Research Centers. However, none of them remove the gender course limitation in higher education.

8. CONCLUSION, DISCUSSION AND SUGGESTIONS

Gender equality observed in national legislation and education policies; the state's withdrawal from the Council of Europe Istanbul Convention (which each article is related to gender and particularly, articles 14, 15 and 16 are related to education -none of the articles on education can be replaced by any legislation-, 2021); the limited-mention of gender in Ministry of National Education Social Activities Regulation (2019); all policy applications carried out in education in accordance with the political control of the state, such as the repeal of the Council of Higher Education Gender Equality Attitude Document (2019), the cancellation of the classes that include the subject of gender in primary/secondary education, albeit partially, and the significant limitation of gender lessons in higher education, have an important role in the reproduction of gender inequality. Gender-based policies, which

are in the dominant ideology, do not overlap with Turkish values, and its arrangement reproduces gender inequality.

Does the partial recognition of gender equality in the basic policies of education show that equality is also valid in implementation policies? In other words, does the legislation and practice match? Because the fundamental policies are not implemented (Tural, 1991, p. 19). The most important limitation in the Turkish education policies is that basic and implementation policies do not form a whole. This limitation is clearly observed in all the policy documents reviewed in the present paper: Basic policies in education are deprived of many of the principles of gender equality, and implementation policies have not been included at all. Since these policies, which are basically already limited, are not supported by implementation policies, the problems of gender inequality exist in the Turkish Education System. The solution to all problems is the reproduction process of gender with education policies to political control (in addition to political control, socio-cultural factors are also effective on

education policies). It is important on which idea/ideology these policies are based.

The main reason for the restriction or (partial or no) recognition of gender equality in the country is that this equality is left to its own limitations in national legislation and basic policies. In other words, the main reason is that the state does not prepare legal texts or policy documents according to the basic principles recognized by international law. In this sense, the Turkish education law/policies should be regulated in accordance with international law (by recognizing the Istanbul Convention), and gender equality should be reproduced through education policies. The number of gender courses of higher education should be significantly increased in the official curriculum: These courses should be made compulsory; all gender stereotypes should be deleted from hidden curriculums (method and textbook); social responsibility projects should be increased with the support of Non-Governmental Organizations. Gender equality should be reproduced in integrity with the Turkish education policies.

KAYNAKÇA

- Althusser, L. (2010). Ideology and the ideological apparatus of the state. (A. Tümertekin, trans.), İstanbul: İthaki Editions.
- Apple, M. W. (2012). Education and power. (E. Bulut, trans.), İstanbul: Kalkedon.
- Arnot M. (2002). Reproducing Gender? Essays on Educational Theory and Feminist Politics. London: Routledge Falmer.

- Bardin. L (2011). L'analyse de Contenu. Paris : Presses Universitaires de France.
- Boudon, R. (1986). L'idéologie. L'origine des idées reçues. Paris : Librairie Artheme Fayard.
- Bourdieu, P. ve Passeron, J.-C. (1964). Les Héritiers. Les étudiants et la culture. Paris : Les Editions de Minuit.
- Bourdieu, P. ve Passeron, J.-C. (1970). La reproduction. Eléments pour une théorie du système d'Enseignement. Paris : Les Editions de Minuit.

