Globalization, Transnational Migration and Associations	Küreselleşme, Ulus Ötesi Göç ve Dernek

Seher ÇATALOĞLU[1]
Meryem BULUT[2]

Abstract

This study was conducted with Kirkuk Turkmens migrating into Istanbul from Iraq. It was performed in the period between 2014 and 2017. The study was conducted in participatory observation and in-depth interview technique. Reflexive paradigm was adopted in this study.

It was found in this study that the movement to Istanbul had the properties of internal migration rather than of external migration although it seemed to be an external migration. Associations and relatives are the key elements in establishing and preserving the ties between countries. The relatives in the country of origin and in the country of migration cause transnational migration with the explicit effects of communicative and transport instruments. Thus, the migrating individuals or groups lead

Öz

Bu araştırma Irak'tan göç yoluyla İstanbul'a gelen Kerküklü Türkmenler ile yapılmıştır. Çalışma 2014 – 2017 yılları arasında, İstanbul'da gerçekleştirilmiştir. Araştırma katılımlı gözlem ve derinlemesine görüşme tekniği ile yapılmıştır. Araştırmada elde edilen verilerin yorumlanmasında düşünümsel paradigma benimsenmiştir.

Araştırmada Irak'tan İstanbul'a yapılan taşınmanın, dış göç gibi gözükse de aslında nitelik olarak daha çok iç göç özellikleri gösterdiği belirlenmiştir. Ulus ötesi göçün aracısı ve sebebi göçmen ilişkiler ağlarıdır. Dernekler ve akrabalar, ülkeler arasında bağlantıyı kuran ve koruyan göçmen ilişkiler ağının önemli öğeleridir. Köken ülkede ve göç edilen ülkede var olan akrabalar, iletişim ve ulaşım araçlarının

[1]Seher Çataloğlu, Doktora öğrencisi, Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Antropoloji Bölümü, sehercataloglu@gmail.com, Orcid: 0000-0001-5783-1794
[2]Meryem Bulut, Doç.Dr., Ankara Üniversitesi, Antropoloji Bölümü, mbulut@ankara.edu.tr, Orcid: 0000-0001-9857-7307

their life without breaking their ties with neither of the countries. Associations, another network of immigrant relations, both support the life in the country of migration and keep the memory in the country of origin alive and build the memory, and they play important roles in re-determining the boundaries. Institutions building memory take on active roles in transforming nation state nationalism into postmodern nationalism.

Globalisation increases migration movements and consequently it changes the boundaries of nation states which we know by heart. The visibility of the principle of indeterminism of post-modern thought on the boundaries coincides with the concept of migration.

Keywords: *Iraq, Kirkuk, Turkmen, Globalization, External Migration, Association*

belirgin etkisi ile ulus ötesi göçe neden olmaktadırlar. Bu sayede göçü gerçekleştiren birey ya da gruplar, ulus ötesi göç ile her iki ülkeyle de bağlantılarını koparmadan yaşamlarını sürdürmektedirler. Bir diğer göçmen ilişkiler ağı olan dernekler, hem göç edilen ülkede yaşama destek verirken, hem de köken ülkedeki hafızayı canlı tutmakta ve kurgulamakta, sınırların yeniden belirlenmesinde önemli bir rol oynamaktadırlar. Hafızayı kurgulayan kurumlar, ulus devlet milliyetçiliğini postmodern bir milliyetçilik temsiline dönüştürmekte etkin bir rol üstlenmektedirler.

Küreselleşme, göç hareketlerini arttırmakta ve bunun bir sonucu olarak göç, ezberlediğimiz ulus devlet sınırlarını değiştirmektedir. Postmodern düşüncenin belirlenemezlik ilkesinin sınırlarda görünür hale gelmesi ulus ötesi göç kavramı ile buluşmaktadır.

Anahtar Kelime: *Irak, Kerkük, Türkmen, Küreselleşme, Dış Göç, Dernek*

Introduction

The world goes through great changes due to globalisation. Globalisation- which is the process of political and social integration- expanded its field of influence with extraordinary speed it has in communication and shrank the earth to such a degree that it is now a big village by creating new opportunities and forms of production. Indeterminism, which is one of the basic properties of postmodernist thought, also manifests itself on borders. The idea of "time-space compression", which is in the centre of Harvey's thought, shows that the earth has become smaller thanks to vehicles of transport and communication (Harvey, 2010). This compression of time and space enables globalisation to create its own culture. We see that globalisation leads to social changes in addition to shaping economy.

