

-RESEARCH PAPER-

EVALUATION OF THE BUSINESS MODELS-INTERNET ENTERPRISES IN TURKEY

Mustafa Halid KARAARSLAN¹

Abstract

The business model concept basically focuses on three questions. Which customer will be offered value? Which value will be offered? How will income be generated? Although studies on the business model started earlier, it has been intensively discussed with the emergence of internet enterprises. Through the Internet, enterprises; facilitated access to customers, lowered their costs and were enabled to diversify their revenues. However, there was a rapid increase in the number of business competitors with the Internet. This forced them to innovate business models in order to be competitive. The aim of the research is to identify the business models of Turkish internet enterprises and to determine the relationship between their success and failures and business models. In this research, business models of the enterprises are examined with case study approach. Within the scope of the study, 5 internet entrepreneurs were interviewed and business models were determined. The result of this research is that Turkish entrepreneurs have to operate at the lowest possible cost. The reasons for operating at the lowest cost can be listed as follows: a) the market of Turkey is a relatively small, b) Turkish users do not prefer paid accounts, c) according to Turkish entrepreneurs some income models are inappropriate, d) the number of investors is small, and investors are biased towards some business models. The other result of this research is that the chance of the success of the entrepreneurs can be collected under 3 factors a) if there is a leading enterprise that will inspire for the business model, b) if they sell to corporate customers, and c) if they can receive investment.

Keywords: Business Model, Internet Enterprises, Turkey,

JEL Codes: L26, M13, L19, L10, L21, D49,

Başvuru: 23.05.2019

Kabul: 23.11.2019

TÜRKİYE'DEKİ İNTERNET GİRİŞİMLERİNİN İŞ MODELLERİNİN İNCELENMESİ

Öz

İş modeli temelde üç sorunun cevabına odaklanmaktadır. Hangi tüketiciye değer sunulacak? Hangi değer sunulacak? Nasıl gelir elde edilecek? İş modeli ile ilgili çalışmalar daha öncesinde başlamasına rağmen internet girişimlerinin oluşmasıyla yoğunlukla tartışılmaya başlamıştır. İnternet; girişimlerin müşteriye erişimlerini kolaylaştırdı, maliyetlerini düşürdü ve gelirlerini çeşitlendirme olanağı sağladı. Ancak internetle birlikte işletmelerin rakiplerinin sayısında hızlı bir artış oldu. Bu durum

1- Doç. Dr., Karabük Üniversitesi, İşletme Fakültesi, Uluslararası Ticaret Bölümü, Karabük/Türkiye, mustafahk@karabuk.edu.tr, <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2130-5076>

onların rekabetçi olabilmek için iş modellerinde yenilik yapmaya zorladı. Araştırmanın amacı Türk internet girişimlerinin iş modellerinin belirlenerek onların başarı ve başarısızlıkları ile iş modellerinin ilişkisini tespit etmektir. Araştırmada işletmelerin iş modelleri vaka çalışması yaklaşımı ile incelenmiştir. Çalışma kapsamında 5 internet girişimcisi ile mülakat yapılarak iş modelleri belirlenmiştir. Bu araştırmanın sonucu Türk girişimcileri mümkün olan en düşük maliyetle çalışmak zorunda kalmaktadırlar. Düşük maliyetle çalışma sebepleri a) Türkiye görece küçük bir pazardır, b) Türk kullanıcılar ücretli hesapları tercih etmemektedir, c) Türk girişimciler bazı gelir modellerinin uygun olmadığına inanmaktadırlar, d) yatırımcıların sayısı az ve bazı iş modellerine karşı önyarguları bulunmaktadır. Araştırmanın bir diğer sonucu ise girişimcilerin başarı şansını üç faktör artırmaktadır: a) iş modelinden esinlenilecek lider bir girişim varsa, b) kurumsal müşterilere satış yapıyorsa ve c) yatırım alabiliyorsa başarı şansı artmaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: İş Modeli, İnternet Girişimi, Türkiye,

JEL Kodu: L26, M13, L19, L10, L21, D49,

1. INTRODUCTION

“The business world is rapidly digitizing, breaking down industry barriers and creating new opportunities while destroying long-successful business models” (Weill & Woerner, 2015: 27). With the emergence of Internet companies, it is becoming clear that there will be significant changes in business models (Teece, 2010: 178). The first companies have marketed software and services on the internet as products, and very large companies have emerged. However, over time, businesses that offer similar services have emerged with new business models. Enterprise habits have been reinforced, customer loyalty, cost of change and financial barriers have been tried to be established, but these efforts have not been very effective. More attention has been paid to business models as new businesses start to leave old businesses in very difficult situations. Older businesses have had to change their business models over time. “As business increasingly moves from the physical world of “place” to the digital world of “space,” companies need to strengthen their digital business models” (Weill & Woerner, 2013: 71). However, the enormous increase in the capacities of internet technologies and the decrease in their costs are enabling more and more services every day. As the old services are starting to be provided over the internet many factors, such as the way of doing business, service expectations, distribution channels, employees’ skills, costs, customer volume, the fee that the customer is ready to pay, are changing. A suitable business model for this new situation was a necessity.

Studies on this business model is mostly based on internet enterprises. Because internet technology is at the forefront of the technology that shapes the business world. The Internet is becoming more and more widespread as a technology that has reached the world as geographically as ever. It is expected that the next widespread use will be in the form of spreading the Internet to different products and services. It is expected that the number of internet affiliate products and the number of services that can be given through the internet increase day by day. This reveals the fact that internet technologies will affect more industries in the future.

The business model construct was introduced in the late 1950s but hardly used in

publications until the 1990s; research on business models has also increased since the 1990s with the rise of internet enterprises (Saebi & Foss, 2015: 202). The main reason for this interest in business models in the literature has been the understanding that one of the most important determinants of internet enterprises success is business models. Although there are various studies on business models, most of them have been conducted in Western countries. Therefore, examining the business models of enterprises in Turkey in comparison with other countries and in terms of enterprises in the same areas is important to identify the differences between them. The research is structured around two basic questions. “What are the business models of Turkish internet enterprises?” “Do business models influence the success of enterprises?” The aim of the research is to identify the business models of Turkish internet enterprises and to determine the relationship between their success and failures and business models. Since this study is a qualitative study and it examines the enterprises operating in 5 different areas employing case analysis, the results cannot be generalized to all enterprises. However, it will provide considerable inferences in terms of how Turkish entrepreneurs differentiate their business models according to their international competitors or and identify similar business models. These deductions will be inspiring for both internet entrepreneurs and researchers working on internet enterprises.