- Butler, J. (2008). *Gender trouble: feminism and the subversion of identity* (trans. B. Ertür, 3rd Editions), İstanbul: Metis.
- Council of Higher Education (2022). "List of Public and Private University". retrieved from <https://www.yok.gov.tr/universiteler/universitelerimiz> (02.04.2022).
- Constitution of the Republic of Türkiye (1982). retrieved from <https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/mevzuatmetin/1.5.2709.pdf> (27.03.2022).
- Council of Europe (2011). "Istanbul Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women and Domestic Violence". retrieved from <https://www.coe.int/en/web/gender-matters/council-of-europe-convention-on-preventing-and-combating-violence-against-women-and-domestic-violence> (24.09.2022).
- Council of Higher Education (2015). "Council of Higher Education gender equality attitude sheet". retrieved from <https://dekaum.deu.edu.tr/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/Tutum-Belgesi.pdf> (01.04.2022).
- Council of Higher Education (2019). "Council of Higher Education gender equality attitude sheet. Press briefing". retrieved from https://basin.yok.gov.tr/InternetHaberleriBelgeleri/Internet%20Haber%20Belgeleri/2019/64_o_belgenin_adida_icerigide_degisiyor.pdf (01.04.2022).
- Dewey, J. (2003). *Education and social change. The Social Frontier*, 3, 235-238.
- Durkheim, E. (1968). *Education et sociologie*. Paris : Les Presses Universitaires de France.
- Foucault, M. (2011). *Subject and power - selected essays 2*. (I. Ergüden & O. Akınhay, trans., 3rd Editions), İstanbul: Ayrıntı Editions.
- Giroux, H. A. (1998). *Teachers as intellectuals*. New York: Bergin and Garey.
- Kaplan, İ. (2011). *National Education Ideology in Türkiye and Its Effect on Political Socialization*. İstanbul: İletişim Editions.
- Laslett, B. and Brenner, J. (1989). *Gender and social reproduction: historical perspectives*, *Annual Review of Sociology*, 14, 381-404.
- Maguire, M. (2002). *Globalization, education policy and the teacher*, *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, 12(3), 261-276.
- Meyer, E. J. (2007). *Gender and sexual diversity in schools*. New York: Springer.
- Ministry of National Education (1962). "7th National Education Council". retrieved from https://ttkb.Ministry of National Education.gov.tr/Ministry of National Education_iys_dosyalar/2021_12/08162_906_7_sura.pdf (31.03.2022).
- Ministry of National Education (1988). "12th National Education Council". retrieved from https://ttkb.Ministry of National Education.gov.tr/Ministry of National Education_iys_dosyalar/2017_09/29165_252_12_sura.pdf (31.03.2022).
- Ministry of National Education (1999). "16th National Education Council". retrieved from [https://ttkb.Ministry of National Education.gov.tr/Ministry of National Education_iys_dosyalar/2017_09/29165_252_12_sura.pdf](https://ttkb.Ministry of National Education.gov.tr/Ministry of National Education.gov.tr/Ministry of National Education_iys_dosyalar/2017_09/29165_252_12_sura.pdf) (31.03.2022).

- Education_iys_dosyalar/2020_02/21142534_16_sura.pdf (31.03.2022).
- Ministry of National Education (2010). "18th National Education Council". retrieved from https://ttkb.Ministry of National Education.gov.tr/Ministry of National Education_iys_dosyalar/2017_09/29170222_18_sura.pdf (31.03.2022).
- Ministry of National Education (2013). "Secondary Education Democracy and Human Rights Curriculum". retrieved from <http://mufredat.Ministry of National Education.gov.tr/ProgramDetay.aspx?PID=1106> (01.04.2022).
- Ministry of National Education (2017). "Ministry of National Education Social Activities Regulation". retrieved from https://ogm.Ministry of National Education.gov.tr/Ministry of National Education_iys_dosyalar/2017_06/14142206_yYnetmelik.pdf (01.04.2022).
- Ministry of National Education (2018). "Human rights, citizenship and democracy course curriculum -Primary School 4th Grade-". retrieved from <http://mufredat.Ministry of National Education.gov.tr/Dosyalar/2018120202622474-INSAN%20HAKLARI%20YURTTASLIK%20VE%20DEMOKRASI%20OGRETIM%20PROGRAMI.pdf> (01.04.2022).
- Ministry of National Education (2019). "Ministry of National Education Social Activities Regulation". retrieved from https://ogm.Ministry of National Education.gov.tr/Ministry of National Education_iys_dosyalar/2019_09/25145204_SOSYAL_ETKYNLYKLER_YON.pdf (01.04.2022).
- Ministry of National Education (2022a). "Primary schools weekly lesson schedule". retrieved from http://ttkb.Ministry of National Education.gov.tr/Ministry of National Education_iys_dosyalar/2022_01/19093950_ilkogretim-hdc-karar-ve-eki-2022-2023.pdf (01.04.2022).
- Ministry of National Education (2022b). "Secondary education institutions weekly course schedule". retrieved from http://ttkb.Ministry of National Education.gov.tr/Ministry of National Education_iys_dosyalar/2022_01/19094445_Ortaoyretim-hdc-2022-2023.pdf (01.04.2022).
- National Education Basic Law (1973). <https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/1.5.1739.pdf> (27.03.2022).
- Oakley, A. (1972). Sex, gender and society. New York: Harper and Row.
- Özaydınlık, K. (2014). Women and education in Türkiye on the basis of gender, Journal of Social Policy Studies, 33, 93-112.
- Platon (2021). State. 45th Edition. İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür Editions.
- Scott, D. (2000). Reading educational research and policy. Londra: Routledge/Falmer Editions.
- Sönmez, V. (2017). Educational philosophy. 10th Edition. Ankara: Anı Editions.
- State Planning Organization (1967). "2nd Five-Year State Development Plans". retrieved from https://www.sbb.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Ikinci_Bes_Yil