The boundaries of nation states of modern times disappear and new borders are formed through globalisation. Instruments of transport and communication, which make distances shorter, draw lines between geographical borders and social borders. according to Abadan-Unat, "globalisation creates new mutual or unilateral dependency, bilateral and/or regional partnerships and transnational

411

communities (Abadan-Unat 2002, p. 275-278). Globalisation has weakening effects on nation states. Distance between individuals or communities of different cultures and different boundaries has become smaller. The distances between countries and cultures become smaller and fields of communication expand through possibilities of communication and transport. Interaction between countries has increased with globalisation. The remarkable development in communication and transport facilities and its effects on the globe caused many individuals and groups to migrate.

This study was conducted in Istanbul in Iraqi Turks' Cultural and Fraternal Association in the period between 2014 and 2017. In-depth interviews were held with individuals attending the association. They migrated in legal and illegal ways. The interviews were held in the association since the Turkmens did not have specific life domains of their own. Visits to and observations in the association formed the foundation of the study. Qualitative research techniques, in-depth interviews and participatory observation were used in the research- which was shaped in the field. Thus, 30 male and female participants coming to the association regularly were interviewed. Whereas the female participants did not have a job, the male ones had various jobs but most of them had unemployment problems.

Globalisation and Transnational Migration: Artificial Borders

While previous studies investigating transnational migration analysed the integration process of the immigrant groups in the country of migration and their problems of adaptation in their new location, today's studies consider migration as interwoven mobility maintaining the relations between individuals, institutions and processes in both countries (country of origin/country of migration). Migration is divided into internal migration and external migration, and accordingly migration inside a country is called internal migration while migration out of a country is called external migration. Yet, this distinction between internal and external migration specific to the nineteenth century is inadequate and thus researchers suggested different concepts and assumptions in the twentieth century. Previous theories of migration were analysed and concepts of migration based on different processes of causality and indicating different issues were described. One of those concepts is "transnational migration" suggested by Glick Schiller. Schiller, Basch and Blanc describe the concept of "transnational migration" as "the process of immigrants' bringing their origins and new location together and their establishing and sustaining multi-directional, social relations synchronically. The emphasis in describing this new process of migration is on transnational immigrants' sustaining their life in society synchronically" (Schiller, Basch and Blanc, 1995, p. 48).

One of the most important factors increasing the sustainability of transnational migration is the system of network of immigrant relations. The network of immigrant relations encourages transnational migration. Immigrants are involved in the process of transnational migration with this system of network and they sustain their social, cultural and economic ties with more than one community at the same time.

Studies of transnational migration, which do not go back to remote past, are closely associated with such issues as migration, culture, nationalism, ethnicity and identity. Mobility and displacement increasing throughout the world, huge speed in communication and transport caused erosion in thoughts of belonging to a single country or nation.

412

The System of the Network of Immigrant Relations

The form of community caused by communication technology and economic structure of our era is called the "network of relations community" (Castells, 1997, p. 1-2). What directs this form of community created by time-space compression is the economic activities trying to reach certain strategies. This form of organisation is influential all over the world, it modifies institutions and cultures and it causes inequality (Abadan-Unat, 2002, p. 275). Migrations occur due to various reasons and on various conditions especially at our time. There are theories capable of evaluating the movement of migration in different perspectives.

Network of relations theory tries to analyse migration via the environment with which immigrants set up relations, as different from studies based on the causes of migration and as different from economy-based approaches. Migrations, on the other hand, can occur due to various reasons in the era of globalisation. Considering the fact that each migration has its own structure, this form of analysis also enables a multidisciplinary perspective. Individuals- that is to say, immigrants, come into prominence in this theory. Abadan-Unat describe the network of immigrants' relations as "the whole of interpersonal connections of common origin, agnation and friendship between old immigrants, new immigrants and non-immigrants in the country from which they come and the country in which they settle" (Abadan-Unat, 2002, p. 18).