1.1. Literature Review

The concept of the business model emerged in the 1960s, but in the mid-1990s, was more and more addressed with the proliferation of internet companies (Barneto & Ouvrard, 2015: 4). The business model explains how the enterprise works. A good business model should be able to answer Peter Drucker’s questions; “Who is the customer and what is the customer’s value” and “How will we make money from this business?” (Magretta, 2002: 4). The business model can be expressed in terms of specific strategic choices, although it can be differentiated by each industry (Barneto & Ouvrard, 2015: 5).

The main concepts related to the business model are; sustainability, income stream, cost structure, value chain, value proposition, customer segments, stakeholder network, delivery channel, revenue stream, product and service production and exchange (Zott, Amitt & Massa 2011: 1028). Osterwalder & Pigneur (2010) defined 9 elements of the business model (see Figure 1). The business model canvas helped leading companies to move from product centric thinking to business model thinking (Muhtaroğlu et al., 2013: 32).

Key Partners (Who are our key partners/suppliers)	Key Activities (What key activities do our value propositions require?)	Value Propositions (What value do we deliver to the customer?) Channels (Through which channels do our customer segments want to be reached?)	Customer Relationships (What type of relationship does each of customer segments expect us to establish and maintain with them?)	Customer Segments (For whom are we creating value?)
	Key Resources (What key resources do our value propositions require?)			
Cost Structure (What are the most cost inherent in our business model?)		Revenue Streams (For what value are our customers really willing to pay?)		

Figure 1. Business Model Canvas (Osterwalder & Pigneur, 2010)

The business model can be regarded as the center of entrepreneurship research (Morris, Schindehutte & Allen, 2005: 734). The business model explains how an enterprise operates (Magretta, 2002: 4) and meanwhile, it is the heuristic logic that links technical potential and economic value (Chesbrough & Rosenbloom, 2002: 529). Before an enterprise emerges, it must decide the business model. The business model sets out the essential features of the enterprise. Existing businesses can focus on new benefits by rethinking business models. Business model strategies, that can be focused on, can be classified as: 1) identifying additional attributes of the product, 2) providing strategic benefits for third parties, 3) using cross-selling opportunities, and 4) crowdsourcing (Kesting & Günzel-Jensen, 2015: 285). With the first strategy, the business focuses on delivering more value by integrating existing products and services with complementary new products and services. In the second strategy, strategic benefits can be provided for third parties. This strategy involves submitting information of a large user group to other groups. Search engines use search information from large consumer groups as a means of reaching customers for advertisers. The third strategy involves presenting other products and services that existing customers may purchase with the products and services they are buying. The fourth strategy is that your content is created by users, not by the business.

When we look at the history of business model studies, the first studies on business model date back to the 1960s (Barneto & Ouvrard, 2015: 4). However, studies on business models have been intensified since 1995 (Zott, Amitt & Massa 2011: 1023) with the widespread use of the internet. The spread and development of the Internet can be

handled in many ways. First, the speed and capacity of the internet has increased. This increased speed and capacity of the internet made it possible to transfer more data. In the first stage, the data was text based. After that, high-capacity data was available. Secondly, the diversity of internet bonding patterns has increased. Because of the technology that removes the necessity of connecting with an internet cable, it has been possible to increase the number of devices and device types that can be connected to the Internet. Another development has been the increase in internet security and the preparation of the legal infrastructure, which has increased the trust of people and institutions on the Internet and enabled many transactions to be carried out over the internet, including money transfer and cryptocurrency.

When literature related to the business model is examined, there are studies about wireless broadband (Rao & Parikh, 2003), 3G (Ballon, 2007), radio frequency identification (RFID) (Park & Park, 2007), mobile commerce (Wu, Chen and Guo, 2008), Chinese mobile phone company Shanzhai (Hu, Wan & Zhu, 2011), adoption of product–service systems (Barquet et al., 2013), the Italian telecommunications industry (Ghezzi, Cortimiglia & Frank, 2015), the Korean telecommunications industry (Park, Kim & Nam, 2015), Internet of Things (Rong et al., 2015), Internet-based logistics control towers (Alias et al., 2015), sustainability-oriented businesses (Joyce & Paquin, 2016; Yang et al., 2017), mobile music delivery business (Ide et al., 2014), e-commerce of agricultural products in China (Zhang & Huang, 2015), digital banking (Sia, Soh, & Weill, 2016) and smart cities (Walravens, 2015).

Ismagilova et al. (2017: 26) examined the SMART economy business model in Russia, concluding that development in the sector can be achieved through complexed government support and investments in R&D stimulation, education development, creation of R&D results commercialisation infrastructure, special tax credits etc. Muhtaroglu et al., (2013: 32) studied the phenomenon of business models in big data applications and services such as location based services, medical services, and retail services. Wirtz, Schilke, and Ullrich, (2010) investigated the impact of web 2.0 applications on value creation of business models.

León et al., (2016) created the wellness e-services business model in Spain and Mexico using the canvas business model. When examining the digital ecosystem, actors, interactions, resources, legal requirements, and devices were considered. As a result, differences in the ecosystem of the two countries have been identified due to the technological gap between two countries, legal regulations in data recording systems, connectivity costs, cultural characteristics and staff qualifications in the wellness e-services (León et al., 2016).

Several variables are considered when determining a business model. If there is significant technological innovation in an industry, innovation and technology management are of critical importance; but, when the business model is ignored, success is not guaranteed (Zott, Amit & Massa 2011: 1032-33). Business models usually change while technological innovations are emerging. Business model design is associated with innovation. Most firms fail to reveal the full potential of the business model (Kesting & Günzel-Jensen, 2015: 285) and assume that business models will remain the same while many things change. But changes in the business environment require revising the business model, otherwise the likelihood of failure increases (Park, Kim & Nam, 2015: 608).