- Yillik_Kalkinma_Planı-1968-1972.pdf (29.03.2022).
- State Planning Organization (1995). “7th Five-Year State Development Plans”. retrieved from https://www.sbb.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Yedinci_Bes_Yillik_Kalkinma_Planı-1996-2000.pdf (29.03.2022).
- State Planning Organization (2000). “Five-Year State Development Plans”. retrieved from https://www.sbb.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Sekizinci_Bes_Yillik_Kalkinma_Planı-2001-2005.pdf (29.03.2022).
- State Planning Organization (2006). “Five-Year State Development Plans”. retrieved from https://www.sbb.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Dokuzuncu_Kalkinma_Planı-2007-2013.pdf (29.03.2022).
- State Planning Organization (2013). “Five-Year State Development Plans”. retrieved from https://www.sbb.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Onuncu_Kalkinma_Planı-2014-2018.pdf (29.03.2022).
- State Planning Organization (2018). “11th Five-Year State Development Plans”. retrieved from https://www.sbb.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/On_Birinci_Kalkinma_Planı-2019-2023.pdf (29.03.2022).
- Tezcan, M. (2003). The Hidden Curriculum: A Concept Analysis for the Sociology of Education, Turkish Journal of Educational Sciences, 1(1), 53-59.
- Tural, N. and Karakütük, K. (1991). Education Policy, Journal of Education and Science, 15(82), 16-24.
- TÜSİAD (2008). Gender Inequality in Türkiye: Problems, Priorities and Solutions, TÜSİAD-T/2008- Report No. 07/468. Ankara: TÜSİAD.
- Ünal, I. L. (2005). Education as a reproduction process of economic ideology, Economic Approach, 16(57), 35-50.
- United Nations (1960). “Convention Against Discrimination in Education”. retrieved from <https://www.ohchr.org/en/instruments-mechanisms/instruments/convention-against-discrimination-education> (20.09.2022).
- United Nations (1979). “Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women”. retrieved from <https://www.ohchr.org/en/instruments-mechanisms/instruments/convention-elimination-all-forms-discrimination-against-women> (20.09.2022).
- United Nations (1995). “Beijing Action Plan”. retrieved from [chrome-extension://efaidnbmnnnibpcajpcgclefjndmkaj/https://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/pdf/BDPfA%20E.pdf](https://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/pdf/BDPfA%20E.pdf) (21.09.2022).
- United Nations (2000). Millennium Development Goals Declaration. retrieved from [https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/millennium-development-goals-\(mdgs\)](https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/millennium-development-goals-(mdgs)) (24.09.2022).

- Vogel, L. (2003). *Women in Marxist Theory*. (trans. M. Öngören). İstanbul: Pencere Editions.
- Weber, R. P. (1989). *Basic content analysis*. Londra: Sage University Paper.
- Wiborg, S. (2000). *Political and Cultural Nationalism in Education. The Ideas of Rousseau and Herder Concerning National Education, Comparative Education Nigel Grant Festschrift*, 36(22), 235-243.