The theory is based on social networks between country of migration and country of origin, the continuity of those networks and their effects on migration. Not only do the former immigrants set models to latter immigrants, but they also provide them with support. Relatives, fellow townsmen, kinsmen involved in the process of transnational migration make it easier for others to decide to migrate. Evaluating in this context, the participants in this research stressed almost in every interview that they had origins in common with the Turks in Turkey and mentioned a relative who had migrated to Istanbul before as the reason for their migration. The availability of common origin and agnation encourages migration.

Developments occurring in the areas of communication and transport along with globalisation strengthen the ties between previous immigrants and later immigrants instead of breaking the ties and thus add to the continuity of migration. Immigrants have human capital thanks to those ties. Immigrant networks were first described by Massey as "the forms of social capital" (Massey et al., 2008, p. 43). On the other hand, Massey points out that those networks of relations also spread into other layers of immigrants' country of origin through time (Taylor, 1986; Massey and Garcia Espana, 1987; Massey, 1990). In this context, the phenomenon of transnational migration overlaps with relations network theory. Transnational migration becoming widespread in parallel to globalisation gains continuity with network of relations system. Thus, network of immigrants' relations becomes the mediator of transnational migration.

The importance of the network of relations in the context of social capital manifests itself as materialistic support to immigrants who especially choose to migrate for the first time through illegal ways. Immigrants who migrate into a country for the first time in illegal ways have to face the high costs if they are devoid of such a network. The costs of immigrants who feel the support of immigrant relations network which is based on agnation and friendship, on the other hand, fall (Abadan-Unat,

2002, p. 18). Mentioning the benefits those networks provide, Massey describes the situation as "reduced costs and risks" (Massey et al., 1993, p. 449).

Some of the Turkmens interviewed stated that they had migrated from the environment of war and conflicts they had in Iraq through illegal ways. They said that they lived with their relatives who were previous immigrants for a while when they first came to Istanbul. Immigrants who followed the pioneers benefit from the pioneers experience. Crisp, who analysed the networks of international immigrants in four categories stated that *information* was the most important source in those networks. According to Crisp, those networks provide individuals who are to migrate with such information as accommodation procedures, documents needed in entering a country, deportation and custody. The second most important effect of the network of relations is that they provide immigrants with economic source according to Crisp. Those networks provide organisational infrastructure in secret and illegal migrations. Crisp claims that such networks increase illegal migrations. Finally, such networks provide refugees and illegal immigrants with *support* especially in getting a job and find them sources of income (2006, p. 6-8).

The immigrants said that they used the network of immigrant relations in getting a job and in asking for help. In relation to network theory, Wilpert says, "pioneering immigrants constitute an infrastructure connecting the communities giving immigrants and receiving immigrants, and this connection enables other individuals in the community giving immigrants to migrate. New waves of migration activate this network which has been constructed, and later immigrants make use of earlier immigrants' experience. In time, immigration takes a form giving itself continuity" (Cited in Yalçın, 2004, p. 50).

Immigrant networks have critical importance in migration movement. Immigrants having networks of relations have advantages in this new process of adaptation. Not only do the networks of immigrant relations comfort immigrants in economic terms but they also prevent them from feeling lonely.

Networks of relations can influence immigrants in positive and negative ways. They can isolate immigrants from the society in the country of migration or they can cause them to become introverted. It is known that there are Turks living in Germany who never go out of Turkish district, who cannot speak in German and who are proud of this. This shows how the system of the network of immigrant relations imprison individuals in their own culture and how it removes them away from the adaptation expected of them by the country of migration (Yalçın, 2004, p. 53-54). The network of immigrant relations influencing migration in positive ways prevents legal and illegal immigrants from feeling lonely, and it does not isolate Turkmens from the society.

The immigrants were found to set up ties between Kirkuk and Istanbul via their relatives in this study. The networks affect migration into Istanbul in positive ways and they make it possible to sustain migration. It was found in this study that immigrants reached information, economic sources and support by means of those networks.