2. METHODOLOGY

In order to assess the business models of Turkish internet enterprises, the business models of 5 enterprises were examined employing case study approach. In-depth interviews were conducted with the founding partners of 5 enterprises. An internet search was conducted to determine the entrepreneurs to be interviewed and assistance was received from the Business Angels Networks and Teknocity administrators to select the right enterprises. Interviews were held in the form of video conferences over the Internet. While selecting the companies to be examined, particular attention was paid to choose pioneering enterprises in a specific field in an environment with no market dominating business at the time of their establishment. Because it means that there is no clear guide on how to succeed if there is no competitor dominating the market. Thus, the entrepreneur will be more creative in determining the business model. Sampling method is purposeful sampling method. Each interview lasted 40-75 minutes.

Semi-structured questionnaires were used in the interviews. In order to accustom the participants to the interview, they were first asked the story of their enterprises since its establishment. Subsequently, each business model element and the reasons for its choice was addressed individually. Finally, the participants were asked to provide information on the number of shareholders of the enterprise, training of shareholders, whether they received investment, the purpose of the entrepreneur and the number of staff. In addition, questions that were not in the questionnaire were asked to better assess the situation upon the entrepreneur's answer. The interviews were recorded with the permission of the participants. During the interviews, notes were taken and later were combined with additional notes taken from the interview recordings. Business models of five entrepreneurs were prepared using "*Business Model Generation: A Handbook for Visionaries, Game Changers, and Challengers*" (Osterwalder & Pigneur, 2010) book.

3. FINDINGS

3.1. Foreign Language Education

The first enterprise provides foreign language training on the internet via short videos. The activities that the enterprise does are basically divided into films, cartoons, serials, documentaries, television programs and speeches that can be used for educational purposes and usually do not exceed 20 seconds. Later, the text in the video is translated into the supported languages. There are two translations of the text. The first is the correct translation and the second is the wrong translation. Sometimes, in the wrong translation, the word is wrongly translated, or sometimes the structure of the sentence is misinterpreted. The videos are classified according to their length, audience age, difficulty level and grammar structures.

The key resource of the enterprise is human resources as it is in all innovative enterprises. In addition, the venture develops an artificial intelligence to dissociate itself from other businesses. Thanks to this artificial intelligence, users can encounter different contents as they use the system. In this way, all users have an advantage over other discouraging education systems. The most important advantage of this enterprise is to determine what the user is missing in order to determine his or her level or knowledge without needing

a test.

The customer group targeted by the enterprise is anyone who wants to learn the language. The enterprise does not separate those who want to learn language into different market segments. For this reason, it serves all the world, every level of income and users of all ages. The enterprise now offers English language learning services for 20 different international languages. While these mother tongues cover a significant part of the world, for those whose language is not available, English is an option.

The most important value offered to users of the enterprise is that it makes learning foreign languages fun. On this account, users can learn without being bored. It means that fewer learners have to stop learning. The enterprise knows its users better as they spend time on the system, so they can offer more relevant content to them.

Users can access from computers and mobile devices. The first option is to access the website, which is designed for both PC and mobile devices and can be used on either without any software installation. There are also applications for Android and iOS operating systems.

This enterprise is promoted through social media networks. It has relationships with users through these networks. The instructors of the enterprise can teach lectures live on Facebook. They also come together with them by organizing conferences, participate in youth intensive activities and universities in Turkey.

There are linguists and computer programmers who give part-time support in addition to full-time employees. In order to make the enterprise more widespread, it is doing business with language teaching courses and schools. While the greatest cost of the enterprise is staff and hosting services, the cost of promoting the business is very limited.

The enterprise is completely free for both individual users and enterprise users. For now, the only source of revenue for the enterprise is advertising. Because advertisements are turned into educational material for users, users are more likely to engage with ads. Users often watch more than once to understand what is said in the ad. It can also identify the new word with the brand. For this reason, it is possible to charge a higher display fee than ads for other entrepreneurs. The enterprise is also working on two new incomes. The first is to focus on the teaching of these languages by making agreements with governments that want to expand their language and culture. In this way, it will be possible for more people to learn the language. In addition, as a training material, serious promotional support will be provided about the country to use the films, series, documentaries, etc. that reflect the culture of the country. The second revenue source is a commission for each product purchased by linking to a site where the main source of the video used in education (film, documentary, etc.) is sold.

3.2. Wedding Organization

The second internet enterprise brings together customers and businesses that can provide products and services that people, who are about to marry, need. The main activity of this enterprise is to establish and maintain a virtual market place. For this reason, care is taken to keep the proportion of those who want to get married to the businesses that will provide the goods and services that the married people need. Because this balance is broken and

the number of those who want to get married increases, the tendency of researching other sites is increasing because the customers do not have enough options. When the number of business increases, the businesses leave the system because they can not attract enough customers. For this reason, the enterprise seeks to increase both groups in a balanced way.

The first resource of this enterprise is that it was the first in the market. Because when virtual markets are taken into consideration, the enterprise, which is the first adopted in a market, takes almost all of the profits. It is not possible for subsequent entities to receive a significant share of the market unless they have made significant innovations or have allocated considerable investment budgets. The second resource of the enterprise is human resources. The most important factor affecting the entrepreneurial investment decision is the motivation of the employees and the ability to attract qualified personnel. The third resource of the enterprise is the platform on which it is built.

It also cooperates with the businesses providing the technical infrastructure to carry out the enterprise activities. The greatest cost of the enterprise is the salaries that employees are paid. Other costly activities for the enterprise are to improve and maintain the virtual market system. As the enterprise enters new territory, new employees are hired to fill the database with the businesses that provide services related to marriage, and when entry is complete those employees are released. In addition, the content related to marriage is translated by adapting it to the culture of the region. The number of personnel required for these two operations decreases after the entry in the new territory. The enterprise tends not to see the cost of sales for the field salesperson as an actual cost. These people are only working as long as they bring in sales above their cost.

The target customer group of the enterprise is the people who want to marry and the businesses that can serve them. The target volume of the enterprise constitutes a small part of the total customers. For this reason, the enterprise does not rededicate the target market, for example, the gender or ethnicity. Considering the target group that the enterprise has identified, a serious problem arises. Normally, virtual markets have the ability to resell to a significant portion of the customers they have acquired, but marriage is usually done once in life. For this reason, repeated sales are not possible when a customer is earned. The customer who enters the system needs to be sold as many services as possible at one time. The value proposition of the enterprise therefore covers all the services needed for marriage. The enterprise allows the couple to do all the planning related to their wedding. This provides new customers for marriage service businesses.

The enterprise brings together those who want to get married and those who provide services to them. In this case, only those who will get married will have personal contact when they have trouble with other businesses and all services to the customers are self service. The enterprise uses limited internet advertising to reach the customers. To sell memberships to corporate clients, the enterprise sets up sales teams in major cities. Sales teams for medium-sized cities visit on a regular basis, there are no sales teams for the small cities.

Enterprise income is derived from corporate memberships that are sold to businesses and supplementary packages such as priority listings in the province. The enterprise does not sell corporate memberships in the first phase in newly entered areas. Because corporate members are leaving the system when they can not get enough customers, it takes quite

a long time to regain the customers who abandon the system. For this reason, the number of persons to be married is provided free of charge to corporate customers until they reach the designated targets in that region. Thus, corporate customers are free to try out the services of the enterprise and see the benefits to their business. The sales to the customers who try the service are easier afterwards.

3.3. Customer Data Processing Service

The enterprise instantly analyzes the data of the business for the website owners. Using this data, they offer products or content that can be of interest to users. Thus, it is aimed so that the users who come to the website stay longer on the site or purchase more products. The main activity of the enterprise is to improve the model that increases the sales on the website and the user traffic by using the data which is in constant flow. The main resource of the enterprise is the highly educated workforce that develops this model. Partners have undertaken a number of projects with universities for state agencies before the establishment of this enterprise. Therefore, it can be said that the university is the first partner of the enterprise. The highest cost of the enterprise is personnel costs, for better product development and also to realize the sale of the products.

The basic value proposition of the enterprise is to increase the sales of internet sites and the customer traffic. The services offered by the enterprise mainly use two data types. The province handles the data of users who have come to the site before. Thanks to this data, it instantly creates lists such as best selling, most read, and most popular on the site. On this site, when the users enter the site, they find it ready on the site. So you can easily decide which products or content to look at. Secondly, it processes the data of the person who uses the site. By using these two data types together, it is possible that the user will be interested in the products and content. It also gives you personalized content when you send an SMS or email to your registered customers on the site. Other products may not be reported or are given in a lower order, given that the information that the person is interested in or that the products that are likely to be of interest are being given priority. The enterprise has designated its customers as medium and large internet enterprises. The enterprise makes face to face sales to customers in Istanbul which is Turkey's largest city. The sales unit is not created for the other cities because they do not have sufficient customer potential. The enterprise only provides face-to-face sales and consultancy services for large businesses operating in Istanbul. Premium services are provided for these businesses by way of bidding. All remaining businesses have Internet sales where they can purchase self-service accounts. There are a 14 days free trial and three separate packages. Although the venture allocates a fairly low budget to promote internet sales, there are quite a few customers joining it. The number of these customers is very high, but the revenue generated by them is much lower than the income generated by face-to-face sales. The enterprise, therefore, encourages entry-level customers to buy higher packages.

3.4. Social Survey Platform

This enterprise defines itself as a social survey platform. The main activity of the enterprise is to motivate people to prepare and respond to surveys. Users can share the questions with the respondents, which can be prepared in various forms. As many inquiries as possible are asked of those who enter the site. The person who answered the

question can see the percentage of people who prefer an answer to each question before. For this reason, those who are curious about what other people are responding to can answer a lot of questions. The main resource of business is the platform infrastructure that provides the best possible interaction between users. Enterprise promotes the platform through partnerships with major news sites in Turkey. After the news on news sites, users can answer with their opinions about the news before leaving the site. The platform does not charge for this service. However, it puts a log of the platform. The major cost of the enterprise is the labor cost.

The enterprise is the one who is interested in the customer base. Those who are curious about what other people think about in a given context constitute the target of the platform. The platform's value proposition is to eliminate curiosity by asking and answering the users, also curiosity is social. The enterprise reaches its users via the platform and news sites. The relationship of the enterprise to the customer is usually through the platform. Site employees and users can not communicate easily. Here, more and more users communicate with each other. However, users can complain about content. Questions that can be accessed from the main page of the platform are often selected by the editors to reach a certain number of respondents. Other questions are published without editorial supervision. The main resource of the enterprise is sponsored surveys. The enterprise gives institutional customers the opportunity to ask questions about themselves. In sponsored surveys it is possible to offer customized content according to the given response that is not in other surveys. For example, an e-commerce site is able to ask the users what they want to do with the sport and direct users to a page where detailed information about that sport is given according to the answer. In addition to the event that the enterprise has obtained from sponsorship, there are also options for receiving advertisements and memberships for paid news sites. However, entrepreneurs do not want to place advertisements to bother users inside the site, and to disrupt the friendly environment. The drawbacks of paid membership to news sites are, in this case, a transition from a social media platform to providing technical support to those sites. In this case the enterprise will not be able to use their logos in these sites and will not be able to link to their platform. Additionally, as the number of users will not increase enough, this will be far from being a social media platform.

3.5. Crowdsourcing Platform

The crowdsourcing enterprise mediates the support of the wider public for those who are in the field of technology, arts and social responsibility. The main activity of the enterprise is to attract project owners to the site and help them to announce their project well. The main resource of the enterprise is the relationship established with those who want to realize the project and the trust it gives to those who want to support the projects. The enterprise cooperates with universities, art centers and other project development communities to meet project owners. The cost of the enterprise is kept as low as possible. There are three partners of the enterprise and there is no expectation of income for each of them because they have other jobs. The only costs of the enterprise are hosting the platform and the cost of meetings and competitions for the promotion of the platform. As crowdsourcing is not spreading organically throughout the country, it is necessary to introduce themselves to the project people face to face. It is expected that full-time

personnel costs will be generated while promotional costs will be reduced after projects are funded with a certain prevalence and success.