Associations as Transnational Spaces and Memory

Non-governmental organisations set up more in big cities are the places formed by individuals having the same thoughts, traditions and customs so as to act together. Those organisations occupy

414

important place in transmitting and sustaining culture (Bayraktar, 2014). Iraqi Turks' cultural and fraternal association considers social and cultural activities directed to immigrants important. The association holds several conferences, memorial activities and panels. It offers temporary solutions to improve Turkmens' situation and not to aggrieve them. The association was found to try to find solutions to problems through personal relations and to help the fellow citizens by meeting the costs with money spent from its safe.

Associations are actively used in the network of relations system. Turkmens association in Istanbul support Turkmens migrating legally or illegally in such economic and social issues as finding a job, providing accommodation and regulating conditions of living. Turkmens migrating into Istanbul said that they learnt the availability of the association from their relatives.

Immigrants go to the association to get an identity card, to receive financial support, to get a job and to socialise. The association provides important support in facilitating adaptation into Istanbul, finding a place to live, finding a job and getting residence permit. It was interpreted that the association provided immigrants with support in integration into Istanbul on the one hand and it continued to preserve and sustain ties with Kirkuk.

The association, which takes on the task of creating memory in the consciousness of the community, preserves and a memory about homeland and makes the community remember it. While the association preserves a memory about the homeland and makes the community remember it, it also has a share in determining the boundaries of the homeland.

The president of the association, Ahmet Tütüncü, uses the term "artificial borders" on the internet site of the association on 2 December 2016 and asks for help with ethnical emphasis on Turkmen immigrants. With this summon to Turks and Turkmens, the president reminds the borders of the homeland again and thus tries to focus sensitivity on Iraq and on agnates facing problems when they had to migrate from there. According to Ricoeur, "efforts to remember are, to a large extent, efforts to determine a date" (Riceur 2012 60). Collective memory, remembering and forgetting practice all play important roles in the formation of identity, which is the process of social building. Narratives are influential in the formation of identity.

Halbwachs states that perceptions are individual but that there is not absolutely individual memory and all forms of memory are socially related. According to Halbwachs, collective memory means that individuals constituting a group or a community have shared images related to their past and that they have awareness due to those images. Memory, communication and socialisation are interrelated. The past is hidden in collective representations. Cultural symbols form the basis of collective memory and collective memory vanishes if a group falls into pieces (Halbwachs, 1992). Accordingly, "individuals acquire their memory in society. They also recall their memory, they become aware of it and they localise it in society" (1992, p. 38). According to Heller, the availability of cultural memory determines whether an ethnic group exists or disappears (2001, p. 139). In this context, it can be stated that there are close relations between collective memory and identity.

The association was observed to keep collective memory alive throughout the research. Memorial activities held by the association were also among the activities building such memory. Everman states that communities consider collective memory with differing interpretations and representations according to their needs and instruments in parallel to social conditions changing over

415

time and that memory is re-built in this way (2003, p. 15). Several Iraqi Turkmens gathered in the association on the Memorial Day held during the field study and speeches about martyrs were delivered in the meeting hall. Emphasis was laid on the state, nation, flag and nationalism during the meeting. Common language, flag and map were the important symbols associated with nationalism. Images about the past and the knowledge remembered about the past are transmitted and sustained through performance which can be labelled as ceremonial (Connerton, 2014, p. 12).

Turkmens migrating from Iraq into Istanbul preserve their political history by means of the association. Here we can make the interpretation that the association functions like a political organisation. Nora says that memory does not develop on its own but that anniversaries, celebrations and archives assure remembering because such things do not naturally occur and there are locations of memory since there are no longer places where events occur (1989, p. 7). Memorial activities held by the association, which we can consider as the memory location of political authority, also make it possible to keep memories about the country of origin alive. They are also transmitted continuously through social and cultural activities. In addition to the activities, the association also has books and journals about Turkmens as resources. Literature and poetry are important sources of narration. It would be right to remember here that Assman describe poets and priests as titles available for transmitting cultural memory (Assman, 2008b, p. 114).