The enterprise helps finance large-scale crowdsourcing for those whose project is a value proposition but does not have the resources to realize it. The enterprise also supports the successful funding of each project. The enterprise has three core customer segments. Persons with technical infrastructure in which they can develop technological products. The enterprise is primarily aimed at this segment. The student communities of the universities come together with the students in engineering and design faculties. These people are able to raise funds more easily because they can develop physical products. However, since these people have access to public funds, priority preference is not crowdsourcing. This segment is not easy to be persuaded for this reason. The second is artists who develop art projects. These individuals are in arts courses and related faculties of universities and are segmented by themes. Generally, there are projects such as documentaries, short films, and concerts. The third is sensitive people who develop social projects. The enterprise is very selective about these projects. Because it is difficult to successfully fund these projects. Supporters donate in cases which they like the project very much or trust those organizing the project. The enterprise offers self-service to donors and a service to those who have a project. The entrepreneurs need to increase the number of successfully funded projects in order for new and better projects to come to them. For this reason, the experience of finding funding for the project is a priority. The only resource of the enterprise is the commission from successfully funded projects. Current projects need to be funded successfully in order for the enterprise to generate revenue and attract more projects in the future.

4 DISCUSSION

Within the scope of the research, the business model of five Turkish Internet entrepreneurs has been examined.

The wedding organization platform is the only example that can supply angel investment capital. For this reason, although the venture has grown within a few years without an angel investment capital base in the country, it has reached the same size in only a few months abroad after finding capital. This enterprise has been able to adapt the business model of its overseas competitors without significant changes. In the process of growth, it has been able to expand abroad using the same platform and business model.

The enterprise, providing customer data processing service, aims to generate more value from its users by instantly processing the data the enterprise have. The business can use the business models of the leading enterprises. Although there are no significant differences in the business model between rival enterprises, competition continues through the efficiency of data processing.

Surveys of the Turkish social media platform show it is resisting the ability of the global social media platforms to implement the same business model. In larger markets, while sponsored messages would provide sufficient income for the enterprise, in the Turkish market it would be necessary to find additional income for this enterprise. Entrepreneurial social media is making resisting other income-generating activities because it is felt that engaging in this type of activities would change the business to a social media enterprise.

In the foreign language education venture surveyed, it does not offer any paid service while all competitors are selling premium accounts and paid memberships for educational institutions. Although this enterprise is sufficiently sustained in business through advertising revenue, it can not be said to support rapid growth.

Because the crowd funding enterprise can not yet fully convince itself of its contribution to the realization of technological projects, it does not seem possible for the enterprise to produce income for itself.

León et al., (2016), in their research found that business models differ between countries. Similarly, there are differences with the business models of Turkish internet enterprises and foreign enterprises. Turkey has a smaller market and entrepreneurs have more difficulty accessing business angels. There are also fewer examples of successful initiatives. Weaknesses occur due to the deficiencies of the entrepreneurial ecosystem. Similar to the findings of Ismagilova et al., (2017: 26) for Russia, Turkish enterprises are not able to develop rapidly with their own income models. Thus, government incentives may be effective to support their growth.

As a result of the review of Turkish enterprises, it has been observed that they have to work at the lowest possible cost while forming business models. The reason for being forced to work within such a low-cost market is the relatively small market in Turkey, beliefs of entrepreneurs and Turkish customer preference to use free accounts. Moreover, Turkish entrepreneurs have to manage the enterprise with little capital due to difficulties in finding capital. They can not grow fast enough to introduce themselves and develop new services due to budget constraints.

The chance of success increases when Turkish Internet enterprises determine their business model a) if they have a leading competitor to take as an example, b) if they receive their revenue in return for the services they offer to their corporate customers and c) if they can find the capital to achieve the scale required by the business they do. When enterprises rely on their income to consumers or businesses that want to access consumers, they cannot earn enough income. Starting with low capital and waiting for a long time to reach an adequate scale brings along risks for enterprises. In cases where the consumer does not know or cannot fully understand the value proposition, the business needs a significant marketing budget to gain new customers.

CONCLUSION

This research provides important tips for understanding and adapting existing business models for internet entrepreneurs. Internet enterprises in different fields were selected and efforts were made to provide as much diversity as possible.

Within the scope of the research, 5 cases were examined to find the answers to “What are the business models of Turkish internet enterprises?” “Do business models affect the success of the enterprises?” Since the research covers 5 internet enterprises, the findings cannot be generalised over all enterprises. However, the research provides important insights into Turkish internet enterprises.

Further studies may address the business models by separating the internet entrepreneurs by industry. Moreover, if a sufficient sample can be determined, it is also recommended

to employ quantitative methods in order to compare the growth rates, profitability and capital finding skills of enterprises with different business models. Investors are worried that some business models are not suitable for Turkey. Subsequent researchers may also explore investors' beliefs about the success of their business model.

In order to increase the chance of success, the entrepreneurs willing to prepare a business model must take into consideration the following issues. If the value proposition is not easily understood or adopted by customers, high marketing expenses will be required. They must own capital to allocate to this field. As selling services to end-users in Turkey is difficult, it should be examined whether the revenue from the advertisers or sellers who wish to access it will cover the costs. If the business you set up is the first one in Turkey, then the revenue model employed should be similar to your foreign competitors'. If you don't have foreign competitors, you need to diversify your income generating activities. Income is important for the continuation of the business, especially when you cannot find investment in the early stages. If you do not have enough capital, it will be important to know which business models investors will invest in.

REFERENCES

- Alias, C., Goudz, A., Jawale, M., & Noche, B. (2015, May). Generating a business model canvas for future-internet-based logistics control towers. In 2015 4th International Conference on Advanced Logistics and Transport (ICALT) (pp. 257-262). IEEE.
- Ballon, P. (2007). "Changing business models for Europe's mobile telecommunications industry: The impact of alternative wireless technologies." *Telematics and Informatics*, 24(3), 192-205.
- Barneto, P., & Ouvrard, S. (2015). "Is the firm's business model related to segment reporting?" *Research in International Business and Finance*, 35, 122-137.
- Barquet, A. P. B., de Oliveira, M. G., Amigo, C. R., Cunha, V. P., & Rozenfeld, H. (2013). Employing the business model concept to support the adoption of product-service systems (PSS). *Industrial Marketing Management*, 42(5), 693-704.
- Chesbrough, H. W., & Rosenbloom, R. S. (2002). "The role of the business model in capturing value from innovation: Evidence from Xerox Corporation's technology spinoff companies." *Industrial and Corporate Change*, 11: 533-534.
- Ghezzi, A., Cortimiglia, M. N., & Frank, A. G. (2015). "Strategy and business model design in dynamic telecommunications industries: A study on Italian mobile network operators." *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 90, 346-354.
- Hu, J. L., Wan, H. T., & Zhu, H. (2011). "The business model of a shanzhai mobile phone firm in china." *Australian Journal of Business and Management Research*, 1(3), 52-62.
- Ide, M., Aoyama, M., Kishida, T., & Kikushima, Y. (2014). An IT-driven business model design methodology and its evaluation. In 2014 IEEE 1st International Workshop on the Interrelations between Requirements Engineering and Business Process Management ((pp. 1-10). IEEE.
- Ismagilova, L. A., Gileva, T. A., Galimova, M. P., & Glukhov, V. V. (2017). Digital business model and smart economy sectoral development trajectories substantiation. In *Internet of Things, Smart Spaces, and Next Generation Networks and Systems* (pp. 13-28).
- Joyce, A., & Paquin, R. L. (2016). The triple layered business model canvas: A tool to design more sustainable business models. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 135, 1474-1486.
- Kesting, P., & Günzel-Jensen, F. (2015). "SMEs and new ventures need business model sophistication." *Business Horizons*, 58(3), 285-293.
- León, M. C., Nieto-Hipólito, J. I., Garibaldi-Beltrán, J., Amaya-Parra, G., Luque-Morales, P., Magaña-Espinoza, P., & Aguilar-Velazco, J. (2016). Designing a model of a digital ecosystem for healthcare and wellness using the business model canvas. *Journal of medical systems*, 40(6), 143-151.
- Magretta, J. 2002. "Why business models matter." *Harvard Business Review*, 80(5): 86-92.

- Morris, M., Schindehutte, M., & Allen, J. (2005). "The entrepreneur's business model: toward a unified perspective." *Journal of business research*, 58(6), 726-735.
- Muhtaroglu, F. C. P., Demir, S., Obalı, M., & Girgin, C. (2013, October). Business model canvas perspective on big data applications. In 2013 IEEE International Conference on Big Data (pp. 32-37). IEEE.
- Osterwalder, A., & Pigneur, Y. (2010). *Business model generation: a handbook for visionaries, game changers, and challengers*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Park, J., Kim, S., & Nam, C. (2015). "Why has a Korean telecommunications technology failed: A case study on WiBro." *Telematics and Informatics*, 32(4), 603-612.
- Rao, B., & Parikh, M. A. (2003). "Wireless broadband drivers and their social implications." *Technology in Society*, 25(4), 477-489.
- Rong, K., Hu, G., Lin, Y., Shi, Y., & Guo, L. (2015). "Understanding business ecosystem using a 6C framework in Internet-of-Things-based sectors." *International Journal of Production Economics*, 159, 41-55.
- Saebi, T., & Foss, N. J. (2015). Business models for open innovation: Matching heterogeneous open innovation strategies with business model dimensions. *European Management Journal*, 33(3), 201-213
- Sia, S. K., Soh, C., & Weill, P. (2016). How DBS Bank Pursued a Digital Business Strategy. *MIS Quarterly Executive*, 15(2).
- Teece, D. J. (2010). Business models, business strategy and innovation. *Long range planning*, 43(2-3), 172-194.
- Walravens, N. (2015). "Qualitative indicators for smart city business models: The case of mobile services and applications." *Telecommunications Policy*, 39(3), 218-240.
- Weill, P., & Woerner, S. L. (2013). Optimizing your digital business model. *MIT Sloan Management Review*, 54(3), 71.
- Weill, P., & Woerner, S. L. (2015). Thriving in an increasingly digital ecosystem. *MIT Sloan Management Review*, 56(4), 27-35.
- Wirtz, B. W., Schilke, O., & Ullrich, S. (2010). Strategic development of business models: implications of the Web 2.0 for creating value on the internet. *Long range planning*, 43, 272-290.
- Wu, X., Chen, Q., & Guo, J. (2008, September). "Impact of M-Commerce on Business Models. In *Advanced Management of Information for Globalized Enterprises*," 2008. AMIGE 2008. IEEE Symposium on (pp. 1-3). IEEE.
- Yang, M., Evans, S., Vladimirova, D., & Rana, P. (2017). Value uncaptured perspective for sustainable business model innovation. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 140, 1794-1804.
- Zhang, Y., & Huang, L. (2015, June). China's e-commerce development path and mode innovation of agricultural product based on business model canvas method. In *The 14th Wuhan International Conference on E-Business—Innovation Management*

and IT Business Value (pp. 560-569).

Zott, C., Amit, R., & Massa, L. (2011). "The business model: recent developments and future research." *Journal of management*, 37(4), 1019-1042.

TÜRKİYE'DEKİ İNTERNET GİRİŞİMLERİNİN İŞ MODELLERİNİN İNCELENMESİ

1. GİRİŞ

İnternet şirketlerinin ilk ortaya çıkması ile birlikte iş modelleri konusunda önemli değişimler yaşanacağı anlaşılmaya başlanmıştır. İş modeli kavramı 1960'larda ortaya çıkmakla beraber 1990'ların ortasında internet şirketlerinin çoğalmasıyla yaygınlaşmıştır (Barneto ve Ouvrard, 2015: 4). İş modeli, girişimin nasıl çalıştığını açıklar. İyi bir iş modeli Peter Drucker'ın "Müşteri kimdir ve müşteri değeri nedir?" ve "Bu işten nasıl para kazanacağız?" sorularına cevap verebilmelidir (Magretta, 2002: 4).