Postmodern Nationalism

Disallowing differences is one of the basic properties of modern societies. It has also been one of the most fundamental principles in setting up a state. In this context, Billig describes nation states as "the world of borders built in modernist attitude" (Billig, 2003, p. 151). Standardising cultural, linguistic and ethnical differences and the boundaries clearly are the central policies of new states. The discourse of nationalism is the language used in activities of standardising the lands whose borders are clear. Bauman defines nationalism as "a programme of integration and postulate of homogeneity" (cited in Billig, Bauman, 1992b, p. 683). Generatedness needs the durability of borders marked on the basis of the difference between "we" and "they", and if the borders are not preserved, they lose their influence (Bauman, 1992, p. 678-9). Inorder to protect their borders nationalist discourses regarding gender are also utilized in the process and become popular among the citizens of country of migration (Aksoy Sugiyama, 2014). Globalisation, however, started to overshadow and threaten all the properties of nation states (Abadan-Unat, 2002). Yet, in contrast to many commentators, nation states- which are the outcome of modern era- are not out of fashion, as Billig claims; and they do not disappear in modernism since national identity is an extension of nation states (Billig, 2003, p. 149).

On reading Turkmen participants discourse of nationalism again and again, interpretation can be made that Turkmens- who stated that they remained on the other side of the border line while nation states were formed- lay claim on their ethnical identity more and they stick to nationalism going beyond borders. Kirkuk is the homeland of Turks in Iraq and it was separated from Turkey with artificial borders. Globalisation eroded the sharp and clear borders, and transnational communities ended the dreams of homogeneous nation states. The consciousness of sharp borders of the modern era changed into dreams of small homelands within nation states with postmodernism.

416

More efforts are made today to protect the borders of nation states. Faist points out that supra-state "transnational spaces" containing states have been formed with the possibilities created by globalisation and that the cities of the world have been connected to each other (Faist, 2003). Yet, the issue of migration indicates that states did not melt away in postmodern era. States keeping the flow of people, money and merchandise across borders of nation states under control are not eroded yet, and thus they are still forming the framework for migration and for citizenship.

Conclusion

Changes caused by globalisation have been influential in economic, political and social areas. Capitalist structure spread all over the world due to the huge speed technology introduces in communication and transport. Globalisation leads to social changes as it shapes economy. The borders of the nation states of modern times became indistinct in this process. Big distances got closer thanks to speed introduced by communication and transport vehicles and thus geographical borders differed from social borders. Such technological developments caused many individuals and groups to get involved in migration. On considering in the context of globalisation, we see that today's studies concerning migration are considered as immigrants' interwoven mobility sustaining their relations with individuals, institutions and processes in the country of origin and in the country of migration. Transnational migration is the process of immigrants' setting up multi-directional social relations bringing their origin and their new residence together and sustaining those relations.

One of the most important elements increasing the continuity of transnational migration process is the network of immigrant relations system. Networks of migrations have critical importance in the case of Kirkuk Turkmens migrating into Istanbul from Iraq. Those Turkmens live for a while with their relatives who previously migrated into Istanbul. Turkmens leaving their country because of war and migrating into Istanbul in illegal ways benefit from the experience of pioneering immigrants. This system of network both supports immigrants financially and prevents them from feeling lonely in the country of migration. The network of relations does not isolate Turkmens from society, and on the contrary it offers benefits in adaptation process. The networks were found to play roles in sustaining migration into Istanbul. Relatives, fellow countrymen and kins getting involved in transnational migration all facilitate making decisions to migrate. Common origin and agnation relations encourage migration.

The association founded by Turkmens is actively used in the network of relations system. Associations play important roles in cultural transmission and in keeping the culture alive. One of the most important reasons why the association is frequently visited by Turkmens is that it opens a file for Turkmens having no accommodation and gives them identity cards by registering them. The association also deals with those immigrants daily life problems. It provides them important support in such issues as facilitating adaptation into Istanbul, finding accommodation and a job and getting residence permit. It was found in this study that the majority of the participants laid claim to the goals and activities of the association. The association creates memory in community consciousness. It preserves a memory about the homeland and it makes members remember it again. The association, which keeps collective memory alive, keeps memory strong with memorial activities it holds.

Turkmens migrating into Istanbul from Iraq commemorate their political history through the association.

It was interpreted in this study that Kirkuk Turkmens adhere to nationalism going beyond borders. we see by means of migration that states do not melt away in postmodern era. States controlling the flow of people, money and merchandise across the borders of nation states have not been eroded yet; and they have still been forming the framework for migration and citizenship.