İş modeli üzerine yapılan çalışmalar, çoğunlukla internet girişimleri üzerine yapılmıştır. Eski hizmetler internet üzerinden verilmeye başlandıkça işin yapılışı, hizmetten beklentiler, araçlar, çalışanların becerileri, maliyetler, müşteri kitlesi, müşterinin ödemeye hazır olduğu ücret gibi pek çok unsur değişmekte, bu yeni durumda işletmenin hayatta kalabilmesi ve rakipleri ile mücadele edebilmesi için yeni duruma uygun iş modeli geliştirebilmesi gerekmektedir.

Araştırma iki temel soru etrafında çerçevelenmiştir. "Türk internet girişimlerinin iş modelleri nedir? İş modelleri girişimlerin başarısını etkilemekte midir?" Araştırmanın amacı Türk internet girişimlerinin iş modellerinin belirlenerek onların başarı ve başarısızlıkları ile iş modellerinin ilişkisini tespit etmektir. Bu araştırma nitel bir çalışma olduğundan ve 5 farklı alanda faaliyet gösteren girişimi vaka analizi ile incelediğinden dolayı sonuçları tüm girişimlere genelleştirilemez. Ancak Türk girişimcilerinin iş modellerini uluslararası rakiplerine göre nasıl farklılaştırdıkları veya benzer kıldıklarını göstermesi açısından oldukça önemli çıkarımlar sağlayacaktır. Bu çıkarımlar hem internet girişimcileri hem de internet girişimleri üzerine çalışan araştırmacılar için ilham verici olacaktır.

1.1. Literatür Özeti

Girişimlerin odaklanabilecekleri iş modeli stratejileri 1) ürünün ek özelliklerini ortaya çıkarmak, 2) üçüncü kişiler için stratejik faydalar sağlamak, 3) çapraz satış olanaklarını kullanmak, 4) müşteriler ve kitlelerden faydalanmak (crowdsourcing) şeklinde sınıflandırılabilir (Kesting, Günzel-Jensen, 2015: 285).

İş modeli ile ilgili literatür incelendiğinde kablosuz geniş bantlar (Rao ve Parikh, 2003), 3G (Ballon, 2007), radyo frekansı ile tanımlama (RFID) (Park ve Park, 2007), mobil ticaret (Wu, Chen ve Guo, 2008), Çinli cep telefonu firması (Hu, Wan ve Zhu, 2011), İtalyan telekomünikasyon sektörü (Ghezzi, Cortimiglia ve Frank, 2015), Kore telekomünikasyon sektörü (Park, Kim ve Nam, 2015), nesnelerin interneti (Rong vd., 2015), akıllı şehirler (smart city) (Walravens, 2015) ile ilgili çalışmalar bulunmaktadır.

Bir iş modeli belirlenirken çok sayıda değişken göz önüne alınır. Bir sektörde önemli teknolojik yenilikler olurken elbette yenilik ve teknoloji yönetimi önemlidir ancak iş modeli göz ardı edildiğinde başarı garanti değildir (Zott, Amitt ve Massa 2011: 1032-33). Teknolojik yenilikler ortaya çıkarlarken iş modelleri nadiren değişmeden kalır. İş modeli tasarımı yenilikle ilişkilidir. Çoğu firma iş modelinin, potansiyelinin tamamını ortaya çıkarmada başarısız olduğunun farkında değildir (Kesting, Günzel-Jensen, 2015: 285) ve değişim karşısında işletmede pek çok şey değişirken iş modellerinin aynı kalacağı varsayılır. Fakat iş çevresindeki değişimler iş modelini revize etmeyi gerektirir, aksi takdirde başarısızlık ihtimali artar (Park, Kim ve Nam, 2015: 608).

2. YÖNTEM

Türk internet girişimlerinin iş modellerinin anlaşılması için 5 girişimin iş modeli vaka analizi yaklaşımı ile incelenmiştir. Araştırma kapsamında 5 girişimin kurucu ortakları ile görüşülmüştür. Görüşülecek girişimcilerin belirlenmesi için internet araştırması yapılmıştır ve doğru girişimleri seçmek için iş meleşği ağlarından ve teknokent yöneticilerinden yardım alınmıştır. Seçilecek girişimlerin alanında Türkiye'nin ilk girişimi olmasına veya pazarı henüz domine eden bir işletme yokken kurulmuş olmalarına dikkat edildi. Çünkü pazarı domine eden bir rakibin olmaması nasıl başarılı olunacağına yönelik açık bir klavuz olmadığı anlamına gelmektedir. Böylece girişimci iş modelini belirlerken daha fazla yaratıcılık şansı olacaktır. Örnekleme yöntemi amaçlı örnekleme yöntemidir. Görüşmeler internet üzerinden görüntülü görüşme şeklinde gerçekleştirilmiştir. Her görüşme 40-75 dakika sürmüştür.

Görüşmelerde yarı yapılandırılmış soru formları kullanılmıştır. Araştırma kapsamında Osterwalder & Pigneur (2010)'un geliştirdikleri 9 yapıtaşlı iş modeli esas alınmıştır. Yapılan görüşmeler katılımcılardan izin alınarak kayıt altına alınmıştır. Bu sayede görüşmeler tekrar tekrar dinlenmiş ve görüşme esnasında alınan notlarla birlikte vakalar oluşturulmuştur.

3. BULGULAR

Araştırma kapsamında beş Türk internet girişimcisinin iş modeli incelenmiştir. Düğün organizasyon platformu dış sermaye temin edebilen tek örnektir. Bu sebeple girişim yurt içerisinde dış sermaye temini olmaksızın birkaç yılda büyümesine rağmen sermaye bulduktan sonra yurt dışında aynı büyüklüğe sadece birkaç ayda ulaşabilmiştir. Bu girişim iş modelini tasarlarlarken yurtdışındaki rakiplerinin iş modellerini önemli değişiklikler yapmadan Türkiye'ye uyarlayabilmiştir.