Relations with the country of origin continue in the country to which people migrate by means of relatives with the help of associations within the system of the network of immigrant relations. The immigrants are in the country of origin through relatives remaining there and in the country of migration through the association with the support it gives in adaptation. Turkmens' life connected to Kirkuk and Istanbul and composed of network of relations- being here and there- changes into a representation of postmodern nationalism.

REFERENCES

Abadan-Unat, N. (2002). *Bitmeyen göç: Konuk işçilikten ulus-ötesi yurttaşlığa.* Birinci Baskı. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.

Aksoy Sugiyama, C. (2014). Üremeye dair yaygın söylemler: Ortadoğu bağlamında Türkiye'yi yeniden değerlendirmek. *Antropoloji.* Sayı: 28, S. 1-27.

Assmann, J. (2008), *Communicative and cultural memory* (içinde), A. Erll & A. Nünning (ed.) (2008). Cultural Memory Studies: An International And Interdisciplinary Handbook. s. 109-118. Berlin & New York: Walter de Gruyter.

Bauman, Z. (1992). Soil, blood and identity. *The Sociological Review*, volume 40, number 4, pp. 675-701.

Bayraktar, Z., (2014), Geleneğin aktarımında ve yaşatılmasında göçmen sivil toplum kuruluşlarının rolü: İzmir Bosna sancak kültür ve yardımlaşma derneği örneği. *Türk, Dil Edebiyat Ve Halkbilimi Araştırmaları Dergisi,* Yıl: 2: Sayı 3:193-206.

Billig, M. (2003). *Banal milliyetçilik,* İstanbul: Gaye Kitabevi.

Castells, M. (1997). The power of identity. Oxford: Blackwell Publ., S.1-2.

Connerton, P. (2014). *Toplumlar nasıl anımsar?.* (A. Şenel. Çev.). İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları

Cohen, P. A. (1985). *The symbolic construction of community.* London & New York: Routledge.

Crisp, J. (2006). *Policy challenges of the new diasporas: migrant networks and their impact on asylum flows and regimes.* www.transcomm.ox.ac.uk>riia3.

Eyerman, R. (2003). *Cultural trauma: Slavery and the formation of African American identity.* (2. Baskı), Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Faist T. (2003) Uluslararası göç ve ulusaşırı toplumsal alanlar. (A. Z. Gündoğan ve C. Nacar, Çev.). İstanbul: Bağlam Yayınları.

Halbwachs, M. (1992). *On collective memory.* L. A. Coser (Ed.). London: The University of Chicago Press.

Harvey D. (2010). *Postmodernliğin durumu, kültürel değişimin kökenleri.* İstanbul: Metis Yayınları.

Heller, A. (2001), Cultural memory, identity and civil society. *Internationale Politik und Gesellschaft (IPG)* 2, s. 139-143.

Hürmüzlü, H. (2010). *Irak Türkleri: maruz kaldıkları dışlanma ve asimilasyon uygulamaları.* Türkiye.

Massey, D. ve Arango, J. ve Hugo, G. ve Kouaoucı, A. ve Pellegrıno, A. ve Taylor, E. (1993). Theories

of international migration: A review and appraisal. *Population and Development Review,* No. 3, s:431-466.

Massey, D. S., Arango, J., Hugo, G. ve Diğerleri. (2008). *Worlds in motion: Understanding international migration at the end of the millennium.* Oxford, New York: Clarendon Press.

Massey, D. S. (1990). Social structure, household strategies and the cumulative causation of migration. *Population Index 56*, Office of Population Research.

Nora, P. (1989). Between memory and history: Les lieux de memoire. *Representations.* No:26, Special Issue: Memory and Counter-Memory, s. 7-13.

Ricoeur, P. (2012*). Hafıza, tarih, unutuş.* (M. E. Özcan, Çev.). İstanbul: Metis.

Schiller N.G. ve Basch L. ve . Blanc, C.S. (1995) From immigrant to transmigrant: Theorizing transnational migration. *Anthropological Quarterly*, Vol 68:1

Yalçın, C. (2004). *Göç sosyolojisi.* Ankara: Anı.

http://researchturkey.org/tr/turkmens-of-iraq-the-third-ethnic-component-of-iraq/