Müşteri verilerini işleme hizmetini veren girişim işletmelerin sahip oldukları verileri anlık olarak işleyerek müşterilerine daha fazla değer üretmeyi amaçlamaktadır. İşletme iş kolundaki lider girişimlerin iş modellerini kullanabilmektedir. İş modelinde rakiplerinden anlamlı farklılıklar bulunmamasına rağmen rekabet verilerin işlenmesindeki etkinlik üzerinden devam etmektedir.

Anket sosyal medya platformu olan girişim dünya çapındaki sosyal medya platformlarının aynı iş modelini uygulayabilmek için direnmektedir. Daha büyük pazarlarda sponsorlu iletilerden elde edilecek getiriler girişim için yeterli geliri sağlayabilecekken, görece küçük olan Türkiye pazarı bu girişim için yeni gelirler bulmayı zorunlu hale getirmektedir.

Girişimci sosyal medya iddiasından vazgeçmemek için diğer gelir getirici faaliyetleri uygulamaya geçirmemektedir.

Yabancı dil eğitimi veren girişim ise neredeyse tüm rakipleri ücretli premium hesap satışı ve eğitim kurumları için kurumsal üyelik satışı yaparken ücretli hiçbir hizmet sunmamaktadır. Bu girişimin reklam gelirleri, işleri sürdürmek için yeterli olsa da hızlı büyümeyi destekleyecek ölçüde olmadığı söylenebilir.

Kitle fonlama girişimi ise henüz kendini tam olarak tanıtmadığı, özellikle teknolojik projelerin gerçekleştirilmesindeki katkısına proje sahiplerini ikna edemediği için girişimin kendine yetecek geliri dahi üretebilmesi mümkün görünmemektedir.

4. TARTIŞMA ve SONUÇ

Türk girişimleri ile ilgili inceleme sonucunda iş modellerini oluştururken olabildiğince düşük maliyetlerle çalışmak zorunda kaldıkları gözlenmiştir. Düşük maliyetlerle çalışmanın zorunlu olma gerekçesi Türkiye pazarının nispeten küçük bir pazar olması ve Türk müşterilerinin ücretli hizmetleri tercih etmemesidir. Ayrıca Türk girişimcilerinin sermaye bulma konusundaki zorlukları dolayısıyla az sermaye ile girişimi yönetmek zorunda kalmaktadırlar. Bu sebeple girişimler kendilerini tanıtmak ve yeni hizmetler geliştirmek konusunda bütçe kısıtları dolayısıyla yeterince hızlı büyüyememektedirler.

Türk internet girişimleri iş modelini belirlerken örnek alabildikleri lider bir rakipleri olduğunda, gelirlerini kurumsal müşterilerine sundukları hizmet karşılığında aldıklarında ve yaptıkları işin gerektirdiği ölçüğe gelebilmek için sermaye bulabildiklerinde başarı şansları artmaktadır. Gelir elde etmeleri tüketicilere veya ona erişmek isteyen işletmelere bağlı olduğunda yeterli geliri elde edememektedir. Az sermaye ile başlayıp yeterli ölçüğe gelmek için uzun süre geçmesini beklemek işletmeler açısından riskler oluşturmaktadır. Tüketicinin bilmediği ürünlerde veya değer önerisini tam anlayamadığı durumlarda işletmeler yeni müşteri kazanmak için ciddi pazarlama bütçesine ihtiyaç duymaktadırlar.

Leon vd., (2016) yaptıkları çalışmada iş modellerinin ülkeler arasında farklılık gösterdiğini bulmuşlardır. Benzer olarak Türk internet girişimlerinin yurtdışındaki girişimlerin iş modelleri ile farklılıklar mevcuttur. Türkiye daha küçük pazara sahiptir ve girişimciler iş meleklerine erişimde daha fazla zorluk çekmektedir. Ayrıca başarılı girişimler konusunda önlere daha az örnek bulunmaktadır. Girişimcilik ekosisteminin eksikleri dolayısıyla zaafiyetler oluşmaktadır. Ismailova vd. (2017; 26) Rusya'daki bulgularına benzer olarak Türk girişimleri kendi gelir modelleri ile mevcut koşullarda hızlı gelişim göstermeleri mümkün değildir. Bu durumda devlet teşvikleri onların büyümesinde etkili olabilecektir.

Bu araştırma elektronik girişimciler için mevcut iş modellerini anlamak ve kendilerine adapte etmek için önemli ipuçları vermektedir. Birbirinden farklı elektronik girişimler ele alınarak olabildiğince çeşitlilik hakkında bilgilendirme yapılmaya çalışılmıştır. Bundan sonraki çalışmalar internet girişimlerini sektörel olarak ayırarak iş modellerini inceleyebilirler. Ayrıca yeterli örnekleme erişim mümkün olması durumunda nicel çalışmalarla farklı iş modellerine sahip girişimlerin büyüme hızları, karlılıkları, sermaye bulmaları becerileri karşılaştırılabilir.

İş modeli hazırlayacak girişimcilerin aşağıdaki konulara dikkat etmeleri onların başarı

şanslarını artıracaktır. Değer önerisi müşteriler tarafından kolaylıkla anlaşılabilir ve benimsenebilir değilse ciddi pazarlama bütçeleri gerekli olacaktır. Bu pazarlama bütçesini ayırabilecekleri sermayelerinin olması gerekir. Son kullanıcıya Türkiye’de hizmet satmak zor. Bu durumda ona erişmek isteyen reklamveren veya satıcılardan elde edilecek gelir maliyetleri karşılayıp karşılamayacağını incelemek gerekir. Yapacağınız iş Türkiye’de ilk ise gelir modeliniz yabancı rakiplerinize benzemek durumundadır. Eğer yabancı rakiplerinizi yoksa gelir getirici faaliyetlerinizi çeşitlendirmeniz gerekir. Özellikle erken evrelerde yatırım bulamadığınız durumlarda işin devamı için nakit gelirler önemli olmaktadır. Yeterli sermayeye sahip değilseniz yatırımcıların hangi iş modellerine yatırım yapacağını bilmeniz önemli olacaktır.